



March 23, 2017  
CITY OF SARATOGA SPRINGS  
Charter Review Commission  
Music Hall – City Hall  
7:00 PM

**CALL TO ORDER**

**ROLL CALL**

**SALUTE TO FLAG**

**WELCOME AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**INTRODUCTORY REMARKS**

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

**MINUTES**

**Discussion of public outreach, public forum on March 29th**

**Discussion of remaining charter provisions**

- **Supervisors—election: (Method needs to be decided)**
- **Budget Provisions**
- **Staggered Terms methods of elections for City Council- head to head or top 3**
- **Term Limits - lifetime or 12 consecutive, review for clarity and agreement**
- **Tax Districts? Recitation of Charity, health and schools?**
- **Schedule (For transition) Have we addressed adequately the mechanism for the transition, including funding?**

**COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**ADJOURN**



March 23, 2017  
CITY OF SARATOGA SPRINGS  
Charter Review Commission  
Music Hall – City Hall  
7:00 PM

PRESENT: Jeff Altamari  
Gordon Boyd  
Ann Casey Bullock  
Laura Chodos  
Pat Kane  
BK Keramati  
Robert Kuczynski  
Mike Los  
Minita Sanghvi  
Barbara Thomas  
Robert Turner

ABSENT: Devin DalPos  
Elio DeSette  
Matthew Jones  
Beth Wurtmann

STAFF: Tony Izzo

### **RECORDING OF PROCEEDING**

The proceedings of this meeting were taped for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript.

### **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Robert Turner called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Chair Robert Turner opened the meeting for public comment. There was no one wishing to comment.

## **MINUTES**

No minutes.

## **DISCUSSION OF REMAINING CHARTER PROVISIONS**

### **County Supervisors**

Commission members reviewed Article 4. Article 4 was renumbered to add section 4.05 for the City Assessor and 4.06 for the Supervisors. It was agreed that Supervisors, "may attend meetings and may report and seek advice from the Council". Commission members agreed the first election under for Supervisors would have the top two vote getters getting the seats. The top vote getter would get the seat with the four year term, the second highest vote getter would get the seat with the two year term. After that, the elections would be staggered. It was also agreed to add the text, "affecting county or city business". BK Keramati asked if there was a formal way for the Supervisors to interact with the Council. Gordon Boyd said that would depend on the issue. Pat Kane said with a City Manager there would be more interaction.

## **PUBLIC FORM ISSUES**

Pat Kane distributed information for Commission members to review before next Wednesday. He asked that everyone be there by about 6:15 to set up the room. He then reviewed the agenda. He suggested there would be Commission introduction, chair's welcome, committee review, power point, executive overview and then Q&A. BK Keramati said he had developed slides that could be used for the PowerPoint. Mike Los said he did not want us to go through "what we had learned". He said there should be a basic power point and then presentation of the new document.

Bob Turner said people need to hear why the Commission believed there should be change. He said it would allow Commission members to talk about differing things, highlight the process and thoroughness. He said we should run through the nuts and bolts on how the new form of government works. We should be done in about 25 minutes and then the rest of the time will be for Q&A. He said we should start with why we are proposing change. Gordon Boyd suggested that we go through our methodology, how we came with different mindsets, we did our research and have now come to this conclusion. BK Keramati said the slides that we have do all of that. Pat Kane said we need to introduce ourselves. Jeff Altamari said he did not believe that we should talk about our reasons. Gordon Boyd suggested that everyone do a very short bio that could be left on the table as a hand out.

Pat Kane said there is some merit to describing the committees and their work. He said we should say we interviewed many individuals, reviewed alternative forms of government, etc. Bob Turner said there needs to be several speakers. He said it should almost be like a TED talk. BK Keramati said the slides do a lot of what we are talking about.

Bob Turner said there were powerful quotes from those that we interviewed and those should be shared. He suggested there be a slide for each committee. Jeff Altamari said during the Q&A is the opportunity for Commission members to participate. Gordon Boyd said the public forum is about hearing from the public. He said we need to give them the basic outline and have them ask questions.

BK Keramati said we have a proposed organization chart. He said we need to show the public what the new form will look like. He said we need to show them what we did and why we propose this change.

Gordon Boyd said we need to have a draft document available. Pat Kane disagreed saying that giving too much information might not be appropriate. Gordon Boyd said we would then be accused of not share all of the information.

Ann Bullock said we need to show the power point with basic information. Bob Turner said the public needs to know what the government looks like now and what we envision. BK Keramati said we need to show a picture of what we envision. He suggested that maybe someone should develop a power point and then come to the Commission so that we could all discuss.

Barbara Thomas suggested time limits for speakers. Gordon Boyd said no.

Bob Turner asked what is the basic information that we need to give. It was agreed there should be organizational charts, description of the legislative and administrative and to draw a contrast between the two. Barbara Thomas said we need to describe the current form.

Gordon Boyd reminded everyone that we are not trying to sell. This is education.

Laura Chodos said we need to say why we propose a change. She said the organizational chart is important. We need to describe the four year terms. She said the power point would keep us on point.

Bob Turner asked what was the story that we want to tell. There was some agreement that we should talk about the basic information on the current charter, the role of the new Mayor, the City Manager that would be professionally trained, the City Manager has the day to day operation of the City, and wind up with the Finance provisions. Jeff Altamari agreed that the four year terms, structure and finance are important.

Pat Kane said there is a lot of information in the executive summary.

