



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, JULY 18, 2018

7:00 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL ROOM

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman; Karen Cavotta; Steven Rowland, Alternate;
Chris Bennett; Rob Duboff; Cynthia Corbett; Leslie Mechem

ABSENT: Leslie DiCarlo

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. ELECTION OF OFFICERS:

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development conducted the election of officers.

Leslie Mechem made a motion for nomination of Tamie Ehinger for the Office of Chairman of the Design Review Commission. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor;
Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob Duboff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion for nomination of Karen Cavotta for the Office of Vice Chairman of the Design Review Commission. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor;
Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob Duboff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

COMMENTS FROM THE CHAIR:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman welcomed new Commission member Rob DuBoff. Rob comes to the Commission with a degree in Historic Preservation. He has been involved in numerous organizations and has been a big contributor in terms of the scope of Preservation in the State of New York. We welcome you.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman welcomed new Vice Chairman Karen Cavotta. Karen has been a Commission member in the past as well as an alternate for several years. Karen has a background in architecture and we welcome her back.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman also thanked Steven Rowland, for his 16 years of service to the DRC and the City. The Mayor had previously presented a proclamation to Steve. For those who could not attend the ceremony, Tamie Ehinger, Chairman Read the proclamation in its entirety for the record.

B. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Leslie Mechen made a motion to approve the minutes of the June 6, 2018 DRC Meeting with minor edits. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, abstained; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob Duboff, abstained; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 5-0

C. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **2018.065 URBAN ROOTS SIGNAGE**, 46 Marion Avenue, Architectural Review of 2 wall signs within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.
2. **2018.005 ATC SIGNAGE**, 33 Marion Avenue, Architectural Review of signage within the Tourist Related Business District.
3. **2018.021 ATC SIGNAGE**, 115 South Broadway, Architectural Review of signage within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.
4. **2018.069 PIG N WHISTLE AWNINGS**, 352 Broadway, Historic Review of replacement awnings within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Commission member Chris Bennett stated he had some concerns with regard to the color of the proposed awning.

THIS AGENDA ITEM REMOVED FROM CONSENT AGENDA TO REGULAR AGENDA.

5. **2018.061 EDWARD JONES INVESTMENT SIGNAGE**, 53 Spring Street, Historic Review of a 2 wall signs within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1, #2, #3, and #5 on the Consent Agenda. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Urban Roots Signage, 46 Marion Avenue; ATC Signage, 33 Marion Avenue; ATC Signage, 115 South Broadway, Edward Jones Investment Signage, 53 Spring Street, that these applications be approved as submitted. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

D. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION:

4. **2018.069 PIG N WHISTLE AWNINGS**, 352 Broadway, Historic Review of replacement awnings within the Transect-6 Urban Core District. REMOVED FROM CONSENT AGENDA TO REGULAR AGENDA

Applicant: Scott Solomon

Mr. Solomon stated they are taking the current awning down and will replace it with the new awning. The structure will remain.

Steven Rowland, Alternate questioned if the applicant had a sample of the proposed awning.

Mr. Solomon stated the new awning is red with stripes. He can provide a sample but not this evening.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated once the sample is provided it can be approved administratively.

Chris Bennett made a motion in the matter of the Pig N Whistle Awnings, 352 Broadway, that the application be approved as submitted with the following condition – the applicant is to submit a sample of the awning fabric to be approved Administratively. Steven Rowland, Alternate seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

6. **2018.062 GARY STONE COMPLIANCE**, 68 Weibel Avenue, consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency Status (Architectural Review) for a compliance plan relating to numerous unauthorized buildings and activities within the Transect -4 Urban Neighborhood District.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated this is a procedural item. The applicant has submitted an application with a compliance plan relating to numerous unauthorized buildings and activities on this site. This application will go before the Zoning Board of Appeals as well as the Planning Board. It is up to the Commission to either accept Lead Agency Status for SEQRA or defer to either the ZBA or the Planning Board.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Gary Stone Compliance, 68 Weibel Avenue, that the Design Review Commission defers Lead Agency Status for SEQRA to the Planning Board for this application. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

7. **2018.050 SWIATEK GARAGE ADDITION**, 63 Spring Street, Historic Review of a new 2-car garage with Breezeway within a Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Agent: Matt Hurff, Frost, Hurff Architects

Mr. Hurff stated this is a simple project. This is a single family residence. The owners are requesting a private garage. The location of the garage is dictated by previous site plan approval. We need to maintain the exact number of parking spaces we currently have. With the accessory structure we are trying to be respectful of the existing architecture so all materials will match the current home. The garage will have a full custom door in the carriage style. Cut sheets will be submitted for the file.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Board. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Cynthia Corbett made a motion in the matter of the Swiatek Garage Addition, 63 Spring Street, that the application be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

8. **2018.063 JPSMSC LLC SINGLE FAMILY & GARAGE**, 155 Union Avenue, Historic Review of a new single family house and detached garage within an Urban Residential-4 District.

Applicants: Scott Calendar, Steven MacIntyre

Mr. Calendar stated based on comments and suggestions of Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation, we have made some modifications based on these comments. The height of the structure was of concern. It was too high. So, we have changed the roof pitch and reduced the height of the structure by 4 feet. An octagonal window was added on the top to add some character. Under the triple window the double window has been centered as much as possible for better symmetry.

Chris Bennett questioned why the windows could not be centered.

Mr. Calendar stated it would cause some issues with the master bath location. Ms. Bosshart also did not like the brick which was proposed for the front porch. We have changed that to siding. Ms. Bosshart also commented on the columns. The columns are 10" in diameter and are floor to ceiling. The front door was not appropriate and it was changed to a door with 6 panel windows up on the top to match the windows.

