



# DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

## MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, JULY 1, 2020

6:30 P.M.

ZOOM WEBINAR

**PRESENT:** Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Leslie Mechem; Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett; Rob DuBoff; Ellen Sheehan

**STAFF:** Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

**CALL TO ORDER:** Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:20 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

### **A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:**

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the minutes of the June 17, 2020 DRC meeting with minor corrections. Rob DuBoff seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

### **VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 6-0**

### **B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:**

The intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be “approvable” without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the “consent agenda” and dealt with individually.

1. **20200369 POORE FENCE**, 72 Clinton Avenue, Historic Review of a fence within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated this is a 6 foot fence in the front yard setback. She has concerns regarding a 6 ft privacy fence on a prominent corner. Are there plans to redevelop this site?

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated it is her understanding this is being proposed as a temporary fence.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development provided background information. This property was before the DRC previously for demolition. The Commission approved the demolition of this property. As presented to staff the owners have indicated they do have redevelopment desires and have indicated a short term use of the property.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned the Commission to determine if there were any questions or concerns. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Poore Fence, 72 Clinton Avenue, involving Historic Review of a fence, that the application be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 6-0**

**C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION**

1. **20200304 CITIZEN'S BANK SIGNAGE**, 1 Ballston Avenue, Architectural Review of freestanding Signage, within the Transect-5 Urban Neighborhood Center District.

Applicant: Citizen's Bank

Agent: Terry Meissner, Saxton Signs

Mr. Meissner stated the applicant proposed a 6'12 x 5'5 monument with a double sided 3' x 5' internally lit LED sign.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned the applicants agent regarding another version of the monument sign provided to the Commission which was 4' in height.

Mr. Meissner stated the second option would be 4'x 3'9 monument base with a 3'6 x 3' double sided internally lit LED sign.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman noted the 4' monument sign would be more appropriate for this area.

Discussion ensued among the Board with regard to the amount of signage on this site and the lighting proposed. It was the consensus of the Commission the applicant lights the sign with dim, soft LED lighting.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development provided information to the Commission regarding what the Zoning Ordinance allows which is placement of a wall sign on each frontage. What is proposed is permissible. The wall signs were approved at a previous meeting of the DRC.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Citizen's Bank Freestanding Sign, 1 Ballston Avenue, that the application be approved with the following conditions – the applicant will build a 4 foot monument sign with dim/soft LED lights. Ellen Sheehan seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor; Chris Bennett in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 6-0**

**2. 20200340 BRISCOE EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS, 219 Washington Street, Architectural Review of exterior renovations within the Urban Residential-2 District.**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the project is located in an Architectural Review District, but is a contributing building to the West Side Historic District and is listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

Applicant: Gina and Garth Briscoe/Dan Phillips

Ms. Briscoe stated they are before the Commission for approval for exterior modifications to this site. They are proposing the restoration of as much of the original portions of the home as possible. The slate roof will remain; however, it is in need of repair. We intend to retain as many of the defining features of the home. The open fascia, the soffits open with the frieze boards will be restored. All the porch elements will be restored. We are proposing to open the side porch which was closed in at some point. We do not have all the balustrades that are needed for the railing in the front. We will take some from the side porch to repair the front and build new railings to match the second floor side porch. We are proposing vinyl double hung windows in black and new white vinyl siding. New doors are proposed which will be black to match the new windows. We are also proposing to remove the addition on the home which is deteriorated. It is not connected to the main home and it is falling off. We met with the Building Department and they informed us there was never a CO issued for this addition and they noted it needed to be removed. We are also proposing a new heating system and are requesting to remove the current chimney on the house which is no longer needed.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a wonderful project and we are very pleased to see this property being rehabilitated.

Rob DuBoff stated he is not concerned about the removal of the chimney. He questioned the applicant regarding what exists under the current vinyl siding. Also, regarding the windows would the applicant considered a vinyl clad wood window.

Mr. Phillips stated it is an asbestos type of siding under the current siding. There is vinyl siding on portions of the house and aluminum on portions of the house. Removal of the asbestos siding is cost prohibitive at this time. The windows being proposed are consistent with the neighborhood.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman spoke regarding the location of the home and as noted this project is in an Architectural Review District but is a contributing building to the West Side Historic District and listed on the National Register. Vinyl windows would not be appropriate or approvable and there may be options and we will discuss those. The vinyl siding is considered replacement in kind. It is fine by the City's design standards; however, perhaps the applicant could consider upgrading the siding.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development provided information to the Commission with regard to their purview over materials and the City's design standards in Historic and Architectural Review districts.

Chris Bennett stated he appreciates the rehab of this beautiful building. The front porch balustrades can be replicated. He provided information to the applicant regarding a source. The proposed vinyl replacement windows are not appropriate for this project. The applicant would be fine with replacement sashes and tracks which are compatible to the vinyl can be found and used in the original windows. Vinyl siding is not a compatible design product. Perhaps the applicant would consider cement board siding or smart siding.

