



# DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

## MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 21, 2018

7:00 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL ROOM

**PRESENT:** Steven Rowland, Chairman; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman;  
Richard Martin; Leslie Mechem

**ABSENT:** Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett; Cynthia Corbett;

**STAFF:** Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

**CALL TO ORDER:** Steven Rowland, Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

### **A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:**

Leslie Mechem made a motion to accept the minutes of the 1-17-2018 Design Review Commission with minor adjustments as submitted. Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

### **VOTE:**

Steven Rowland, Chairman in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 4-0**

### **B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:**

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **2018.002 COLDWELL BANKER SIGNAGE**, 56 Marion Avenue, Architectural Review of 3 exterior wall signs Within the Transect -5 Neighborhood Center District.
2. **2013.102.2 KWANG PAI SIGNAGE**, 30 Gick Road, Architectural Review of an exterior wall sign Within the Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood District.
3. **2018.011 SHADE TREE ADVISORS SIGNAGE**, 268 Broadway, Suite 101B, Historic Review of a wall sign Within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
4. **2018.003 AAA NORTHWAY SIGNAGE**, 26 West Avenue, Architectural Review of a freestanding sign within the Transect-5 Urban Core District.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1 through #4 on the Consent Agenda. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on the consent agenda items. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Coldwell Banker Signage, 56 Marion Avenue, Kwang Pai Signage, 30 Gick Road, Shade Tree Advisors, 268 Broadway, and AAA Northway Signage, 26 West Avenue, that we approve all four applications as submitted. Richard Martin seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 4-0**

**C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION:**

**5. 2018.012 MASTRIANNI EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS**, 125 Regent Street, Historic Review of exterior alternations Windows within the Urban Residential-4 District.

Applicant: Beverly Mastrianni, owner Liz Mastrianni, friend/engineer

Mrs. Mastrianni stated this application is for replacement of several windows on the porch. When the home was rehabbed in 2001 a two story porch addition was built onto the home. The windows under consideration are both the lower and upper windows on the porch. When this addition was built the Waldorf School had less of a student population than it currently has along with the addition of school buses. A nursery school down the street has also expanded to include additional traffic with drop off and pickups. Behind the home there was an empty lot and the Skidmore Library. The state purchased the property demolished the library and turned this area into a parking lot. The room is currently unusable at this time. It is dirty and noisy. I am proposing to remove the windows facing south both upper and lower. Also the window facing east will be somewhat larger but will be a double hung window similar to the ones which exist on the east side elevation now. The border and stripping which continues around the home will be remain.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Richard Martin made a motion in the matter of the Mastrianni Exterior Alterations, 125 Regent Street, that the application be approved with the following conditions: The two windows facing the south both upper and lower are filled in completely and flush to the existing wall plane. The border and the stripping which goes all around continues. Also, that the shingles be toothed in. The window facing east will be a double hung window similar to the ones that are on the east side elevation now. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 4-0**

6. 2018.001 ADIRONDACK TRUST SIGNAGE, 473 Broadway, advisory opinion (Historic Review) to ZBA on new Signage within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Applicant: Adam Wakulenko, Adirondack Sign Company on behalf of AJ Signs

Mr. Wakulenko stated the applicant has removed the front graphic proposed off the application today. We have offered three different options for what we are proposing. The bank is currently rebranding every branch and make them compliant removing the old sign and replacing with the same type of lighting on the building using a different color for the lettering.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated there are two different proposals one with the logo on the top and one with the logo on the side.

Mr. Wakulenko stated there are two options with the logo. One is a 48 inch medallion and one with a 36 inch medallion. Obviously they would like to have the larger one approved.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated he believes the horizontal one seems to read better and a little more appropriate on the building rather than the one with the logo above. It seems more balanced.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated she feels it is more balanced with the logo above.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked how does this compare to the one that currently exists on the building.

