



PLANNING BOARD

MINUTES (FINAL)

THURSDAY, JULY 28, 2016

7:00 P. M.

CITY COUNCIL ROOM

PRESENT: Mark Torpey, Chairman; Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman; Clifford Van Wagner;
Tom L. Lewis; Howard Pinsley; Janet Casey; Jamin Totino

STAFF: Kate Maynard, Principal Planner, City of Saratoga Springs
Justin Grassi, Counsel to the Land Use Board-arrived at 7:45 P.M.

CALL TO ORDER: Mark Torpey, Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

SALUTE TO THE FLAG:

ANNOUNCEMENT OF RECORDING OF PROCEEDING:

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

ANNOUNCEMENT OF ADJOURNED PROJECTS:

ADJOURNED PENDING ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

15.049 LANDS OF STONE, 68 Weibel Avenue, sketch plan review of office, retail, and multi-family residential in the Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood (T-4) District.

16.025 MENDENHALL SUBDIVISION, 101 Old Schuylerville Road, 4 lot preliminary conservation subdivision within the Rural Residential (RR) District.

16.026 ALLERDICE GLASS & ALUMINUM, 120 Excelsior Avenue, Special Use Permit for manufacturing, retail, office and recreational facility within the Transect-5 (T-5) District.

COMMENTS FROM THE CHAIR:

UPCOMING PLANNING BOARD MEETINGS/AGENDA WORKSHOPS:

Planning Board Caravan, Tuesday, September 6, 2016 at 4:00 P.M.
Planning Board Workshop, Tuesday, September 6, 2016 at 5:00 P.M.
Planning Board Meeting, Thursday, September 8, 2016 at 7:00 P.M.

PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR:

None heard

APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION:

1. **15.041 77 EXCELSIOR MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT**, Excelsior Avenue, site plan review for mixed-use development with 90 multi-family residential units and 1,440 sq ft of commercial space in the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center (T-5) District.

BACKGROUND:

Project last appeared before the Board on November 12, 2015. Applicant was to seek DRC input on project and site plan and return once secured. Project was dormant for some time, and then appeared before the DRC. Due to continuing conversations related to the buildings and site layout, a joint meeting was scheduled for both boards to be able to discuss the application in concert and provide any additional direction to the applicant.

Project requires Special Use Permit (issued by the Planning Board on July 8, 2015, site plan review and DRC Architectural Review.

SEQRA:

SEQRA negative declaration issued by the Planning Board on July 8, 2015.

Applicant: Beechwood Prime, Todd Curley

Agent: Dave Carr, Caitlin Corey, Project Landscape Architect; Doug Heller, Project Engineer; LA Group;
Mike Tuck, Balzer & Tuck Architecture

Mr. Carr stated this process began in January 2015. We have received Mass and Scale on all 3 buildings. We are here this evening seeking final site plan approval. Mr. Carr reviewed the site noting buildings 4, 5, and 6. Mr. Carr responded to comments received on Monday. A visual presentation of the site was provided noting the area to be enhanced between the Fresh Market site and Buildings 5 and 6, improving circulation around the building, as well as the pedestrian connection. Mr. Carr discussed the additional tree buffering and improvements along Excelsior Avenue with the addition of several more deciduous and coniferous trees to help soften the perspective of the new 50 foot building being constructed.

Discussion ensued concerning the cross easement on the west side of the property to provide connectivity of the site.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Board.

None heard.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

None heard.

Discussion ensued concerning the changes which were made to the site.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Board.

None heard.

Mark Torpey, Chairman reviewed the conditions for site plan approval. Ramp to provide safer access from Building 6 to Building 5. All curbed sidewalks to provide a safe connection. The Mill to repair and restriping of Excelsior Avenue to comport and be consistent with the Cross Sectional Plan. Striping the landing area adding a pad on each side to beef up the cross section visually. Some level of signage to ensure pedestrian crossing safety. Proper landscaping of the transformer at the west end as well as the switch gear to the east of the property. Live work units to remain commercial. East west pedestrian connection with the addition of the cross walk signal. Positioning of the venting penetrations to the satisfaction of the City Engineer. Trash collection and removal to be interior trash rooms with roll out service. Easement as shown on the plans.

