



PLANNING BOARD

MINUTES (FINAL)

THURSDAY, JANUARY 28, 2016

7:00 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL ROOM

PRESENT: Mark Torpey, Chairman; Janet Casey; Howard Pinsley, Jamin Totino; Amy Durland (Alternate)

LATE ARRIVAL: Tom L. Lewis arrived at 8:23 P.M.

ABSENT: Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman; Clifford Van Wagner

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs
Tony Izzo, Deputy City Attorney, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Mark Torpey, Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:01 P.M.

SALUTE TO THE FLAG:

ANNOUNCEMENT OF RECORDING OF PROCEEDING:

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

ANNOUNCEMENT OF ADJOURNED PROJECTS:

ADJOURNED PENDING ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

14.064 UNION FOX APARTMENTS, 72 Union Avenue, Site plan review for multi-family residential in an Urban Residential-4 (UR-4) District.

14.010 SUBDIVISION OF LANDS OF HARRISON, 180 Meadowbrook Road, public hearing for a two-lot subdivision in the Rural Residential District.

15.050 BURNS SUBDIVISION, 34 Benedict Road.

COMMENTS FROM THE CHAIR:

Mark Torpey, Chairman introduced the newest appointed members to the Planning Board Jamin Totino, and alternate Amy Durland.

UPCOMING PLANNING BOARD MEETINGS/AGENDA WORKSHOPS:

Planning Board Caravan, Monday, February 8, 2016 at 4:00 P.M.

Planning Board Workshop, Monday, February 8, 2016 at 5:00 P.M.

Planning Board Meeting, Thursday, February 11, 2016 at 7:00 P.M.

PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR:

None heard.

DISCLOSURE:

Amy Durland stated she has reviewed the information concerning the two agenda items this evening and is fully informed and able to participate fully in these applications.

APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION:

1. **15.053 YMCA PROPOSED EXPANSION**, 290 West Avenue, Site plan review for a 17,000 square foot facility expansion in the YMCA Planned Unit Development (PUD) District.

SEORA:

Action appears to be unlisted.

BACKGROUND:

YMCA PUD was adopted June 21, 2005 and provides the area, bulk requirements and master plan for the entire campus. Areas are separated into two Zones A & B. Zone A consists of YMCA main facility. Zone B contemplates commercial buildings along West Avenue and additional areas outlined on PUD sketch plan. Zone B appears to have expired per the provision in PUD legislation.

DISCLOSURE:

Janet Casey disclosed that her husband is on the YMCA Board. He has no involvement in this project. No need for recusal, simply disclosure.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated at the workshop on Monday, the Board requested the applicants provide a presentation and look at this new addition and map an overlay on the initial proposal, so we could see the natural progression of the next phase. We spoke about, parking, traffic, noise, lighting, buffering and trees.

Applicant: YMCA – Shaun Andrews, CEO; Rick Schumacher, Project Manager; Kelly Armour, COO; Jason McGregor, Board of Directors President; John Pecor, CFO and Paige from the outdoor projects.

Agent: Mike Ingersoll, Bob Kernan, LA Group; Mark Nadolny, Creighton Manning

Mr. Andrews, CEO spoke regarding the outdoor summer camp proposed expanded facility. The YMCA is a community anchor for families and children.

Mr. Schumacher, Project Manager spoke concerning the outdoor summer camps expanded facility. 100 children were on a waiting list for summer camp last summer. So we did not serve the needs of the children in the community. We are proposing an outdoor pavilion a 94 x 84 foot pavilion with bathrooms. Also, we have a pool which is at capacity even during the year. We are proposing a zero entry pool not to interfere with the main pool. Also a group of 12-15 year olds who are displaced in the gym. We are proposing this to be completed in three phases. Phase I is the pavilion and a covered archery range. Phase II is the pool and Phase III is a multiuse gym and field house similar to what is at Wilton. With the pavilion and archery range we will have a low ropes and high ropes courses, zip lines and a half basketball court. The fields would be smaller fields for 5-12 year olds, baseball, softball, soccer and lacrosse. This will be irrigated with the building runoff and a cistern system. Porous parking as well as additional parking and site work to be completed. We have met with many of the neighbors and we understand their concerns. We intent to cut as few trees as possible. We hope to have a limited impact on the trees. We will install fencing along a portion of the property line, adding additional buffering. Only security lighting will be provided. No nighttime usage is proposed.