Discussion ensued among the Commission with the applicant regarding removal of asbestos siding.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated she would like to echo how excited the Foundation is to see this building get some much needed attention. She noted correspondence was forwarded to the Commission noting no concern with the removal of the chimney. She is however concerned regarding the proposed vinyl windows. Ms. Bosshart spoke regarding retaining the center window on the first floor and possible use of wood windows on the front façade. The Foundation recommends that the doors be made of wood to be in-keeping with its original historic appearance. Information was provided to the applicant regarding an architectural parts warehouse in Albany which could be of help in locating salvaged wood doors. Also, as noted in her correspondence she provided information regarding the New York State Historic Homeowner Tax Credits which the applicants may wish to explore.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated in light of the comments from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation would the applicants consider replacing the front façade windows with an aluminum clad or wood product to allow the front façade to reflect the original historic quality of the home.

The applicants stated this is a good compromise.

Rob DuBoff spoke regarding the front first floor window which he believes is not original to the home. He questioned what type of window the applicants are proposing for that location.

Ms. Briscoe stated originally they were proposing a picture window with two small double hung windows on each side which is what currently exists. They could replace the window with two double hung windows to match the second story windows.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation questioned the two over one window configuration in the application. The windows historically were in a one over one or two over two configurations. She has no objection to the two windows to align with the second floor windows. and it is the Foundation's recommendation the replacement be of the same configuration.

Ms. Briscoe agreed the two double hung windows would look nice. She voiced concern regarding the ability to obtain two wood doors to match at the salvage warehouse.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

Ellen Sheehan made a motion in the matter of the Briscoe Exterior Modifications, 219 Washington Street the Design Review Commission issues the following decision that the application be approved with the following conditions: the front façade windows will be aluminum clad or wood. The front porch windows will be replaced with two double hung windows to align with the two second floor windows above. Windows will be in a two over two configuration. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor; Chris Bennett opposed

**MOTION PASSES: 5-1**

3. **20200357 15 ROCK LLC EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 15 Rock Street, Architectural Review of exterior renovations within the Urban Residential-2 District.

Agent: Ben Karlin, Cotler Architecture; Bill Keefer, Construction Manager

Mr. Karlin provided a brief overview of the project. They are proposing to renovate and bring this property up to code while maintaining the historic character of the building. They are proposing changing the windows to meet code for egress. Replacing old exterior doors and adding a new entry door, replacing old deteriorating decks. Vinyl siding will be replaced with Hardie Board siding. Aesthetically, we are cleaning up the exterior of this 1867 home. Four basement windows will be replaced on the east elevation also for emergency egress purposes. An additional window will be added for the Unit #1 kitchen, adding a new entrance for property unit separation and the addition of two additional double doors on the east elevation for better accessibility. Visual images of the site were provided to the Commission. They have been in contact with the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. The presentation is the applicant's best efforts to meet code and navigate some of the internal anomalies in the structure. The decks will be replaced with pressure treated composite materials.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a great home and wonderful to see work being done on it. It is in an Architectural Review District but is a historic home. We are in receipt of a letter from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation noting concerns with the sliding glass door on the east elevation, sizes of the windows on the west side and the composite decking.

Mr. Karlin stated regarding the sliding door on the east elevation, they are proposing to use French doors in this location.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission.

Chris Bennett questioned if the applicant is changing the size of the deck and what are the current materials for the deck. the proposed materials for the railing system.

Mr. Keefer stated the deck will remain the same size. All the current decking is pressure treated. We are proposing some sort of synthetic railing system.

Chris Bennett suggested the applicant power wash the current decking, stain it and install a new black wrought iron aluminum railing system. This would be very cost effective and far easier.

Mr. Keefer stated he feels the structure of the decking is inferior and in poor shape.

Rob DuBoff questioned the E-1 elevation porch being rebuilt.

Mr. Keefer stated the second floor porch is dilapidated and the drop behind the fascia and the roofing needs to be replaced along with the screening. The railing systems will remain the same. Basically remove the rotted structural elements and replace in kind.

Leslie Mechem questioned the deck. The railing juts out and does not seem in keeping with the original house. Will this be adjusted to conform better to the house?

Mr. Karlin stated this is an area and the goal is to create a more compelling creation of elements in this renovation. What they are proposing is a black aluminum railing system. The decking is proposed to be of a real composite material. Trex composite solid wood grain to give a mahogany effect.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated she enjoyed speaking with Ben and Bill and receiving some clarification on the project. She voiced concerns regarding the west elevation full length window next to the porch. The size of the window to the left of the side floor porch should be in keeping with the adjacent historic window openings and remain a full size window.

Mr. Keefer stated they can make adjustments to the interior so it will appear as a full size window. The windows to the left of the porch on the upper level will be modified to meet code regulations.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of 15 Rock LLC Exterior Modifications, 15 Rock Street that the application be approved with the following conditions – the deck rail should be constructed of aluminum; E-1 window will remain full height, French doors instead of proposed slider. Approved as per plans as submitted this evening. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor; Chris Bennett in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 6-0**

**UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:**

Design Review Commission Caravan, Wednesday, July 7, 2020 at 5:00 P.M.  
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, July 15, 2020 at 6:30 P.M.

**MOTION TO ADJOURN:**

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:50 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski  
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 8-5-20