



PLANNING BOARD

MINUTES (FINAL)

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 2016

7:00 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL ROOM

PRESENT: Mark Torpey, Chairman; Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman; Clifford Van Wagner; Janet Casey; Jamin Totino; Tom L. Lewis;

LATE ARRIVAL: Amy Durland, alternate – arrived at 7:25 P.M.

ABSENT: Howard Pinsley

STAFF: Kate Maynard, Principal Planner, City of Saratoga Springs
Tina Carton, Parks, Open Space, Historic Preservation and Sustainability Co-Coordinator

CALL TO ORDER: Mark Torpey, Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:03 P.M.

SALUTE TO THE FLAG:

ANNOUNCEMENT OF RECORDING OF PROCEEDING:

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

ANNOUNCEMENT OF ADJOURNED PROJECTS:

ADJOURNED PENDING ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

14.064 UNION FOX APARTMENTS, 72 Union Avenue, Site plan review for multi-family residential in an Urban Residential-4 (UR-4) District.

14.010 SUBDIVISION OF LANDS OF HARRISON, 180 Meadowbrook Road, public hearing for a two-lot subdivision in the Rural Residential District.

15.050 BURNS SUBDIVISION, 34 Benedict Road.

14.057 RITE AID DEVELOPMENT, 90 West Avenue and 243 Washington Street, site plan review for a 14,368 sq. ft. retail building with a drive-in establishment in the Transect-5 (T-5) District.

15.044 TRIFECTA SUBDIVISION, 136 Lincoln Avenue, subdivision review for a two-lot residential-subdivision in the Urban Residential 2 (UR-2) District.

COMMENTS FROM THE CHAIR:

Mark Torpey, Chairman introduced the City of Saratoga Springs Sustainability Coordinator, Tina Carton. We are very happy to have her here in the City so we can tap into her area of expertise. It will be a great benefit to the Board. She comes to the City with a long list of accomplishments. It is a pleasure to have her here.

Kate Maynard, Principal Planner stated Tina joined the staff three weeks ago. It has been a very busy introduction to City business. Her official title is Parks Open Space, Historic Preservation, and Sustainability Coordinator. She has many areas of expertise which we want to make the Planning Board aware of but also she is well equipped and very familiar with working with private sector clients.

Tina Carton, spoke regarding her new position. She is very excited and noted that she can be used as a technical support for both applicants and the Land Use Boards.

UPCOMING PLANNING BOARD MEETINGS/AGENDA WORKSHOPS:

Planning Board Caravan, Monday, February 22, 2016 at 4:00 P.M.
Planning Board Workshop, Monday, February 22, 2016 at 5:00 P.M.
Planning Board Meeting, Thursday, February 25, 2016 at 7:00 P.M.

PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR:

None heard.

APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION:

1. **15.053 YMCA PROPOSED EXPANSION**, 290 West Avenue, Site plan review for a 17,000 square foot facility expansion in the YMCA Planned Unit Development (PUD) District.

SEQRA:

Action appears to be unlisted.

BACKGROUND:

YMCA PUD was adopted June 21, 2005 and provides the area, bulk requirements and master plan for the entire campus. Areas are separated into two Zones A & B. Zone A consists of YMCA main facility. Zone B contemplates commercial buildings along West Avenue and additional areas outlined on PUD sketch plan. Zone B appears to have expired per the provision in PUD legislation.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated the applicant appeared at the previous Planning Board Meeting on January 28, 2016. We did have some questions which were presented to the applicant and we have received an updated drawing as well as more formal responses to the many questions which were raised. We have an analysis which provided some level of discussion on the activity distribution for this project. We will have the applicant walk through each question and response.

Applicant: YMCA – Sean Andrews, CEO; Rick Schumacher, Project Manager; Kelly Armer, COO;
Jason McGregor, Board of Directors President; John Pecora, CFO;
Paige Minear, School Age Program Director

Agent: Mike Ingersoll, Bob Kernan, LA Group

Mr. Ingersoll provided a visual presentation of the site, as well as the bike trail which is owned and maintained by the City of Saratoga Springs. The PUD was approved in 2006. The next expansion was pre-programmed at that time. A review of the original submission view was provided. We have made some modifications to that plan. A review of parking which will accommodate all the parking needs. Underground storm water retention systems were reviewed

as well as the installation of a cistern from the stormwater system for irrigation. View of the location of the new pavilion. The ball fields were reviewed as well as their location. The modified ropes course has been moved. Handicap access pool to be installed. A small gymnasium will be added to accommodate different groups. We will have an archery range, a zip line and ½ court basketball courts. The Board has information on how the children will be dispersed throughout the day.