Mike Ingersoll provided a visual presentation to the Board. A PUD diagram provided as well as the site location, noting the 22 acres that comprises the PUD. The National Grid easement will remain green with porous pavement. We will extend parking in this area. Infrastructure needs to be set in place for other phases. The pavilion and archery shed have been approved. We would like to have this in place when school ends this summer. The utility plan diagram was provided, as well as the pedestrian linkage plan, and the internal sidewalks to the site. Access to the green belt trail was noted as well. The security system is still under review. Parking will be 8% over what is required. 478 spots will be provided. Mr. Ingersoll reviewed the hours of operation both inside and outside at the YMCA. Buffering along property lines.

Mark Nadolny, Creighton Manning. Mr. Nadolny stated they prepared the original traffic study in 2005 so they are familiar with area. A traffic impact study was performed on five intersections surrounding the YMCA. There are different conditions between school conditions and summer conditions. These trip counts were performed during August and again in September. Tubes were installed on the driveway. Pedestrians were counted as well as the transits. Total expected additional AM trips would be 160. Total expected PM trips would be 156. The level of service remains the same, with a slight delay increase. Mr. Nadolny stated the Level of Service from summer conditions PM peak hour drop from a C to a D as a result of the project. Also he reviewed the remarks from Chazen as well as the remarks from staff. They agreed with the summarizations of conditions during school and during the summer sessions. Sidewalk connections were questioned with the addition of an ADA ramp as part of the Zone B development. Also internal pedestrian connections should remain ADA compliant. No mitigation is proposed since the change is only a one to two second delay.

Board member Tom L. Lewis arrived at 8:23 P.M.

Kelly Armour, COO, YMCA stated after school programs also take place at the individual schools. The number of children in the current after school program is 114. This will remain at 114 therefore, not impacting added traffic at the site. The Wilton site can house additional students for their before and after school programs.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Dave Madden 11 Gilman Avenue. Our property is located behind the main YMCA building. We support the Y's philosophy and the need to expand. We understand the need for compromise and change. We have over the years adjusted to the changes made at the YMCA including the drone of the AC units on the building and the ambient lighting from the high intensity security lights, headlights from vehicles and the emptying of dumpsters. These are small issues compared to the noise generated by 300 children. We believe there is ample space to expand on the West Avenue side of the property, without adding an additional burden to the Gilman Avenue residents. Perhaps moving the fence line further away from the neighbors property line. Photographs provided. Concerns were voiced regarding security lighting, activity area, location of light, dumpster location, gate on Gilman Avenue and stormwater management system.

Adrienne Hovey, 12 Gilman Avenue. We are primarily concerned regarding the proposed ropes course which will take away the greenbelt area. The children get very close to my property and the noise is a concern. Privacy concerns are greater because the elevated ropes course will give them a site line right into my backyard. We have two young children. Questions concerning buffering, summertime traffic and fencing. We do have a well and septic system which is also a concern with regard to water runoff.

Justin Neeson, 6 Congress Avenue. We also like the YMCA. They do good things. I still am grappling with this to see how this is not impacting the character of the neighborhood. It was a quiet neighborhood. This has changed

with the YMCA expansion and now with the addition of 150 more children. This is a big issue. This needs a little more consideration.

John Campbell, 5 Gilman Avenue. WILL the ball fields be rented out. Perhaps a retractable basketball hoop would take care of after hour playing.