Robert Kuczynski said we need to have some "prompts" that will encourage the public to ask questions about. Bob Turner said that could be term limits and consecutive or life time term limits. Laura Chodos said we should know what we want to do before we present to them. Gordon Boyd said this gives the public a good opportunity for us to hear what the public is thinking. Jeff Altamari said he envisioned this as a give and take sessions.

Bob Turner suggested that we give examples on how the new form works in certain situations. BK Keramati said we should share what we learned from the City Managers. He said it would be important to share with residents that there will now be one point of contact with issues.

Mike Los said perhaps we should show the new organizational chart and the five silos – side by side. Bob Turner agreed saying we could show how the departments are broken up and then show the new proposed form.

Jeff Altamari asked how we would respond to the question, "how much is this going to cost?"

BK Keramati said we need to put into perspective the salaries that we currently pay as compared to the new proposal. Pat Kane said we would be eliminating five deputies and adding one city manager. We can say the financial impact statement is still being worked on. Mike Los said that inevitably the question will arise, "how can one person do the job of five deputies". Bob Turner said we can explain that some duties will be pushed up and some will be pushed down. Pat Kane said we can show that some departments will fold into one another. Barbara Thomas asked about the current employees and some of those who might lose their jobs. Jeff Altamari said we must show that we are economically neutral. Gordon Boyd said the cost will certainly not be more than the existing form. Ann Bullock said that Barbara Thomas' question about existing employees is important. Jeff Altamari said the new City Manager will determine where positions would eventually be cut.

Bob Turner suggested that we might be able to stream the meeting through the Face book page. Barbara Thomas said she thought we did not have a Face book page.

Gordon Boyd asked if we were going to have subsequent meetings after this forum. Pat Kane said that we are going to have another public form on April 30 and we could have another on May 30.

Laura Chodos asked what would be on the table for handouts. Bob Turner said there would be the executive overview, a sample City Manager resume, City Manager Code of Ethics, ICMA handouts, bios of Commission members and both new and old organizational charts.

Ann Bullock said we need to be sure not to advocate. Barbara Thomas reminded everyone to be brief when answering questions. BK Keramati said we should not worry too much about advocating. Pat Kane said it would be in good form to be just factual.

## **REVIEW OF CHARTER**

Article 4.05: Ann Bullock said under the City Assessor, much of this language was taken from the NYS statute. Bob Turner asked how it compared to the existing charter. Ann Bullock said the assessor has to become certified within three years. Pat Kane said the City would have two assessors on staff throughout the transition. Bob Turner said there is a lot of information on dates in the existing charter. Ann Bullock suggested it should all go into the code.

Article 4.06: County Supervisors: It was agreed four year terms staggered after the first election.

### **Article 5:**

It was noted that "Authorities" are separate entities from the City and they do not answer to the City.

5.03: Appendix A1 & A2. Ann Bullock said it is a time line for the city budget process and capital program timeline. Ann Bullock said Mark Lawton removed some language on submission of budgets and amendments being submitted in accordance with the provisions of this section the charter. She said she put it back in and Commission members agreed.

5.05A: It was agreed to leave the language to "include such other material as the City Manager deems appropriate."

5.05, Section 2. It was agreed that the capital budget would be recommended by the "city manager" and not the capital program committee. It was also agreed that capital projects shall be prioritized.

5.06: Ann Bullock said that Mark Lawton did not include language on the City's web site. She added that language.

5.07: Budget Adoption: Ann Bullock said the City Council is the Finance Committee. Gordon Boyd said it's a two stage process. Ann Bullock said it is important to state that the Mayor is the chair of the Finance Committee. Bob Turner asked what would happen if the Mayor would not certify the material. Gordon Boyd said the City Manager's budget would take effect. Pat Kane suggested that the Council could override the Mayor.

5.09: Ann Bullock said she was somewhat concerned that the City Manager shall indicate the estimated shortfall, remedial action and recommendations on steps to be taken. She said there should be some input from the Council. Gordon Boyd said the Council could act on their own. Mike Los suggested taking out "remedial action". He said if there is a shortfall, the City Manager must inform the Council. Jeff Altamari said this section is only about revenues. Gordon Boyd agreed the Council should know about the problem. It was agreed that the paragraph would be reworked and that the City Manager would report without delay and make recommendations.

5.12: It was agreed this section was redundant and should be removed.

5.13: Transfers of money. It was agreed to keep this section.

5.16 & 5.17: It was agreed to keep these sections, but to remove the acronyms.

#### Article 6

6.02: It was agreed that we need to be clear in this section on the head to head races. Term Limits: It was agreed there needed to be more discussion on term limits.

Inside/Outside tax districts: It was agreed to leave this section as is.

7.04: It was agreed to leave this section as is.

8.07: Commission members agreed that more work needed to be done on this section.

#### MISCELLANEOUS

Robert Kuczynski asked about the existing City Council setting deadlines. Ann Bullock said it was in section 2.25. Bob Turner said the deadline is December 31, 2018. Commission members were good with that language.

Barbara Thomas said she would like to see the draft document added to the City's web page, but clearly marked draft. Ann Bullock asked that everyone read the document to be sure that all grammatical errors were caught.

**NEXT MEETING**

It was agreed the next meeting would be held on April 3. The agenda would include "next steps".

**ADJOURNMENT**

Minita Sanghvi moved and BK Keramati seconded to adjourn meeting at 9:30 p.m. Ayes all. There being no further business, Bob Turner adjourned the meeting at 9:30p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Katherine A. Moran  
Clerk

Accepted: 4/6/2017