Mr. Wakulenko stated the one that is currently on the building actually has smaller letters. The difference is the medallion is missing. They really want the medallion on the top. Everything they brand is that way. Every other branch will have the logo on the top.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated the version of the signage preferred is with the 36" logo above the 21" lettering.

Mr. Wakulenko stated we are also looking for the same or approximately the same size signage to cover over the holes used to anchor the previous sign. The original sign was lit with neon and converted to LED. The new signage will be halo lit white lettering which looks black at night.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the Commission prefers signage to be anchored in the motor joints for ease in repair if and when it is necessary.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated this is an Advisory Opinion to the ZBA. In this area lettering and logos are not allowed over 18" in size and they are not allowed above the first floor. The intent is to keep everything pedestrian oriented and focused on sidewalk traffic. There are some variances proposed here. The ZBA is seeking your opinion as to why there is a specific need for this application to exceed the limits imposed in this area.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the existing sign already extends over the former window at the top. One of my thoughts is if the signage was proportionally reduced in size enough to fit between the existing window in the center and the former window on the right. Given the location and the visibility of the wall perhaps the existing sign could be moved down lower to the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor between the existing window and the former window. I can see my way to having the logo on the top.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the location and placement of the proposed signage in its current location.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Adirondack Trust Signage, 473 Broadway, Advisory Opinion to the ZBA.

The DRC make a motion for a Favorable Advisory Opinion with the following considerations: It was the consensus of the Commission that the sign be moved down lower to the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor between the windows or between the two windows and the bricked up window and reduced in size proportionally. Richard Martin seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor;  
Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 4-0**

**7. 2018.008 MACIEL EXTERIOR RENOVATION, 153 Van Dam Street, Architectural Review of exterior renovations, (rear addition, etc.) within the Urban Residential-2 District.**

Applicant: Erin Maciel

Ms. Maciel stated they recently purchased this home in May of 2017. We would like to expand the home. We are proposing a rear addition for the purpose of adding a second bathroom in the home. We are trying to add a bathroom to the second floor keeping the two bedrooms upstairs as well. The addition will be off the rear of the home extending the second floor peaked roof. We are also proposing a full new façade on the back of the building. Our intent is to do a full renovation of the home but current funding allows only for the rear addition. We will be changing the siding to Hardie board siding and new trim. A new sliding door is proposed on the first floor and three new windows in the addition. We do not wish to change the home. We are also proposing removal of the current shed which exists on the property now. Visual presentation of the proposed renovations were provided to the Commission.

Steven Rowland, Chairman provided some recommendations for raising the ridge of the new rear addition for ease in Construction and prevent future roof issues.

Leslie Mechem questioned if the property were in a Historic District.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated this is not in a Historic District but it is in a Contributing property in the National Registry.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Maciel Exterior Renovations, 153 Van Dam Street that the application be approved with the following conditions: the applicant will raise the ridge of the rear addition to denote new construction. The Commission recommends the applicant use smooth type Hardie Plank siding versus textured siding. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor;  
Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 4-0**

8. 2018.009 O'DONNELL REALTY EXTERIOR RENOVATIONS, 456 Broadway, Historic Review of exterior repair and renovations within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Applicant: Paul O'Donnell, Celtic Treasures

Agent: Tonya Yasenchak, Engineering America

Ms. Yasenchak stated the applicant is in the process of doing renovation inside the building. Before the interior renovations are begun the applicant would like to button up the outside of the building especially the rear wall which is in poor condition. as well as new windows and a new roof as part of the project. Ms. Yasenchak provided a visual presentation of the project for the Commission's review. All elevations were reviewed. The back wall is brick and will be repaired. Windows will be replaced. These new wood windows will fit the current openings and will be consistent. Part of the renovations is turning the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> floors of the building office space. There will be a rooftop patio which makes it usable for the tenants. The first floor is currently being used for the owner's office space as well as storage. So what we are proposing is to retain the door on the alley. Proposed materials were provided for the Commission's review. The rear fenestration is the only area which will be renovated. The windows along Broadway are in very good condition. They will be repaired as they are. An additional window along the north side of the building will be bricked in along the property line. For safety sake the opening will be bricked in.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the Commission requests that this window be recessed in a bit. Also he questioned if the cement parging will be removed during this renovation. It appears some of the brick will need to be replaced. This will require a mason familiar with this type of renovation. Possibly some brick samples would be helpful for the Commission to review.

