



# DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

## MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 17, 2018

7:00 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL ROOM

**PRESENT:** Steven Rowland, Chairman; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman; Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett; Richard Martin; Cynthia Corbett; Leslie Mechem

**STAFF:** Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

**CALL TO ORDER:** Steven Rowland, Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

### **A. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION:**

1. **2017.110 MANEY MULTI-FAMILY TOWNHOUSES**, 38 Marvin Alley & 18 Cherry Street, Advisory Opinion to Planning Board on proposed demolition of existing 4-unit home at 18 Cherry Street and construction of 8 townhouses within the Urban Residential-4 District.

Steven Rowland, Chairman thanked the applicants agent for providing the lift truck as an example of the height of the proposed building. The Commission found this very helpful.

Agent: Ben Nassivera; Arthur Perkowski; HCP Architecture

Mr. Nassivera stated in response to the Commission's concern for the height of the townhomes proposed on Marvin Alley, it was originally requested to have a balloon study. Given the conditions we provided a bucket truck study. Mr. Nassivera provided a visual presentation of the view shed from all elevations. Visual presentation of the proposed project was provided.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the bucket truck study was very effective. I was very concerned regarding the height and this bucket truck study provided a very good idea of the proposed height of the project. The way the design has progressed the applicant and his agents were very responsive to the Commission's requests. This is not within our district and this project has progressed quite well.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the Commission has received documentation from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation on this application and they basically mirrored what I just stated and they were very pleased with the height study as well and noted it does not have strong visual impact in this area.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Maney Multi-Family Townhouses, 38 Marvin Alley and 18 Cherry Street for a Favorable Advisory Opinion to the Planning Board. Following discussion on this matter on January 17, 2018 the Commission issues the following Favorable Opinion noting the applicant has responded and modified the design in response to the DRC comments. The applicant's height study was beneficial in answering concerns regarding the height. Updated plans reflecting the recent changes to be provided for the record. Richard Martin seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:** Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

2. **2017.116 DEVAL NEW CONSTRUCTION**, 59 Franklin Street, sketch discussion (Historic Review) on a proposed subdivision to permit new construction within the Urban Residential-4 District.

Applicants: David & Richard DeVall, Applicants

Mr. David DeVall stated the applicants are before the DRC this evening for a sketch discussion concerning a subdivision in the rear of the property. We are proposing the construction of an 1100 square foot home with an attached garage. This mimics the architecture of the main building on the site. The Planning Board requested we appear before the DRC for an opinion on the siting of the project. We have spoken with Samantha Bosshart, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation this date. She offered that the mimicking of the main building may not be the way to proceed. She also offered that the garage for this property should not be attached and perhaps the addition of a breezeway to a detached garage could be considered.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development provided some background information on this application. This application went to the ZBA who referred SEQRA to the Planning Board. The Planning Board is looking for input concerning the siting of the structure on this site. This is a sketch discussion and they are looking for input and some suggestions. Following SEQRA review, they will appear before the ZBA again for variances needed for this project. Following this process the application will return before the Commission for Historic Review.

Mr. David DeVall stated Ms. Bosshart provided some history of the site noting the fact that there was a home on this site in the past. We have completed a site plan which provides precise dimensions on the project. The position we have chosen seems to be the only one that fits on the lot.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated Samantha Bosshart referenced in her letter guidelines that are in our ordinance not trying to replicate a historic structure but something which is sympathetic to the structure.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated the setback seems off. No fronting on Marvin Alley.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the types of designs for the home, the siting of the structure and Mass and Scale, as well as a detached garage versus an attached garage.

Mr. David DeVall stated they were informed that sidewalks, street trees and street lights would be required. He provided the zoning requirements for the site for the Commissions information.

Steven Rowland, Chairman questioned what is required of the Commission this evening.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the siting of the structure is important, opinions on Mass and Scale and if there are any issues on the size of the structure proposed.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the siting of the structure is not inappropriate, the mass and scale are in context with the neighborhood. We do not have a formal application so we cannot make a motion however, we can forward our thoughts and conversation to the Planning and Zoning Boards. We look forward to the applicant returning.