Mr. Ingersoll stated he will review each item of concern.

1. Security plan – cameras. We are considering cameras and we are investigating the implementation of this outdoors. Security staff will patrol outside area in the evenings.
2. Athletics fields and usage and rules for this area. Hours of operation and what is permitted will be posted.
3. The gate on Gilman Street will have a lock on it as well as signage indicating no unauthorized entrance. Storm lines are located here, and this is specifically for that access.
4. One of the criteria which will be included in the specifications for the vendors will state any mechanical equipment on the roof will be screened and buffered to decrease noise.
5. Vegetative Buffer zone – 30 feet.
6. Ropes course will be modified, proximate location to neighbors. Information is forthcoming.
7. Basketball courts rules and time of usage will be posted.
8. Proposed fence height along the north property line.
9. Current wall pack lights will be removed and down facing LED lights will be installed.
10. Moved the location of the dumpster as well as noting the enclosure.
11. Increase in attendance from 150 to 300 children.
12. Zone B – PUD expansion.
13. Concept of shared parking.
14. Phase II construction – dehumidifier system that generates energy or other energy saving means.
15. Railroad Run Crossing. Crosswalk concerns.

Mr. Ingersoll stated they are committed to a fence line. Trees will be added in this area. There is a 30 foot no cut zone. We will plot out and discuss with neighbors. 6 foot high proposed fence as well.

7:25 P.M. Amy Durland arrived.

High Ropes course was swapped with the archery area. The zip line area will have fencing around it, and it will be a post system. Mesh enclosure for the archery area. Basketball court will have a retractable net, rules and regulations will be posted. We have shortened the drive length and moved the dumpster and enclosure to the back of the building. Underbrush and vegetation will be maintained.

Paige Minear, Registrar, Co-Director Summer Program. Ms. Minear provided information and slide show of how the groups gathering, proceeding and rotating through the different stations of the camp. The largest gathering takes place for an hour in the AM and then for an hour at the end of the day. Each unit is a group of 20 students with the exception of the pool rotation when 80 students are allowed at one time. 80 students also will have lunch at one time in the pavilion. Extended care hours are until 6:00 P.M.

John Pecora, CFO – provided a briefing of the energy system. We have looked at many solar initiatives including solar integration. Solar system placement somewhere within the load zone which will provide 50-70% of all the energy the YMCA uses. This will help lower significantly the monies spent on electrical energy. We have been looking at sustainability.

Mr. Ingersoll stated Munter Enterprises will be building the building. A photograph of the proposed new pavilion was provided. Also the crossing and New Street was discussed. It may need to be

restriped. The Railroad Run and New Street crossing does not line up, and requires a jog for the pedestrians/bicyclists to cross street. The cross walk currently exists. It is at an angle.

Kate Maynard, Principal Planner stated the Board requested additional information from Commissioner Mathiesen and Mark Benaquista. The Commissioner expressed concerns regarding what Mike just spoke about. Congress and West Avenue crossing and New Street. We are seeing a lot of connectivity, especially Railroad Run since it now connects to the State Park. This is the City's intent. Commissioner Mathiesen would like the Board to be aware he is concerned about this area and the New Street crossing. We spoke about the current installation and crossing is subpar, especially with the increase in traffic and it being more utilized. If this is an issue that worsens or needs rectification, complete streets is currently meeting and perhaps this is an issued perhaps can be identified in the citywide plan as a priority. Also, I spoke with the city's arborist concerning the status of the large white oak at this location. His assessment is that it is a very healthy tree. The white pines which surround it can be removed from the site for site visibility improvements.

Clifford Van Wagner stated he did review this crosswalk again. He does not feel it is not the YMCA's responsibility to rectify this crosswalk. It should be the city's responsibility, since the YMCA is a not for profit.

