



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, APRIL 18, 2018

7:00 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL ROOM

RECEIVED
MAY 03 2018
ACCOUNTS DEPARTMENT

PRESENT: Steven Rowland, Chairman; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman; Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett; Richard Martin; Cynthia Corbett; Leslie Mechem

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Steven Rowland, Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Leslie Mechem made a motion to accept the minutes of the February 21, 2018 meeting minutes with minor corrections. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor;

MOTION PASSES: 4-0

Leslie Mechem made a motion to accept the minutes of the March 21, 2018 meeting minutes as submitted. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor;

MOTION PASSES: 5-0

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **20178.029 EMBRACE THE RACE SIGNAGE**, 327 Broadway, Historic Review of a replacement wall sign within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
2. **2018.031 SARATOGA COWORKS SIGNAGE**, 462 Broadway, Historic Review of wall signage within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

3. **2018.032 MOUNTAINMAN OUTDOOR AWNINGS**, 490 Broadway, Historic Review of awnings within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
4. **2018.033 DR. RIDHA SIGNAGE**, 72 Railroad Place, Architectural Review of a wall sign within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
5. **2018.036 STRAUSS EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 454 Broadway, Historic Review of exterior modifications in a Transect-6 District.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1 through #5 on the Consent Agenda. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on the consent agenda items. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Embrace the Race Signage, 327 Broadway, Saratoga CoWorks Signage, 462 Broadway, Mountainman Outdoor Awnings, 490 Broadway, Dr. Ridha Signage, 72 Railroad Place, And Strauss Exterior Modifications, 454 Broadway, that these five applications be approved as submitted. Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION:

1. **2018.035 SECURITY SUPPLY NEW CONSTRUCTION**, 5 Finley Street, consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency (Architectural Review) for demolition of existing building and construction of a new plumbing supply store and warehouse within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated this is an old residential structure to be demolished and replaced with a new two story plumbing supply store and warehouse. The application will appear before the Planning Board for Site Plan and Special Use Permit and return before this Board for Architectural review.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Security Supply New Construction, 5 Finley Street, that the Design Review Commission defer Lead Agency Status to the Planning Board should they seek it. Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

2. **2018.001.1 ADIRONDACK TRUST SIGNAGE**, 473 Broadway, advisory Opinion (Historic Review) to ZBA on new signage within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated this application was before this Commission on a previous occasion. We are providing an Advisory Opinion to the ZBA concerning the proposed signage.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, stated this application is before the ZBA for a series of variances. One variance is placement of signage above the first floor and also letters and logos cannot exceed 18" in this district. This logo was originally proposed at 48" as well as the letters which were 20".

Agent: Adam Wakulenko, Adirondack Sign Company

Mr. Wakulenko stated when they appeared before the Commission previously a recommendation from this Commission requested a decrease in size of the logo and letter and keep the signage between the bricked up window and the other windows, reduce the size proportionally and bring the signage down to the second floor. Reducing the size of the letter is not a problem at all. Our biggest problem in bringing the signage down to the second floor is there is no access to electrical. This would entail taking the entire wall down in this area to provide electrical service to the signage on this level. The current location on the third floor has electrical service previously installed for this purpose. This would be problematic. All new holes will need to be drilled in this historic building. If the signage remains on the 3rd floor we can reuse the previous holes and electrical service already in place. The new signage will remain as halo lit lettering.

Mr. Wakulenko discussed the project and what would be required if the signage were moved down a floor.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the scaling down of the signage.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated in our previous discussion we recommended bringing the logo sign down to approximately 30 or 36 inches. We also wanted to scale the size of the copy so it would comfortably fit between the window and the bricked in window. There should be approximately 6" from each of the window casings which would look more comfortable.

Mr. Wakulenko stated we will comply with your recommendations. Bring the signage in 6" on each side of the window casings, and reduce the logo proportionately. Lettering is currently at 20".

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated what we are looking at is a logo of approximately 30" and the lettering at 18". This application will return before the Commission

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman provided the following Advisory Opinion to the ZBA.

It was the consensus of the Commission that the largest letters ADIRONDACK be an 18" maximum. The A circle logo be 30" in diameter so the whole sign will be reduced proportionally between those two windows on the 3rd floor elevation and at least 6" from each window masonry opening. Also, that sign be permitted at the 3rd story because of difficulty and damage to historic building if moved to second story. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

3. **2018.020 BRADLEY EXTERIOR**, 106 Spring Street, Historic Review of exterior modifications within the Urban Residential-4 District.

Applicant: Janet Bradley, President Condominium Association at 106 Spring Street.

Ms. Bradley stated she is before the Commission this evening with a proposal to try to help with the water runoff.

She provided a visual presentation of the site for the Commission's review noting the property does have some guttering. I am working with the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation and Samantha Bosshart, as well as doing some investigating with local guttering companies regarding the types of guttering available as well as trying to be consistent since there is some guttering already on the building. There is a problem with some rotting on the decks and stairs and mold on the mortar of the bricks. There are two areas where we are currently proposing new guttering and it will be done in a color to match the current guttering and windows. This will help to alleviate some of the water issues. The second area is water in my basement. Ms. Bradley provided information concerning an additional downspout to avoid pooling in her basement. All the downspouts will be taken away from the building to avoid damage to the building.