Clifford Van Wagner made a motion in the matter of 77 Excelsior Mixed Use Development, Excelsior Avenue, that the application be approved with the conditions as noted by the Chair.

Jamin Totino seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Clifford Van Wagner, in favor; Jamin Totino, in favor; Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman, in favor; Howard Pinsley, in favor; Tom L. Lewis, in favor; Mark Torpey, Chairman, in favor; Janet Casey, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

2. 16.027 WEST AVENUE APARTMENTS, 246 West Avenue, Special Use Permit for construction of 16 multi-family residential units within the Transect-4 (T-4) District.

3. 16.028 WEST AVENUE APARTMENTS, 246 West Avenue, site plan for construction of 16 multi-family residential units within the Transect-4 (T-4) District.

SEQRA:

SEQRA negative declaration issued on May 22, 2008 was reaffirmed for proposed project on December 7, 2011, then on January 22, 2014.

BACKGROUND:

Special use permit for a total of 16 multi-family residential units was approved by the Planning Board on December 7, 2011. Approval is valid for 18 months, approved by the Planning Board on December 7, 2011. Approval is valid for 18 months. Applicant did not request an extension prior to the expiration of the site plan approval. Project approved on January 22, 2014. Applicant allowed the approval to lapse again. Potential developer of project has changed- formerly Pike Construction/Mike Dickinson still the current owner. Project currently proposed reduction to a single structure, but retaining proposed 16 units.

NOTIFICATIONS/APPROVALS/CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

Saratoga County Planning Board referral stated "No significant countywide or intercommunity impact", dated June 22, 2016.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated these two applications, for Special Use Permit and Site Plan Review are for the site at 246 West Avenue, which is approximately .57 acres. 16 residential units are proposed. The project has been before the Board previously for both Special Use Permit and Site Plan Review which have lapsed twice before. A single building is now proposed versus 2 buildings previously reviewed. No commercial portion provided as part of this project.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Mark Torpey, Chairman opened the public hearing at 7:45 P.M.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated comments will be heard from the public following the applicants presentation.

Applicant: John-Paul Builders, LLC

Agent: John Lapper, Attorney; Matthew Brobston, LA Group

Mr. Lapper stated this project is a better project regarding approvals since it is somewhat smaller concerning the site.

We are here to request approvals.

Mr. Brobston stated this is a .51 acre parcel in a T-4 zone. One building there previously was removed. Existing condition now is fencing along the rear property line along with the tall pines. Some of the trees are spotty in some locations. Buffering along the property line will be discussed further in the presentation. We have met with the property owner on the abutting site and discussed maximizing the buffer. A visual presentation was provided by Mr. Brobston. Civic space will be provided. Interpretative signage will be provided along with bike racks. The biggest change is one large building versus two buildings and increased parking and outside dumpster, which is appropriately screened. The new proposal has changed the 14 unit condos to 16 apartments with one bedroom and bath. 17 parking spaces within the first floor of the garage. Those spaces will be allotted to the apartments. There is a handicap parking space in the parking garage as well. 7 exterior parking spaces will be available for guests. We will be extending the 12" water main and adding hydrants and connecting the existing houses leaving a stub for the future Pitney Farms project. Sanitary is a direct connection to the County line. We have re-applied for a permit. Stormwater infiltration on the site. A review of exterior elevations was provided. This project has not yet appeared before the DRC pending Special Use Permit and Site Plan Approval.