3. **2017.067 INTRADA SARATOGA MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT**, Station Lane, Architectural Review of a mixed-use workforce housing development within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Agent: Molly Cheng, Architect, representing the Vecino Group

Ms. Cheng stated on the last appearance before the Commission we were provided a list of items the Commission had concerns about. We have worked through a list of the items. The drawings which were sent last week were construction drawings. The lighting plan shows normal parking lot lights and some wall mounted sconces. Saratoga Historic Lights on the corners. Sidewalk bollards are proposed along the perimeter of the road, with a visual of the proposed sconces. Addressing the lap siding along the top, we are proposing the addition of some header trim. We are proposing a darker color for the lap siding and a lighter color for the bump outs. Concerning the mechanicals on the building, the dryer vents will be through the wall venting and the top story will flue out through the roof. The roof drain outlets are in the stair towers and we have two per building and they will discharge on the lower levels and will be camouflaged with landscaping. None of the drain outlets will be placed in the pedestrian right of way. Roof top units will not be visible due to the rooftop parapets. Individual condenser units will be placed on the roof and the individual bump out roofs, and will have screening. They have been placed centrally on the roof. Concerning the gas and electric meters, they will be housed behind a low masonry wall with screening. We have had a design change yesterday and will tie into the final façade. The building entrances were highlighted for the Commission's review. The design change is the addition of some individual patios and some entrances to the dwelling units on the side road. A visual of this change was provided to the Commission. Building signage will be on the Washington Side. The monumental sign is proposed but on each individual building a small sign will indicate what building it is. These have not yet been designed or the addresses.

Discussion ensued regarding the entrances off the patios to the individual units.

Steven Rowland, Chairman questioned the screening products to be used for the HVAC mechanicals as well as other mechanical penetrations and having them painted out to match the siding. The Commission would like to see the material chosen for the screening and also elevation drawings to show the height of the elevator shaft.

Richard Martin questioned the elevators height and location.

Discussion ensued among the Board concerning the mechanical penetrations.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated he appreciated the efforts which were put forth. The Commission would like to see the screening materials proposed, the height of the elevator shaft, new doors and entranceways.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Intrada Saratoga Mixed-Use Development – Final Approval, Station Lane and Washington Street that the application be approved with the following conditions: Lap siding is to be in a darker color. The details for the building and entrance signage to return for review, as well as revised drawings. Screening enclosures, patio details and entranceway details to be submitted for administrative review. The façade vents to be painted to match surrounding. Elevator tower to be dressed similar to the building with fiber cement board. Elevations including the elevator shaft to be submitted for administrative review. Tamie Ehinger seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:** Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

- 4. 2017.077 146 SOUTH BROADWAY MIXED-USE BUILDING, 146 South Broadway, Architectural Review of a new 2-story, mixed-use building within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.**

Applicant: Russ Fadden, owner

Agent: Bob Flansburg, Dreamscapes Unlimited

Mr. Flansburg stated when the applicant last appeared before the Commission in December we were asked to rethink cornices around entries and scale them down and make them more similar to what exists on the top. We have done that. A visual presentation was provided to the Commission. The new signage was presented somewhat scaled down and two windows were eliminated across the front. The windows across the entry are about twice the height they were initially. Glazing will be needed to meet the building code requirements. In terms of the widths and sizes the brackets are smaller on the windows over the entries and the stone is placed over the lower windows. There will be two laundry rooms one on each half and they will be vented out the rear of the building. Rooftop units are proposed and placed to the rear of the building near the middle.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated and thanked the applicant for taking into consideration the recommendations of the Commission. On caravan I noticed the brackets do not seem to work. Perhaps removal of the brackets or a color change of the bracket might be in order.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the corbels and the façade of the building and proposed bracket details, paint and trim colors.

Steven Rowland, Chairman suggested changing the rhythm of the brackets to the rhythm of the windows.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of 146 South Broadway Mixed Use Building, 146 South Broadway that the application be approved with the following conditions: the applicant will return and submit final color details for the cornice and corbels as well as signage, and soffit details. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:** Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

**5. 2016.054 EXCELSIOR PARK PHASE 2A BUILDINGS 1, 4 & 5, Gibson & Whistler Courts, Architectural Review of residential townhomes within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.**

Agent: Tom Brazille, Witt Construction

Mr. Brazille stated we appeared before the Commission in December 2017, we had discussed making the size of the presentation smaller and less confusing as well as providing color renderings and material samples. I have new information and we scaled down the presentation. There are five buildings in total. We are looking to obtain approvals on Buildings 1, 4 and 5. We will return for future approvals on buildings 2 and 3. We removed items which we deemed unnecessary, and we are looking for approvals concerning Mass and Scale on these three buildings. Since that time we have submitted color renderings and samples of the materials. Mr. Brazille provided a visual of the entire site project noting the completed buildings being the hotel, some apartment buildings and some of the town homes from the original phase. A visual of where Phase 2A will be developed as well as future development was provided.

