



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 20, 2018

7:00 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL ROOM

PRESENT: Steven Rowland, Chairman; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman; Richard Martin, Cynthia Corbett, Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett; Leslie Mechem

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Steven Rowland, Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Approval of meeting minutes was deferred to the July 18, 2018 Design Review Commission Meeting.

COMMENTS FROM THE CHAIR:

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated as of June 30, 2018 his term is due to expire. He has respectfully requested the Mayor not to reappoint him. He has been on the Commission for approximately 16 years and it is time to move on. He has offered to stay on until a suitable replacement has been found.

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **2018.056 YELLOW BOUTIQUE SIGNAGE**, 491 Broadway, Historic Review of signage within the Transect-6 District.
2. **2018.058 THE DARK HORSE MERCANTILE SIGNAGE**, 445 Broadway, Historic Review of signage within the Transect-6 District.
3. **2018.060 MEHERIO, LLC AWNINGS**, 53-55 Church Street. Architectural Review of awnings within the Transect-6 District.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1 through #3 on the Consent Agenda. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on the consent agenda items. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Yellow Boutique Signage, 491 Broadway, The Dark Horse Mercantile Signage, 445 Broadway, and Meherio, LLC Awnings, 53-55 Church Street, that the applications be approved as submitted. Richard Martin seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION:

1. **2017.118 DEVALL NEW CONSTRUCTION**, 59 Franklin Street, consideration for deferral of Lead Agency status to the Planning Board for a two-lot subdivision and new single-family residence within the Urban Residential-4 District.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the applicant has appeared before this Commission for an Advisory Opinion. It will return before this Commission for Historic Review. This is simply a deferral of Lead Agency Status to the Planning Board should the Commission choose to do so.

Steven Rowland, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the DeVall New Construction application, 59 Franklin Street that the Design Review Commission defers Lead Agency Status to the Planning Board should they seek it. Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

2. **2018.046 FINGERPAINT MARKETING OFFICES**, 1 Franklin Square, Historic Review of exterior modifications within the Transect-5 Urban Core District.

Applicant: Fingerpaint Marketing

Agent: Brett Balzer, Balzer Tuck Architecture

Mr. Balzer stated since our last appearance before the Commission on June 6, 2018 we had a site visit by the Commission. There is nothing more to add to the application. Does the Commission have any further questions.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the impression he came away with was several members of the Commission were trying to save the doors in place and restore them. There was no major exception by the Commission to adding glass to them. Is your client receptive to this recommendation.

Mr. Balzer stated yes his client was receptive to the recommendation.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated we can move forward with the application. There was no concern over the elimination of the other door. Our focus was on the main entry doors to be restored and the addition of the glass panels.

Mr. Balzer stated there was a small addition to the application which was presented at the applicant's last appearance before the Commission for the addition of the handicap access around the back of the building and modification to the columns.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development requested this information be provided to staff for inclusion in the file.

Mr. Balzer stated he will provide the requested information.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated basically the applicant can keep it as a sidewalk all the way around. This will not be considered a ramp which requires handrails all around. By constructing it this way it is more sensitive to the building. The Commission felt it was a good approach.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Fingerpaint Marketing Offices, 1 Franklin Square that the application be approved including the addition of the handicapped sidewalk with the following conditions:

-that the main entry door is to be restored and to remain in place with the addition of glass panels.

Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

Mr. Balzer thanked the Chair for his years of service and his fair and objective opinions.

3. **2014.078 2 WEST HILL PLAZA EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 93-109 West Avenue, requested modification to Architectural Review approval within the Transect-5 Neighbor Center.

Agent: Keith Cramer, Architect; Larry Guiles, Contractor

Mr. Cramer stated the applicant has been before the Commission several times over the last several years with proposals changing somewhat each time. Our main design is changing from concrete block to stucco. When the contractor began work on the facades of the building there was nothing behind the concrete block. A visual of the proposed project was provided to the Commission.

Mr. Guiles stated there is no structure behind it. If concrete board was installed with stucco the building would sag. That is the reason for proposing the metal roof.

Mr. Cramer stated there were many weak spots doors and windows had no headers no substance behind the covering once removed.

Steven Rowland, Chairman questioned the signage with the use of the metal roof.

Mr. Guiles stated with the metal roof attaching the signage is easier. Mr. Guiles explained the standing seam metal roof and the other properties in the area that are all using standing seam and attaching signage through the standing seam channel. Lighting was also discussed.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the proposed standing seam roof.

Mr. Cramer stated they will provide corrected information regarding the roofing for the file. Apparently the wrong sample was included with the application.

Richard Martin spoke regarding the proposed standing seam roofing. He stated he would like to see a sample.

The applicant's agent will return before the Commission with a sample of the roofing material.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the application will be tabled until the applicant's agent returns with a roofing sample.

4. **2018.055 STAY SARATOGA POOL**, 198 South Broadway, Architectural Review of an in ground pool within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center.

Applicant: Steven Chindamo, owner

Mr. Chindamo provided a visual of the proposed site for the Commission and the location of the proposed pool and the fencing associated with the pool.

Chris Bennett questioned the closeness of the pool to the street.

Mr. Chindamo stated about 15 feet to the street. The pool is located in this area due to the constraints of the site and the rooms. Mr. Chindamo stated this will be an above ground pool. There is no additional property for sale in the area.