Mr. Schumaker rebutted placement of the proposed changes to the YMCA site. These activities are not held after daylight. No alcohol is allowed on the premises. The pavilion can be rented out for corporate functions. The fields are small and are for 5-12 year old youths.

Ed Evans 7 Gilman Avenue. How will the area be policed between 6 – 9 PM during the summer? when it stay light longer?

Jason McGregor, President, Board of Directors for the YMCA. We do want to be good neighbors as well. This is all about the kids. Kids make noise. This is a different type of noise. The mission statement is Youth Development, Healthy Living and Social Responsibility. The outdoor space during the day is held only Monday thru Friday during reasonable times. We do not operate on Saturdays and Sundays. It is only for a few months of the year. The camps start in July and end the week before school begins. This is very seasonal. Thank you to the neighbors, this is a great space and this would be a great thing for the residents of the City.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated we have received a lot of information. We are not prepared to vote on this application. We appreciate the neighbors coming out and sharing their thoughts. There are a couple of things which stand out and we need more information which would be helpful for the next meeting. We spoke about the shared parking in this the T-4 zone and how this may play out. We need to be thoughtful about the language. The general notion about security and how it will be dealt with and articulated more clearly. Amy brought up a good point concerning field restrictions and usage. Another issue is the connection from Gilman onto the field. How will it be delineated. Some minor issues are the location of the A/C units and the noise issues. Perhaps reorientation of the mechanicals. LED lighting issue. Buffering between the properties. Perhaps more details concerning the entire length as well as more underbrush for screening purposes at the lower level.

Janet Casey stated she would like more information on the ropes courses. I have not seen them in urban centers. How does this company envision an urban ropes course. Are there ways where urban ropes courses in other areas have been properly screened. There is a big questions mark around that ropes course, specifically regarding the neighbors. It would be helpful if the company had any other examples or comparables.

Jamin Totino stated he is familiar with ropes courses and in urban areas use poles versus trees. I would like to see more information concerning this specific activity. Most all ropes courses when closed down are broken down and ropes are arranged in such a way that a ladder is needed to access them.

Amy Durland stated she mentioned down facing lighting, perhaps angling the lighting so it is not so impactful on the neighbors would help. Also, some of the things mentioned seem very simple to resolve, such as hours trash is picked up, hours some of the activities occur can be addressed more with the neighbors in mind. Location of items such as the dumpster and the location of some of the lighting.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated consider a change to a CHP system, that could generate electricity on site, reduce some costs to national grid, use some of the heat from that system for dehumidization purposes at the lowest possible cost. At the same time it provides back up power from that facility. You would serve another beneficial purpose that the Y could serve.

Amy Durland reviewed the fence height which is 6 feet. The City does, however, provide for 8 foot fences in specific areas. This is worth pursuing.

Bruce McDonough, 8 Gilman Avenue. Concerning the lighting in the parking area adjacent to his home. The trees which are currently there and will be cut will give me a direct site line of the parking area.
 9:27 P.M. The Board recessed.
 9:36 P.M. The Board reconvened.

2. **14.057 RITE AIDE DEVELOPMENT**, 90 West Avenue and 242 Washington Street, Site Plan review For a 14,368 sq. ft. retail building with a drive-in establishment in the Transect-5 (T-5) District.

SEORA:

Action appears to be Unlisted, with Involved Agencies of ZBA, DRC and the Planning Board. The ZBA Initiated Coordinated Review on September 22, 2014. The Planning Board issues a Negative SEQRA Declaration on October 8, 2014.

BACKGROUND:

The following area variances were granted on January 15, 2015.

	REQUIRED	PROPOSED	TOTAL RELIEF REQUESTED
Build-to-line: West Avenue	0-12'	32'10"	20.83' (173.58%)
Frontage build-out: West Avenue	70%	52.23%	17.77% (25.39%)
Minimum two-story	Two-story	One-story	One-story (approximately 14,000 sq. ft.) in excess of 1,500 sq. ft.

Special Use Permit (permanent) for a retail and drive in facility issued March 25, 2015.
 DRC Architectural Review approval November 18, 2015.