Ms. Yasenchak stated yes the parging will be removed and the applicant expects to return before the Commission with brick samples for the Commission's review.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the O'Donnell Exterior Renovations, 456 Broadway, that the application be approved with the following condition: The applicant will return to the Commission with brick samples. Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 4-0**

9. 2018.007 CUOMO EXTEIOR RENOVATION, 121 Caroline Street, Historic Review of exterior renovations (roof, siding, windows) within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Nicholas and Terry Cuomo

Agent: Tonya Yasenchak, Engineering America

Ms. Yasenchak stated this home was originally built in 1860. In 1982 this property was listed as apartments. The current owners purchased this home in 2005. There are a series of additions. Per the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation portions of this property have been there for some time. It appears that portions of it were a garage or a carriage house which was in the back. There is a portion the way it was built showing a staircase with a roof over it.

It has not been well added on as you go across. They are currently having issues with the roof. Ms. Yasenchak provided a visual presentation of the project for the Commission's review.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated there was some correspondence received from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. They are trying to maintain the distinguishing original features, repair rather than replace, etc.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated one of the most significant portion of this letter and I agree wholeheartedly, state these extensions are historic in nature. Some do go back many many years. Each rear extension is a statement of its own time and should remain distinct from any proposed addition.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated these additions are each mistakes. I do not see the historical significance in preserving structures that were wrong in the first place. The photographs showing the rooflines are a disaster. Why would we keep that. This does not make sense.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated there have been over the years many mistakes with the home. In fact some of them in recent years. The one thing, one of the remaining things that this house has going for it is that the original portion is distinct from all this hodgepodge. The hodgepodge is not pretty and does not work well. What the applicant is proposing removes all of the original portion of the home completely. This would be unacceptable. I would be hesitant moving forward doing something as drastic as this losing the one element that remains.

Richard Martin stated the roof portion being proposed ruins the whole structure.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the proposed application.

Ms. Yasenchak provided some suggestions to the proposed project.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated he would like to see some revised plans. We are looking at a goodly amount of change. Also, we only have four Commission members present here this evening. It would be my suggestion to table this for a couple of weeks and then return before the Commission in a few weeks.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

10. **2017.077 146 SOUTH BROADWAY MIXED USE BUILDING**, 146 South Broadway, Architectural Review of a new 2-story, mixed use building within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Applicant: Russ Fadden, owner

Agent: Bob Flansburg, Dreamscapes Unlimited

Mr. Flansburg stated from our last meeting the Commission suggested exploring using some of the colors on the building. A visual presentation was provided to the Commission reviewing the proposed color options.

Discussion ensued among the Commission.

Mr. Fadden reviewed the proposed signage. It will be halo lit 18" aluminum lettering using a backer board to adhere to the building.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of 146 South Broadway Mixed-Use Building-final details, 146 South Broadway, that the application be approved as submitted this evening with the following condition: the applicant use the monochromatic color scheme.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of 146 South Broadway Mixed Use Building, 146 South Broadway that the application be approved as submitted this evening with the following conditions: the applicant will use the monochromatic color scheme presented this evening.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:** Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman in favor; Richard Martin, in favor;  
Leslie Mechem, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 4-0**

**UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:**

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, February 27, 2018 at 4:00 P.M.

Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, February 7, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

**MOTION TO ADJOURN:**

There being no further business to discuss Steven Rowland, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:02 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski  
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 4-18-18