



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 6, 2018

7:00 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL ROOM

PRESENT: Steven Rowland, Chairman; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman; Richard Martin, Cynthia Corbett, Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett;

ABSENT: Leslie Mechem

STAFF: Susan Barden, Senior Planner, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Steven Rowland, Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Cynthia Corbett made a motion to accept the minutes of the May 16, 2018 DRC meeting as submitted. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **2018.043.1 REVELATION CHURCH EXTERIOR**, 55 Pine Road, Architectural Review of exterior modifications within the Suburban Residential-2 District.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Item #1 on the Consent Agenda. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on the consent agenda item. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Revelation Church Exterior, 55 Pine Road, that the application be approved as submitted. Richard Martin seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION:

RECUSAL:

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman recused from the following agenda item.

1. **2018.044 655 BROADWAY EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 655 North Broadway, Historic Review of exterior modifications within the Urban Residential-1 District.

Applicant: 655 North Broadway LLC

Agent: Edward Lewis, Director of Operations, Galarneau Builders

Mr. Lewis stated the applicants have completed a full remodel of the basement interior. Three bedrooms have been added so we are required to install three egress windows. One on the south side of the house, one on the north side of the house and one on the front of the house. These will be custom Anderson or Pella to match the existing with true divided light. Also, we will be removing the north facing secondary entrance to the home, which will include removing the door, the roof structure and infilling with similar stone, wood and siding finishes to match. Interior renovations eliminated the need for the door. The wood fencing will be re-installed. A visual of the site was provided to the Commission.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission.

Richard Martin questioned the applicant regarding the replacement area on the home and should it be recessed to denote new construction which is what is normally done with historic properties.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding recessing the area in question versus tooting the cedar shingles back in.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the removal of this entry corrects the out of balance look of the door.

Steven Rowland, Chairman, asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Richard Martin made a motion in the matter of the 655 North Broadway Exterior Modification application be approved with the following condition – tooth back in the cedar shingle siding and remove the roof. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor;
Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 5-0

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman resumed her position on the Commission.

2. **2018.046 FINGERPAINT MARKETING OFFICES**, 1 Franklin Square, Historic Review of exterior modifications within the Transect-5 Urban Core District.

Applicant: Fingerprint Marketing

Agent: Brett Balzer, Balzer Tuck Architecture, Paul Lambert, Bonacio Construction

Mr. Balzer stated Fingerpaint Marketing recently purchased this building at 1 Franklin Square. They are looking to locate additional offices within the structure as well as housing for out of town clients. There are apartments in the building now and they will be turned over to Fingerpaint Marketing. Over the last several years this building has had little to no maintenance. Fingerpaint Marketing has some additional projects proposed for the future of the building but tonight we are before you with the exterior modifications only. First is the front entry door which serves at the main entry to the building. Secondly, is the south east porch door. This door is sealed shut and does not serve the interior space at all. With this application we are proposing to replace the existing front door and we are looking to remove this south east entry porch door and replace it with a window identical to what currently exists on the porch. Mr. Balzer stated they are in receipt of a letter from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation voicing their concerns about the project citing the historic guidelines.

Mr. Balzer provided a visual presentation of the site and the current front door. There are some discrepancies in that front door. Where the doors meet they have begun to separate over time. I do not believe there is much hope in the possibility of rejoining them. We are expecting future separation. There is an existing undercut about 1" to 1½" on the bottom which needs to be addressed. The door is chewed up from years of abuse. The existing south east entry porch door is fixed as it currently exists. It was foamed in at one point in time. It is essentially sealed up. We have similar issues with the rails and stiles with separation of those rails and stiles over time. So we start to see cracks. When we go back in time to try to determine the age of the doors the detailing is quite different from each other denoting different dates of construction and installation. What our intent is with the front entry door is to essentially rebuild the door in kind. Keep the glass transom and wood trim surround. The door will be custom made of mahogany. Where there currently exist wood panels we are proposing glass inserts to let in more light. We will keep the current door, tag and store in the basement. On the southeast porch we are proposing removal of the door and repeat the window adjacent to this door. Essentially we are mirroring the southwest porch. A Marvin double hung wood window is proposed. Trim to match the existing. Also we will remove the concrete stairs which are different from the front entry. We will keep the sidewalks to keep accessibility to the side. We will replace stairs with a skirt to match. Again, this door will be tagged and stored. Sidewalk in the rear to the back will be a handicapped ramp to provide accessibility.

Mr. Balzer stated he had shared a photo from the Bolster Collection circa 1920 with the Preservation Foundation which showed the front door as it appears today. The side entry door shows that this door in the photo is not the door which is there today. Are we attempting to save a door that is not historic at all. Not a consistent thread historically here. Mr. Balzer stated the existing main door is in poor condition. We will keep the trim and the transom. The new door is a custom door with all the details to match, short of the glass we are introducing into the panels. The southeast porch door will be sealed off as an entrance and we will introduce a window to match the current windows in this location.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there are any questions or comments.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated the applicants agent makes a very good argument. I understand the replacement of the front door if there are issues with it. Her concern is that it should resemble what was there. No glass it is not appropriate.