Kate Maynard, Principal Planner stated as the Board knows this project has been approved twice. There have been more than one architect for the project as applicants and plans have changed. Height of the building is 40 ft which is the maximum T-4 requirements. This project has changed quite a bit. Architectural styles have changed. Since the applicant is requesting Special Use and Site Plan, be sure that you are keyed into this proposal, while many of the items have remained the same; the structure has changed quite a bit from where it first started architecturally, and through the loss of the carriage house like building which served as a transition from the principal structure to the existing single family residences and single story motel adjacent. In addition, Pitney Community Farm is proposed directly across the street which would preserve much of the farm acreage and increase agricultural related activities at the site. This is a noted development from when the project was previously reviewed and approved.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated this project is located in a CMU District, Community Mixed Use and is adjacent to the CRN District, Core Residential Neighborhood. From the density perspective the CRN Designation right next to this project allows for 10 units per acre. This project represents 28 units per acre, and I raise that to the Board to see if there are any contextual issues relative to that and the adjacent area. There are a lot of projects happening in that area which are changing things in that area.

Discussion ensued concerning the height of the building along with the proposed changes made to the project.

Clifford Van Wagner stated the Planning Board has benefitted from having a Joint Board Meeting to discuss this project in a sketch plan scenario.

Kate Maynard, Principal Planner informed the Board there are 2 additional projects along with this project which could benefit from a Joint Board Meeting possibly in September.

Mark Torpey, Chairman provided some direction to the applicant. Perspective drawings would be helpful. Discussion with neighbors concerning buffering. A greater obscuring of parking with some screening from pedestrian visibility. The Railroad Run goes right by this property, and future connection in this area. Review of traffic signaling at the intersection of Congress and West Avenue concerning consideration on how we can accommodate this as well.

Janet Casey requested views of what the other project looked like before and how that has changed with the new project.

Mark Torpey, Chairman, also this provides an opportunity to speak to the neighbors in the area would be helpful.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

None heard.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated the public hearing will remain open.

4. **16.023 SARATOGA FAIRFIELD INN AND SUITES**, 176 Broadway, Proposed special use permit for 89 room hotel use in a Transect-5 (T-5) Neighborhood Center District.

5. **16.024 SARATOGA FAIRFIELD INN AND SUITES**, 176 Broadway, Final site plan review for hotel use in a Transect-5 (T-5) Neighborhood Center District.

SEQRA:

Action appears to be an Unlisted action with Planning Board and DRC as involved agencies. Lead agency status to be determined along with possible coordinated review with the DRC.

BACKGROUND:

Site currently consists of the existing Turf and Spa Hotel with parcels fronting on South Broadway and Lincoln Avenue. Action proposed demolition of existing structure, construction of proposed 5 story, 89 room hotel and related parking. Area is adjacent to mobile homes residential area, strip mall and recently redeveloped Thirsty Owl and Green Nurture Spa (former Enterprise Building). South Broadway corridor has much City and community interest and effort to continue to spur redevelopment along the southern gateway into the community and which consists of Spa State Park, Museum of Dance, existing hotels and inns and commercial uses.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated the applicant is before the Planning Board this evening for Special Use Permit as well as Site Plan Review. The Board spoke at the workshop and noted that this is an incredibly complex project which encompasses 3 different parcels. It is in a prominent gateway to the City. What our intent is this evening is to seek Lead Agency Status for SEQRA, and review the environmental issues associated with the project. No further action will be taken this evening. What we would like is to have the applicant provide an overview of the project. This will require additional time to progress. This project currently has 43 rooms on site. The new project entails 80-89 rooms 5 stories in height.