Applicant: Rite Aid Corporation; David Reif – National Retail Properties

Agent: Jamie Easton, MJ Engineering

Mr. Easton provided a visual presentation of the project and the project site for the Board's review. Project history was provided. ZBA variances were obtained on February 3, 2015. The Planning Board issued a SEQRA Negative Declaration on October 8, 2014. A Special Use Permit was granted in March of 2015. The DRC reviewed the plans and final approval of the plans was granted with two entrances. Mr. Easton provided views of the locations of the loading dock, drive thru window, dumpster and ingress and egress was provided. A landscaping plan was reviewed and provided on plans. An easement has been obtained with Adirondack Tire. Lighting and photometric plan was reviewed with the Board. Wattages can be tweaked to lower settings. During construction a trailer will be dropped off as a temporary store and construction will take approximately 6 months. This being part of the approval. Mr. Easton provided a view of all elevations approved by the Design Review Commission as well as the two entrances, pedestrian access, parking and street frontage plans.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Board.

Jamin Totino questioned the 180 ft. span of the building along Washington Street. Why is the building so long?

Mr. Easton stated the typical size of a new Rite Aid is approximately 14,000 square feet.

Mr. Reif, stated most of the 180 feet of building is all real glass. You are able to see into the store through most of the windows. All of the transom windows and dormer windows are all real glass. The door is real glass as well. The entire center window is real glass and you can see right into the store. The DRC voiced concern regarding the windows and usage of real glass.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated this area of the city is being developed and worked on. Discussion ensued regarding parking on West Avenue. Excess parking could be removed by the front door, and conceal parking which is something which is required in the Transect zone. This parking can be moved to other parking spaces. Handicap parking is easily accessible closer to the doorway with a distance as short as possible.

Mr. Easton stated he will present this back to Rite Aid concerning moving the parking requested.

Discussion ensued concerning the placement of parking and handicap parking spaces, as well as providing some landscaping and screening in this area.

Amy Durland questioned if the 3 trees on site will be preserved and could they be marked on the plans. Also enhancement of the utility and appearance of the site. In addition to that street trees should be placed along Washington Street as well, perhaps in the planting strip.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the Board can suggest more trees, or more landscaping in this area. Perhaps it can mitigate the length of the building with more trees adding verticality. Street lighting and street trees are required.

Jamin Totino stated he is still concerned regarding the length of the building. I am not ready to vote on this tonight. I would like to give it more thought. This is a crucial area and is under a lot of redevelopment. We have to handle this as delicately as we can.

Mark Torpey, Chairman, stated the city has a tree program which is being promoted. Large species trees are being used as well. We have received correspondence regarding a sufficient tree belt along West Avenue. There are specific recommendations which come as a part of the Urban Forestry Master Plan. Correspondence has been received from Tom Denny. A copy of the correspondence was provided to the applicant.

Amy Durland stated concerning civic space, she does like the entranceway on the corner where the two streets converge. What can be done to emphasize this area as the main pedestrian entranceway. A quality streetscape with pedestrian amenities and civic space is a requirement of the T zones. A complete streets checklist was not received.

Jamin Totino requested an additional view from the front driveway.

Mark Torpey, Chairman reviewed the items which were requested from the applicant.

- Washington Street, street trees and street lights.
- West Avenue, street trees and street lights, preserving the Maple Trees.
- Buffer from the parking lot.
- Removal 4-6 spaces per the recommendation of Planning Board.
- Civic space bench, public art.
- Complete streets checklist.
- Transformer southern portion of the property, look to screen from neighbors, as well as noise buffering for the neighbors.
- Island location with the setback to be landscaped.
- Bioretention area? SWPPP – Chazen.
- Photometric plan.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated you have some homework to do. Thank you for the presentation.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Approval of meeting minutes was deferred to the February 11, 2016 meeting.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Mark Torpey, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 10:45 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 3/10/16