Jamin Totino agreed with Cliff concerning the crosswalk.

Janet Casey stated visibility is not an issue. Leave the tree. City's issue to change the crosswalk.

Mark Torpey, Chairman reviewed the rules and regulations which will be posted for usage of the fields.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Board.

None heard.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Justin Mason, 6 Congress Avenue. Questioned the amount of parking. Perhaps more than the YMCA might need. The biggest concern is the impact on the neighborhood. Keep as much green space as possible. Fitting 150 more children to this seems a lot.

Mark Torpey, Chairman provided the requirement for parking in this area.

Discussion ensued regarding reviewing the regulations and guidelines. The YMCA exceeds the parking by 8% or 36 spaces. Parking under the power lines will be porous pavement.

Jamin Totino stated he is pleased with the changes.

Bruce McDonough, 8 Gilman Avenue. Discussed the placement of the trees and the placement of the diamond.

Debra Madden, 11 Gilman Avenue. Questioned the dehumidifiers and sound attenuation.

Discussion ensued notifying the neighbors all mechanicals and equipment will be buffered and screened.

Amy Durland questioned the hours of operation for the YMCA. Clarification was requested regarding dawn to dusk hours as well as security personnel.

Sean Andrews, CEO. The hours of operation will be 7AM – 6PM during the summer. Memorial Day into the summer from 7AM to 6PM, the YMCA outdoor areas will be open to members.

Security will be patrolling the areas 7AM – 9PM. In addition, surveillance will be maintained with security cameras.

Mark Torpey, Chairman reviewed the conditions for site plan approval:

1. 30 foot no cut buffer, northern end of the property, forever wild area behind the archery field will be preserved with the large trees as noted and no disturbance of underbrush.
2. 9 new large trees will be added, species to be determined.
3. 6 foot high fence to be relocated to higher property line to the north and continued in an easterly direction to connect to the existing fence. This will match what currently exists.
4. Switching the archery and ropes courses. Netting to be installed behind the archery area.
5. Six foot fencing surrounding the entire ropes course.
6. Retractable basketball backboards.
7. LED lower wattage lighting to replace existing sodium lights for security purposes.
8. Additional surveillance cameras to be used for remote access.
9. Security Manager on duty 7days a week 7AM – 9 PM, monitoring the area.

10. Only YMCA members have access to usage of the outdoor facility until dusk.
11. Gate on Gilman Street “No Unauthorized Access” signage to be posted.
12. Hours of operation outdoors 7AM – 6PM.
13. Language for shared parking.
14. HVAC issue for sound attenuation, visual buffering.
15. Cross walk on New Street, with stripping.
16. Parking requirement currently 8% overage. No waiver necessary.
17. Camp programs to be in session for 9 weeks.
18. Relocation of the dumpster with enclosures.
19. Cistern placed and used for irrigation.

SEQRA:

The Board reviewed Part II of the short EAF. No large or important areas of concern were noted.

SEQR DECISION:

Clifford Van Wagner stated that based upon the information provided by the applicant in Part I of the SEQR Full Environmental Assessment Form, and analysis of the information provided and presented in Part II of the SEQR Full Environmental Assessment Form, the project will not result in any large and important impacts and, therefore, is one that will not have a significant adverse impact on the environment. Based on this, I move to make a SEQR negative declaration for this action.

Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion.

None heard.

VOTE:

Clifford Van Wagner, in favor; Jamin Totino, in favor; Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman, in favor;
Amy Durland, in favor; Tom L. Lewis, in favor; Mark Torpey, Chairman, in favor; Janet Casey, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated we will now move on to Site Plan. We have reviewed all the items to be included in the Site Plan Approval.

Jamin Totino made a motion in the matter of the approval of the Site Plan YMCA proposed expansion, 290 West Avenue, be approved with the conditions as set forth by the Chairman.

Clifford Van Wagner seconded the motion.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion.

None heard.

VOTE:

Clifford Van Wagner, in favor; Jamin Totino, in favor; Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman, in favor;
Amy Durland, in favor; Tom L. Lewis, in favor; Mark Torpey, Chairman, in favor; Janet Casey, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

8:51 P.M. The Board recessed.