Chris Bennett stated he would like to make a site visit. Our guidelines are to preserve pieces of history. I think these doors and windows can be preserved.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the applicant is proposing like materials like details and textures. He is not opposed to the glass. He does not have a problem with what the applicant is proposing. They are doing what our ordinance asks replacement in kind.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman agrees a site visit is warranted.

Cynthia Corbett agrees with Chris Bennett in regard to both the doors and the windows.

Richard Martin stated Chris raises an interesting point. Duplicating the door and adding windows. I think walking down the street no one will know that these are not the original doors or windows.

It was the consensus of the Commission to make a site visit on the next scheduled caravan on Tuesday.

Brett Balzer questioned the Commission to see if a motion can be passed this evening with the notation of a site visit for the door determination.

It was the consensus of the Commission to table this application for two weeks.

3. **2018.005 ATC SIGNAGE ADVISORY OPINION** 33 Marion Avenue, Advisory Opinion (Architectural Review)
To ZBA on signage within the Tourist Related Business District.

Applicant: Adirondack Trust Company

Agent: Adam Wakulenko, Adirondack Sign Company

Mr. Wakulenko stated that the applicant is proposing removal of the pin lettering on the side of the building and to replace it with a new sign. One of the main reasons for the background is to cover over the holes which exist on the building from the stud mountings. This is a standard sign for the company which is completing a rebranding of all their banks. The background of the sign will be opaque and the lettering will glow. This will match the new color scheme. The lettering will be somewhat smaller than what currently exists.

Susan Barden, Senior Planner, City of Saratoga Springs stated the variance for this sign is to permit a sign on the building without street frontage. This faces the parking lot and the Mobil Station and not the Marion Avenue the street frontage.

Mr. Wakulenko stated the applicant is also proposing replacement of the faces of the two directional signs.

Steven Rowland, Chairman questioned if there were any zoning issues related to the directional signage.

Susan Barden, Senior Planner stated the maximum number of freestanding signs is 1 per parcel. There are two. Also the maximum size. There are two signs combined 37.3 square feet. So, because of the size these are not considered directional signage. 24 square feet is allowed in this district.

Mr. Wakulenko stated these signs are currently in this location. We are not adding signage we are just updating what currently exists. These are way finding signs. These signs will be updated and with the current updated logo. Lettering and logo will be pushed thru acrylic and internally lit with LED's. The aluminum will be painted to match the Adirondack Trust green color.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated he believes the directional signage is warranted in this location.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Advisory Opinion to the ZBA regarding the Adirondack Trust Signage, 33 Marion Avenue stated following discussion on this matter on June 6, 2018, the Commission issues the following opinion: Given the commercial context of the vicinity of this particular location and the unique and difficult circulation pattern at this site, we offer a Positive Advisory Opinion to the signage as submitted. Seconded by Leslie DiCarlo.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was anyone in the audience who wished to comment on this application.
None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor;
Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

4. **2018.021 ATC SIGNAGE ADVISORY OPINION** 115 South Broadway, Advisory Opinion (Architectural Review)
To ZBA on signage within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Applicant: Adirondack Trust Company

Agent: Adam Wakulenko, Adirondack Sign Company

Mr. Wakulenko began with the pillar signage stating the applicant is proposing removal of the medallion and replacement with a new medallion with the new logo. Same size and same placement. To the right of the pillar this location has the same thing as the Marion Avenue location. Mr. Wakulenko stated what the applicant is proposing is removal of the pin lettering on the side of the building and replace it with a new sign. One of the main reasons for the background is to cover over the holes which exist on the building from the stud mountings. All of the proposed lettering will have push through lettering which will provide some dimension and will be internally lit with LED lighting.

Discussion ensued regarding the font of the lettering within the sign is different. It was the consensus of the Commission that all wording in the signage be the same font. This can be further discussed when the applicant returns before the Commission for DRC review.

Susan Barden, Senior Planner, City of Saratoga Springs stated each of the way finding signs requires a variance for the maximum height allowed. The maximum allowed is 4ft. and these are 5ft. Maximum size is 4 square feet and these are 6 foot each and placement of the logo which is not permitted on a directional sign.

Mr. Wakulenko stated going from 4ft. to 5ft is basically for snow banks. Raising them up is important.

Cynthia Corbett questioned the need for this signage.

Mr. Wakulenko stated redundancy and where to go in this location is important.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated he feels the directional way finding signage is important. I do not feel the 5ft. height is warranted. However, allowing one business to have their logo on a way finding sign and not another does not seem appropriate. It would set a precedent. These are simply directional signs. This would also decrease the sign of these signs. If the zoning ordinance states no logo on directional signs it is there for a reason whatever it might be. It is being applied to everyone, so I don't feel comfortable giving that relief.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Advisory Opinion to the ZBA regarding the Adirondack Trust Signage, 115 South Broadway stated following discussion on this matter on June 6, 2018, the Commission issues the following opinion: The proposed "in-kind" replacement in terms of size and medallions and the monument size appear to be in proportion to the backgrounds on which they're mounted and seems appropriate. Directional signage does not need logo and its removal would also make the sign smaller and therefore compliant in terms of size. Height is acceptable as presented. Seconded by Cynthia Corbett.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor;
Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

5. **2018.022 ATC SIGNAGE ADVISORY OPINION** 315 Church Street, Advisory Opinion (Architectural Review) to ZBA on signage within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Applicant: Adirondack Trust Company

Agent: Adam Wakulenko, Adirondack Trust Sign Company

Susan Barden stated this is for a freestanding sign and the variance associated with this are maximum size for freestanding sign is and 24 and this is 45 square feet which does not include the base.