Steven Rowland, Chairman spoke regarding guttering especially in the winter and ice formation. They are a necessary evil.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any questions or comments or concerns. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Bradley Exterior, 106 Spring Street that the application be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

4. **2018.017 HEORAUF EXTERIOR**, 61 Beekman Street, request to modify Architectural Review approval of exterior modifications within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Frank Heorauf

Mr. Heorauf stated they are before the Commission this evening to modify their previous application. They are proposing to restore an additional entrance on the front of the home. This was discovered during interior renovations. No renovations have been done yet on the front of the home. The applicant is proposing the use of vinyl siding versus Hardie-plank which is what was previously approved by this Commission.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the vinyl siding versus Hardie-plank siding, which was previously approved by this Commission. It was the consensus of the Commission for the applicant to use Hardie-plank siding as originally approved. The additional entrance looks good.

Richard Martin stated the door needs to be 3 feet wide with handrails by code. Mr. Martin also felt that the style of the new entry door as well as the steps and the railings to be approved via Administrative Action.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Richard Martin made a motion in the matter of the Heorauf Exterior Modifications Request, 61 Beekman Street, that the application be approved with the following conditions, The siding will remain as originally approved on the previous application. Concrete lap siding with shingles not shake type shingles. Also, that the new entrance way door, steps and railings be approved via Administrative Action. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

5. **2018.026 RUSSELL SINGLE FAMILY**, 499 Union Avenue, Architectural Review of exterior modifications within the Suburban Residential-1 District.

Applicant: Ardi Russell

Agent: Matt Hurff, Frost Hurff Architecture

Mr. Hurff stated there is existing building on the property site. A visual presentation of the proposed project was provided to the Commission. The current building on the site is not in great shape. This site does not have a lot of rich architectural context. The owner wished to do something more modern. What we are proposing is somewhat of a layered design. The façade is deep to provide light and contrast. The existing footprint of the house is not changing. The only thing we are adding is the small walking path.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the proposed design.

Steven Rowland, Chairman questioned the applicant concerning removal of the current roof and the addition of a second floor. All the roofs will remain flat.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there were any additional questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Russell Single Family, 499 Union Avenue that the application be approved as submitted. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

6. **2018.030 PROMENADE AT SARATOGA, (STONEQUIST)**, West Circular and South Federal Street, Sketch Plan Review of new mixed income residences with the Urban Residential-5 District.

Agent: Brett Balzer, Balzer Tuck Architecture; Paul Feldman, Executive Director Saratoga Springs Housing Authority; Rick Higgins, President, Norstar Development.

Mr. Feldman stated the housing authority's mission is to meet the need of low income housing needs. In researching this project he noted the lack of affordable housing in the City. He incorporated affordable housing in the five plan he was adopting for the Housing Authority. There is several acres of property behind the Stonequist building. A study was conducted which noted the lack of low income/workforce housing in the City. An RFP was sent out for a development consultant. We partnered with a company called Fresno out of Baltimore. Brian Sweeney is here this evening from Fresno. We then issued an RFP for a development partner and after that process we went with Rick Higgins and Norstar Development. That started this whole process.

Mr. Balzer provided a visual presentation of the proposed project noting the location of a 5. Acre site in the UR-5 District, with a 185 foot height limitation. This is a fairly unique property. The existing Stonequist building is a 10 story tower, with 176 units currently with 73 parking spaces on the site. Part of this process is an outreach by the Saratoga Springs Housing Authority who is the Lead Agent to the DRC for your thoughts and concerns and assistance as we move through the SEQRA process. Context photographs were provided for the Commission as well as some background for the Commission. The 10 story tall Stonequist Tower site is surrounded by 1 and 2 family homes. We are proposing to add a series of buildings and the addition of 63 new living units to the site. We will be before the Planning Board in a month. We have spoken to the Fire Department, DPW and the residents as well as the neighbors of Stonequist. Site circulation will remain the same. We will be introducing a 41 unit, 4 story building and flanking West Circular with 3 buildings. A 8 unit, a 6 unit and another 8 unit buildings all two stories. Parking will be provided to the rear of the property. A visual of the proposed project provided to the Commission. There will be an addition of 63 new units. One of the challenges is how do we layout the site with the surrounding 10 story tower. Mr. Balzer provided a floor plan of the proposed 4 story building for the Commission's review.

It was the consensus of the Commission that the project is very well thought out. A lot of effort was put forth by the applicant and their agents. The Commission voiced their concern regarding the mechanicals which could present an issue. Concern was also voiced regarding access and egress from the site.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated this will help soften the Stonequist Tower and add some activity in this area. I like the scale of the row houses and this will help with the pedestrian activity in this area. The general perspective is the location is an appropriate stepping from South Franklin to the ten story building to the four story building and the distance between them. The idea of having 3 individual buildings along Circular Street and in general the mass and scale is appropriate and is headed in the right direction. The project as a whole will help soften the current Stonequist towers. We look forward to the further development of this project.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated this is a federal project on federal lands. They wanted your input and suggestions for the SEQRA portion of this. There is no requirement for a return.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the Design Review Commission would issue a favorable advisory opinion for SEQRA. Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, April 24, 2018 at 4:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, May 2, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development reminded Commission members of the Preservation Conference Scheduled for April 19th and 20th.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Steven Rowland, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:30 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 5/2/18