Mr. Brazille provided a visual of Phase 2A and the apartment building which is currently under construction. Tonight we will review Buildings 1, 4 and 5. Mr. Brazille provided views of all elevations for the Commission's review noting the layout of

the site and wetlands areas and siting of the structures, as well as the color of the board and batten and siding, trim and brackets, roofing materials and fencing. The stairs will be an Azak material white in color with Trex being used on the treads of the steps. Trex color sample will be provided to the Commission. Trex will also be used in the deck flooring along with metal railings. All trim products will be Aspen White smooth finish. The windows will be Pella black aluminum clad windows product. All the buildings details will be the same the trim the siding color, etc., All four buildings entrances have a different roof style. There will be some guttering added once the buildings are constructed. The drainage system will be configured for each unit. We want to avoid too many gutters on the main façade. Drains will be constructed down each of the garden entrances. Building 1 the north elevation is set back. These are single family townhomes. There are no roof penetrations on the front facades. All penetrations are hidden to the best of our ability on all the units. There may be some penetrations in the siding but they will have matching colors to the siding.

Richard Martin questioned the venting of the fireplaces.

Mr. Brazille stated all the fireplace venting is done out the back of the building in the side wall. Board and batten is also a vinyl product. All solid trim an Azak material or a similar product using a smooth sided product. South elevation shows the parking area.

Richard Martin questioned the meter bank location.

Mr. Brazille provided a view on the side of the building which houses the gas and electric meters. We are trying to split them up on the sides of the buildings so they will not be so visible. These are all single family townhomes. Several different varieties of floor plans are proposed along with flex space available in some units. Review of the remainder of the buildings and all elevations were also provided to the Commission for their information and review. Material samples were provided to the Commission siding colors, Board and Batten and window finish. Cut sheets were also provided to for the file.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission.

Steven Rowland, Chairman questioned the ends of the buildings especially around the wetland areas the foundation walls are really tall. What will they be finished with?

Mr. Brazille stated they will be finished with a concrete stucco type finish on all those exteriors which will be visible.

Steven Rowland, Chairman also questioned the decks where the columns go down to the stone piers look thin.

Mr. Brazille stated that would be a 6 x 6 column.

Richard Martin stated they could be doubled easily.

Discussion ensued among the Commission with regard to the final approval request and the number of concerns still voiced by the Commission. Perhaps the applicant should return before the Commission to review all concerns voiced by the Commission members. Areas of concern such as covering the exposed concrete foundations with exposures over 4 feet. A heavier column profile. Consistent window pattern. Extend the Board and Batten to the roof projections over the porches wherever possible. All mechanicals to be painted where allowable including plumbing vents.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Richard Martin made a motion in the matter of Excelsior Park Phase 2A- Final for buildings 1, 4 & 5 that the application be approved as submitted on the attached plans with the following conditions: Exterior support columns to have stone bases from grade to top with a precast cap. Treatment to cover the exposed concrete foundations with exposure over 4 feet. A heavier column profile. A consistent window pattern. Extend the board and batten to the projections of the roof over the porches wherever possible. All mechanical penetrations to be painted if allowable including plumbing roof vents. Covered framing on the bottom side of the deck. Porch divider details to be submitted. These conditions will be reviewed by the entire Commission. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:** Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

**NOTE:** Application not on Agenda – before the Commission for clarification.

**2017.084 CELLCO/VERIZON AT STONEQUIST**, 1 South Federal Street, Architectural Review of rooftop telecommunication facility and associated mechanicals within the Urban Residential-5 District.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated as you may recall on September 6, 2017 we reviewed both Verizon and ATT applications at the same time for new equipment to be placed on the Stonequist Apartments. The applicants received approvals. After the approval it became apparent that the location of where the chase was to descend off the building needed to be Amended.

Applicant: Cellco Verizon

Agent: Dave Brennan, Attorney, Young, Sommer

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the Building Department reached out to him, having questions concerning the chase and to assure that there were two runs down the side of the building. I could not recall that and I reached out to the owner of the facility, Paul Feldman, Director of the Housing Authority and he was not aware of this proposal either. We suggested could they work together to consolidate the wiring into one chase coming down the building. They did coordinate and came up with one cable run. We then asked what it will look like. Photographs were provided of the Alfred E. Smith Building where this same type chase was used. Mr. Feldman and I had spoken on several occasions and then reached out Steve and Paul. Discussion ensued and in the discussion the brick on the building bevels in on the building in several spaces.

A visual presentation of the proposed chase placement was provided to the Commission.

Mr. Brennan stated Verizon offered to expand the width of their chase to include the wiring for the AT & T cable. We are all in agreement that only one tray should be placed on the building. The original chase was 14 inches and will now expand to 24 inches to accommodate all cables. Placement for the new chase was provided to the Commission. The color of the chase can be painted to match the color of the building.

Richard Martin questioned the positioning of the cable down the elevator shaft.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the placement of the chase on the site.

Mr. Brennan stated he will provide revised plans for the Commission's review.

**UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:**

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, January 30, 2018 at 4:00 P.M.  
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, February 7, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

**MOTION TO ADJOURN:**

There being no further business to discuss Steven Rowland, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 10:10 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski  
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 2-21-18