Applicant: Saratoga Springs Hotel Associates, LLC

Agent: Brian Bouchard, CHA Consulting, Project Engineer; Mark Mussachio, Project Architect

Mr. Bouchard stated this is the first presentation before this Board. We have been working for the better part of 6-8 months and we have engaged the Planning staff to make sure this project fits within the context of your zoning classification of the area. Our goal this evening is to review the site layout. Mr. Wales has requested some technical information from us concerning the storm water management. We would be open to see if you are comfortable with the layout and the concept of the project so over the next several weeks we can continue to move forward with some of those technical aspects, and also to move forward with the SEQRA process. Mr. Bouchard provided the Board with a visual presentation of the site. Currently the site houses 43 rooms, it is two stories high with approximately 50 parking spaces. This project entails 3 parcels, approximately 1.4 acres in the T-5 Neighborhood Center District, which requires a Special Use Permit for any use. Also the site plan review based on the scale and scope of the project. This project is also in the Architectural Review Overlay District, which entails submission before the DRC. The entire street front of the building is on Broadway. We plan on enhancing the street scape, since the new building is narrow and taller than what currently exists. Proposing 93 parking spaces which is appropriate for the room count. Proposed access for site is from existing Todd Street off of South Broadway and from shared access off of

Lincoln Avenue. We are establishing a bike share station at site, and are working with the CDTA to have a trolley stop at the hotel. Additional screening along Todd Street is proposed as well.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Mark Torpey, Chairman opened the public hearing at 8:26 P.M.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Bob Israel, owner Inn at Saratoga, as well as other properties in the City. I have been a developer for many years as well as a past Board Member of the Planning Board. Broadway is narrow at this point. Traffic backs up at the light past this hotel currently. Difficult space. We currently have an oversupply of hotel rooms.

Alice Grant, Greenwich Place. I am thrilled that Saratoga is growing, however, the quaintness of the City is disappearing and it is becoming homogenized.

Bethany Gold, 13 Greenwich Place, **Melissa Jabour**, 13 Greenwich Place. This is a very quiet community. We are very concerned regarding privacy and the Alleyway. The vegetative buffer has been there for 16 years and does screen out a lot. This new neighbor might improve clientele. It has been frustrating. We have privacy concerns.

Shelly Stracka, 11 Greenwich Place. Concern regarding traffic. Loss of the large trees, are a concern. We are concerned about our privacy and opening up the alley. Greenwich Place is a quiet and peaceful street.

Kurt Nichols, resident Saratoga Springs. Concern regarding the alley and the tree buffering.

Richard Meechack, owner, St. Charles & St. Francis Motels. Concerned regarding traffic on Lincoln. No more traffic in this area it is currently very extensive. Gridlocked at times. Hesitate for additional traffic.

Carl Mihalik, owner Springs Motel. Alarmed at the size of the project. We do not need more hotels. Concern regarding parking.

Bob Israel, owner Inn at Saratoga questioned if commercial is proposed on the ground floor. We do not have pedestrian traffic on this portion of Broadway. It would be nice to encourage more pedestrian traffic in this area.

Mark Torpey, Chairman questioned if the applicant would provide a traffic impact study.

Mr. Bouchard stated the applicant can provide a traffic impact study, however this use is a less impactful use than what could be there.

Clifford Van Wagner, stated this Board must be very cautious regarding the number of hotel rooms. We cannot be the judge of this. Development in this area will set the barometer for the entire area. This project needs to maintain the level of integrity which we have begun to see in this area. The challenge is out there.

Jamin Totino stated he is concerned how this reacts with neighbors and the community is very important. Concern regarding the streetscape as well. Also, I agree this area begs for commercial on the 1st floor is something he would like to see in this redevelopment. Regarding the neighbors, this project has a long way to go and working with the neighbors is imperative for the applicant.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated the public hearing will remain open.

Discussion ensued regarding the possibility of a Joint Board Meeting with the DRC in regard to this application. It was the consensus of the Board that a Joint Meeting would be beneficial.

Tom L. Lewis made a motion to seek SEQRA Lead Agency Status.
Janet Casey seconded the motion.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion.

None heard.

VOTE:

Clifford Van Wagner, in favor; Jamin Totino, in favor; Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman, in favor; Howard Pinsley, in favor; Tom L. Lewis, in favor; Mark Torpey, Chairman, in favor; Janet Casey, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

The Board recessed at 9:05 P.M.
The Board reconvened at 9:13 P.M.