Mr. Wakulenko stated the applicant is proposing is to replace the existing monument sign with a 45 square foot monument sign.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the size of the signage.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated he feels the logo size is too big. If the logo size were to be reduced and the elimination of the bottom skirt would make the signage less intrusive.

Mr. Wakulenko stated we are also refacing the existing sign boxes with new sign faces 18 square feet and 12.4 square feet. The medallions are to be replaced as well as on the ATM signs and the ATM kiosk and there are three. We will be replacing the existing letters on the east facing façade with push through letters internally lit with LED's, as well as 2 directional signs 6 square feet each with a height of 5 feet.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the proposed signage and the proposed variances requested.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Advisory Opinion to the ZBA regarding the Adirondack Trust Signage, 315 Church Street stated following discussion on this matter on June 6, 2018, the Commission issues the following opinion: 1). The monument sign is too large, disproportional and too tall. A reduction in the logo size and elimination of the bottom skirt would be recommended to ease size and height issues. Revise to perpendicular to road could allow elimination of other signs. Gable end at the east side: seems superfluous and not needed. Directional signs: Logo unnecessary and can reduce the sign size. Height is fine. Single ATM sign and no logos; locate single ATM sign where desired. Seconded by Richard Martin.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

NOTE:

The agenda was heard out of order due to lack of representation for Agenda Item #6. This application was tabled.

7. **2018.053 VERIZON WIRELESS MODIFICATION**, 74 Mitchell Street, Architectural Review of rooftop (chimney) Telecommunications installation within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Verizon Wireless

Agent: Dave Brennan, Attorney; Young Sommers

Mr. Brennan stated we are before you this evening for a rooftop chimney installation at 74 Mitchell Street. This is an existing site that is already on air. Our lease was signed with the property owner back in November 2013. This is one of the very first small cell sites. This application is to remove the two existing antennas, 3 feet tall and replace them with 2 foot tall whips. It is a 1.7 foot decrease in the elevation of these antennas. A visual of the site was provided for the Commission. The GPS antennas will also be removed. We are upgrading the equipment to increase the band width.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Cynthia Corbett made a motion in the matter of the Verizon Wireless Installation, 74 Mitchell Street that the application be approved with the following conditions: Mounting hardware is to be painted a brick color up the brick line. Seconded by Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

8. **2018.054 LAKE LOCAL EXPANSION ADVISORY OPINION**, 550 Union Avenue, Advisory Opinion to the Planning Board (Architectural Review) on construction of multiple buildings within the Waterfront-Related Business District.

Applicant: 550 Union LLC

Agent: Mike Phinney, Principal Phinney Design;

Mr. Phinney provided a brief history of the site as well as a visual presentation including the 30 convenience boat slips for the restaurant and the pier. Also provided was the revised Master Plan of the Site showing full build out of the site. The Lake Local Restaurant, 10 unit Bed and Breakfast and the 25 cottages built into the hillside. Also we will be incorporating a convenience element in expanding the board shop and the existing house that would be used by the innkeeper. Mr. Phinney provided a visual concerning the proposed design, which is a rustic modern feel, wood, metal, stone, concrete and steel elements which are embracing the view of the lake. Simple clean interior with rustic elements will be featured throughout the project. The buildings and the landscape will be integrated. Three prominent trees currently exist on the site and will be undisturbed with this project. The building will be elevated by about 30 inches for aesthetics as well as stormwater management. Photographs of what the proposed project will mimic were shown to the Board for the restaurant and the bed and breakfast. The hillside is sloped and scrubby. We will tuck the cottages in and stabilize the slope. Green roofs will be installed on the cottages. This will help mitigate the stormwater management system. A large pavilion type feel, with an asymmetrical butterfly roof with solar panels. The project will be completed in phases. Phase 1 – the restaurant and site improvements, Phase 2 – cottages on the hill, Phase 3, the bed and breakfast.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Advisory Opinion to the Planning Board regarding the Lake Local Expansion, 550 Union Avenue stated following discussion on this matter on June 6, 2018, the Commission issues the following opinion: The design aesthetic is interesting and appears to be heading in the a positive direction. Mass and scale appears to be sensitive between the buildings. Positive material palette. Site plan challenges with vehicular traffic and access. Seconded by Chris Bennett.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

ADJOURNED APPLICATIONS:

2014.078 2 WEST HILL PLAZA EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS, 93-109 West Avenue, requested modification to Architectural Review approval within the Transect-5 Neighbor Center. No representation, tabled by the DRC.

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, June 12, 2018 at 5:00 P.M.

Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, June 20, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Steven Rowland, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:45 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED JULY 18, 2018