Leslie Mechem questioned the handicap accessibility with an above ground pool.

Mr. Chindamo stated then a deck will need to be installed with a ramp.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated she feels very strongly that an above ground pool on South Broadway is not appropriate.

Leslie Mechem stated she agrees the pool must be in ground, how does this affect the parking.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development encouraged the applicant to appear before the Planning Board for Site Plan Review especially with the parking. They can provide guidance on inground versus above ground. The Commission is interested in more details regarding fencing and landscaping in the South Broadway corridor. There is currently a lot of proposed rejuvenation in this corridor and the Commission wishes to ensure that this is consistent with all the new development.

Mr. Chindamo stated the parking spaces would be adequate and their location is fine.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development reiterated the applicant needs to provide additional information concerning the dimensions, the loss of parking, and ADA compliance with deck. These are building code issues.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated there are parking changes in this proposal which needs to be reviewed with the Planning Board.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development provided assistance to the applicant concerning how to proceed with his application and suggested he obtain professional assistance perhaps a landscape architect in proceeding with his application through the City process and obtaining the necessary approvals. The Commission is unable to proceed with this application.

Tabled – owner needs to appear before the Planning Board for site plan approval.

3. **2014.078 2 WEST HILL PLAZA EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 93-109 West Avenue, requested modification to Architectural Review approval within the Transect-5 Neighbor Center.

Agent: Keith Cramer, Architect; Larry Guiles, Contractor

Mr. Cramer provided the sample of the standing seam roof to the Commission.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the concrete block stays.

Richard Martin questioned staff as to what was proposed by the applicant in an earlier submission which the Commission based their approval upon.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the first Mr. Cramer stated the standing seam roof is proposed. The vertical portion of it was stucco. They are now asking for standing seam construction.

Mr. Cramer stated it was metal in the middle and stucco on the top.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated there really are no changes other than extending the standing seam up the vertical.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the tower changed.

Mr. Cramer stated we put standing seam on the top instead of stucco on the top.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated originally it was brick to stone.

Mr. Cramer stated it was brick originally and we then put the stone on.

Bradley Birge, Administrator Planning and Economic Development stated they changed the color of the block.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated the concrete block stays. Then a panel of standing seam in the middle and standing seam on the wall and the roof.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated you will have the standing seam with large W.

Mr. Cramer stated they will have a Large W on a flat panel 3x5 in size painted on the green, so it won't be protruding out of the building.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the standing seam roofing on the tower.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the W cannot exceed 2 feet in height.

Mr. Cramer stated the panel is 3x5 and the W will be 2 feet in height.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the proposed signage.

Richard Martin stated he is struggling with the flat pane and the depth and dimension creativity. The flat W does not impress me. I am not sure it is appropriate. Maybe when it is finished out. Mr. Martin suggested the Commission visit the site and look at it prior to making a decision.

Mr. Cramer stated he will have the sign company provide information to the Commission regarding the proposed signage.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding making a site visit. It was the consensus of the Commission to visit the site on caravan scheduled for June 26, 2018 at 5 P.M. The application is tabled pending a site visit.

5. **2018.054 EXCELSIOR PARK PHASE 2-A BUILDINGS 2-3**, Gibson & Whistler Cts. Architectural Review of a residential townhomes within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Applicant: John Witt

Mr. Witt stated they are before the Commission for approval for Buildings 2 and 3. Building #2 is a 4 family townhouse and Building #3 is a standalone town home which the Commission has seen in the past. A visual of the original concept plan was provided for the Commission's review. Mr. Witt provided a review of the buildings and all elevations and the site as

well. The only thing different is a gable was added the front of one of the buildings to set them a little bit apart. Building #2 the front of the building has the stone, and the back has stone, but the side which drops off to the wetland area does not have stone. The same type of materials as the other buildings and the same colors which were previously approved.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated his one comment is the main facades of these buildings are screaming to be symmetrical. His recommendation is to keep them symmetrical. Other than the gable and the shed and the eyebrow they are mirror images and it seems to me to keep them symmetrical. It seems odd to just change it in some minor locations.

Steven Rowland, Chairman stated his eye keeps being drawn to the second floor south elevation porch railing. His suggestion would be to add additional posts on that railing. It looks awkward to have them centered over the doors. This is a simple change which helps balance it out a little better. All elevations were reviewed with the Commission.

Mr. Witt provided a visual of Building #3 which is a standalone unit. The entrance is on the side with the shed roof. We put a shed roof off this and created the entrance. The building is a 3 story tall building. It tucks behind Building #2. View of all elevations was provided to the Commission. This building is all board and batten, stucco and Hardie plank siding. Same as the other buildings. We want it to look a little different.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Chris Bennett stated concerning the symmetry look of the buildings and also it could be built the way it was presented.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated she likes the symmetrical look of the buildings but it could be built the way it was presented.

Richard Martin made a motion in the matter of the Excelsior Park Phase 2A – Final for buildings 2 & 3, Gibson and Whistler Courts that the application be approved with the following condition – that the applicant add additional posts on the second floor (south) elevation of Building #2 to the porch railing. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Steven Rowland, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Steven Rowland, Chairman, in favor; Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Richard Martin, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, July 10, 2018 at 5:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, July 18, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Steven Rowland, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:30 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 9-5-18 4-0 TEhinger; LDiCarlo; CBennett; LMechem