6. **10.038.1 EXCELSIOR SPRINGS BANQUET VALET PARKING (SPA HOTEL), 47 Excelsior Avenue**, Site plan modification to accommodate hotel valet parking area within the Transect-5 (T-5) District.

SEQRA:

Action appears to be a Type 2 action, no further environmental review required.

BACKGROUND:

Site Plan for banquet facility was approved. Proposed action would create 111 parking space valet parking area on National Grid's adjacent property, an adjacent property, an existing contaminated site with 50+ years remaining of environmental remediation.

Applicant: Saratoga Restaurant Hospitality, LLC-Todd Carozza, BBL Hospitality

Agent: John Lapper, Attorney; Matthew Brobston, LA Group

Mr. Lapper stated they have been working with National Grid on this project for years. We have been negotiating with National Grid since they have a surface level parking lot next to the banquet facility. That site is constrained and totally appropriate for parking. We have worked out all the issues with National Grid. We have a signed licensed agreement with National Grid pending Site Plan Approval. This will become a valet parking lot which works out fine. Constraints exist concerning penetrating the ground. We can provide street trees along Excelsior and any landscaping in front of the fencing. Owners and operators of the hotel and banquet facility are very happy to utilize this space for additional parking.

Matt Brobston provided a visual presentation of the 1.2 acre parcel we are looking at. Fencing and gate to be installed which will be the same as currently exists. The site plan proposed 111 cars, sidewalks along Excelsior Avenue. The entry has been shifted more towards the Bardino side. Street trees will be added in the right of way as well as modifying the concrete sidewalk to a 10ft. wide asphalt multiuse trail which is what is being prescribed as part of the Excelsior Avenue corridor plan. This will take place just to the east of the existing entry. National Grid has many restrictions on this property and usage.

Discussion ensued concerning additional lighting of the property. Also, perhaps having a conversation with National Grid concerning sidewalk connection.

Mr. Carozza, BBL Hospitality explained how the parking lot will run and the hours as the Banquet Facility. It could be lunch time or evenings and would not be later than 1:00 A.M. It will be valet parking and limited use. Special Use Permit can note the times. The area will be secured when it is in use.

Matt Brobston stated site plan modifications will not be completed until the construction in this area is completed. It was the suggestion of the applicant to supply a letter of credit as a good faith application.

Mark Torpey, Chairman stated this is a Site Plan Modification with the following conditions - the parking lot will be in operation until 1:00 AM. A letter of credit will be established until other improvements in this area are pursued.

Jamin Totino made the motion for Site Plan Modification for the Excelsior Springs Banquet Valet Parking, 47 Excelsior Avenue be approved with the conditions as noted by the Chair.

Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion.

None heard.

VOTE:

Clifford Van Wagner, in favor; Jamin Totino, in favor; Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman, in favor; Howard Pinsley, in favor; Tom L. Lewis, in favor; Mark Torpey, Chairman, in favor; Janet Casey, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Tom L. Lewis made a motion to approve the minutes of the June 9th Planning Board Meeting Minutes as submitted.

Clifford Van Wagner seconded the motion.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion.

None heard.

VOTE:

Clifford Van Wagner, in favor; Jamin Totino, in favor; Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman, in favor; Howard Pinsley, in favor; Tom L. Lewis, in favor; Mark Torpey, Chairman, in favor; Janet Casey, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

Tom L. Lewis made a motion to approve the minutes of the July 14th Planning Board Meeting Minutes as submitted.

Clifford Van Wagner seconded the motion.

Mark Torpey, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion.

None heard.

VOTE:

Clifford Van Wagner, in favor; Jamin Totino, in favor; Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman, in favor; Howard Pinsley, in favor; Tom L. Lewis, in favor; Mark Torpey, Chairman, abstained; Janet Casey, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0-1

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Bob Bristol, Vice Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:30 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 10/13/16