8:57 P.M. The Board reconvened.

- 2. 16003.1 BENTON SUBDIVISION ADVISORY OPINION ZBA, 58 FIFTH AVENUE, Advisory opinion to ZBA on a two-lot residential subdivision in the Urban Residential-1 (UR-1) District.

BACKGROUND:

Area variances are requested from the Zoning Board of Appeals to provide for a two-lot residential subdivision; relief required from the minimum average lot width and minimum lot area for each lot in the Urban Residential-1 District.

Per 8.4.6 Planning Board advisory opinion is required followed by subdivision review. Proposed lot #2 would be improved with a single-family residence. Existing single-family residence would require an area variance from the minimum total side yard setback and maximum principal building coverage.

SEORA:

Action appears to be Unlisted Action. Applicant has submitted a short EAF as required.

The following variances were requested from the Zoning Board of Appeals.

	REQUIRED	PROPOSED	TOTAL RELIEF REQUESTED
Minimum average lot width: Lot 1	100 feet	90.8 feet	9.2 feet (9%)
Minimum total side yard setback: Lot 1	12,500 sq. ft	9,149 sq. ft.	3,351 sq. ft. (27%)
Minimum average lot width: Lot 2	100 feet	75.7 feet	24.3 feet (24%)
Minimum total side yard setback: Existing house on proposed lot 1	30 feet	13.6 feet	16.4 feet (55%)
Maximum principal building coverage: Existing house on proposed lot 1	20%	28.6%	8.6% (43%)

Applicant: Benton Family Trust

Agent: Michael Toohey, attorney

Mr. Toohey stated this is before the Planning Board for an Advisory Opinion. It is directed to you to give an opinion on whether the utilization of the space available for a single family home is consistent with the zoning and consistent with the neighborhood with which it is constructed. Mr. Toohey provided some history of the Benton family and their property holdings. The lots having been owned and used in common since 1950 and have been consolidated on one deed identified as parcels I and II. Although historically two separate lots they have one tax parcel number and are considered one lot. The application indicates that the proposed lots would be comparable with existing lots in the neighborhood. The existing lot is conforming at approximately 160 feet wide and 16,650 square feet. This request would create two substandard lots. All areas of relief could be considered substantial to provide for the creation of two substandard lots. The variances for the existing house on its new lot could be considered substantial. The existing house would no longer comply with the minimum total side yard setback.

Discussion ensued among the Board concerning zoning.

Amy Durland questioned if the applicant would straighten out the property line which exists between the two lots it would be a more orderly configuration and the lots would be almost the same size.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated the new Comprehensive Plan for this area the designation is RN-2 based on the 2015 Comp Plan. 7 units per acre is what is identified as the upper bound, typically this is what it represents. Basically looking at lot 2 you are penning out with one unit basically to 5.9 units per acre and you are falling within the maximum density specified in the new Comprehensive Plan for the area.

Kate Maynard, Principal Planner stated we have seen a lot of these requests and general themes in the development world. Infill development is continuing. You are look at a historic pattern which has been well presented, in terms of parcels located around this area. Other considerations are moving forward with the zoning districts. Typically represents where the area is located now and the desire of the City moving forward. It is important to note there is no requirement or vested right that an additional parcel could exist here. Each one is site specific. Discussion of the existing pattern aside the amounts that you are seeing are higher than you have seen on some past applications. You are looking at the creation of two substandard lots that are requiring variances to be able to exist.

Tom L. Lewis made a motion for a positive Advisory Opinion on the Benton Subdivision, 58 Fifth Avenue, to the Zoning Board of Appeals.

Clifford Van Wagner seconded the motion.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated he is inclined to agree with Amy Durland's recommendation concerning the lot line adjustment. This works to the advantage of providing a better lot to work with for practicality.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion.

None heard.

VOTE:

Clifford Van Wagner, in favor; Jamin Totino, in favor; Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman, in favor;
Amy Durland, in favor; Tom L. Lewis, in favor; Mark Torpey, Chairman, in favor; Janet Casey, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Approval of meeting minutes was deferred to the February 25, 2016 meeting.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Mark Torpey, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:35 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 3/10/16