Rob DuBoff spoke concerning the windows on the front façade, particularly the single window on the east side of the front façade and the lack of symmetry and rhythm with the window placements and sizes.

Discussion ensued among the Commission and the applicant concerning the window placements and fenestrations.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated as far as aligning the windows it would entail finessing the plans somewhat. The bigger issue is how the home presents itself to the street. Any home you enter on Union Avenue would not have a bathroom and laundry room facing this street. Most homes on Union Avenue would have been built to invite people into their homes, making this more of an entry space, not secondary space like a closet and bathroom. We really shouldn't be looking at bathrooms and closets in this location on Union Avenue. Those are things that should not be on Union Avenue.

It almost feels like the home is backwards. This is a grand beautiful street. Take a second and consider the value of having such a beautiful street, and you are basically turning your back to it.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding this home and its placement on Union Avenue.

Chris Bennett questioned if the applicant could extend the porch all the way across the front. The front of the home currently looks like a rear porch on Union Avenue. Columns and railings would help.

Steven Rowland, Alternate stated he agrees with Karen's sentiment. As an architect he is struggling with the back of the house being on the front and it creates some of the issues we are struggling with. This just does not work. It misses the mark on Union Avenue. This home will be there for a long time and it would be more appropriate to look at this from a bigger design perspective. I am not comfortable with the way this is presenting itself to Union Avenue. I think it needs more design thought and more attention in order to resolve some of the overall issues on the exterior. The exterior is being unduly influenced by what is happening on the inside.

Mr. Calendar stated we like the house and the footprint inside. If we can get the appearance which is achievable that is what we would like to focus on.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated the Commission's purview is the exterior, however, as we review the fenestrations we realize it is not working and reflects what is happening on the inside. Our goal, reviewing our standards for historic design and our guidelines we need to be sure the fenestrations are appropriate.

Rob DuBoff spoke regarding gable treatments on the home.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman spoke regarding the garage.

Rob DuBoff spoke regarding window sizes on the garage.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation thanked the applicant for listening to the suggestions and comments. To clarify the brick on the front of the proposed home looked like appliqué and shouldn't just be on the face of the structure. Concerning the gable, I echo Rob's sentiment. I question the trim and feel it is weak. We also had concerns about the garage rendering. We look forward to a new building on the site.

Mr. Calendar stated we have received many good recommendations and comments. We will revisit our plan and return.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the DRC uses the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation as a resource as well.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman spoke concerning the historic integrity of Union Avenue. This can be an arduous task. The end result will be a home that is very appropriate and fit in with the neighborhood. Perhaps the applicant would like to step back and review the comments and recommendations since they are valid points and then return before the Commission. The application was tabled.

9. 2018.067 TOOLE PORCH, 215 Regent Street, Historic Review of exterior modifications on an existing residential structure within an Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Robert Toole, owner

Mr. Toole stated he is the homeowner of this home for 45 years. He appears before the Commission tonight for historic review of exterior modifications of his front porch. The porch is in need of replacement and will be replaced in kind, same type of materials and colors. The element which brings me before the Commission is the replacement of the two wooden

columns with two fiberglass columns. Originally the roof material was tin plates which lock together. They have failed and need to be replaced. The roof is flat and cannot be seen from the street and will be replaced with an EDPM roof.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Toole Porch, 215 Regent Street that the application be approved as submitted. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

10. **2018.068 ISRAEL RESIDENCE**, 15-17 Franklin Street, Historic Review of exterior modifications on an existing residential structure within an Urban Residential-3 District.

RECUSAL:

Chris Bennett recused from this application.

Applicant: Bob Israel; Liz Israel; David Hayden

Ms. Israel stated they are providing updated drawings of the project since some items have changed since their initial submission. Ms. Israel provided some history of the home. During the demo of the home some hidden windows were found. Replacement of the windows will be 6 over 6 divided light wooden windows. These windows were approved by SHPO and are often used in historic preservation projects. There are a number of historic windows which will be restored. The door will be replaced with a historic door. A visual of the property was provided to the Commission with a review of all elevations.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is very admirable and what we look for in terms of an applicant. This is great to see.

Ms. Israel stated we will remove the siding and replace the crown moldings.

Steven Rowland, Alternate stated this is ambitious, the applicants are saving a gem. The Commission likes to see projects of this nature.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation thanked the applicant for saving this property. They are very excited about this project and it will make a huge impact on the property which has been long neglected.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Israel Residence, 15-17 Franklin Street that the application be approved with the following conditions - Commission approves option for French doors or 4/4 windows at the porch. The Commission approves either option for column materials for porch extension. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

Chris Bennett Commission member resumed his position.

11. **2018.059 40-42 PHILA STREET PATIO**, 42-42 Phila Street, Architectural Review exterior modifications, within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Agent: Sue Davis, SD Atelier Architecture

Ms. Davis stated the applicant is contemplating having a patio. They are proposing repainting the front of the building the same color as the side of the building, and request changing the areas on the building which are currently green to be painted black, even the window trims. They are also proposing a black awning. The applicant is requesting approval for a new door to be installed in the future where Creative Sparks is currently, but have incorporated it into this application. They are actually bringing back an original opening which was bricked up. The same goes for the other door which is proposed in the far corner set back. They want to enclose the patio with a 42" metal guard. They are proposing to maintain the tree that currently exists on the site placing a grate around it. Signage is to be relocated to the other side (for the Commission's information not to be completed at this time). Colored concrete is proposed on grade.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this seems like a straightforward application. The Commission is requesting cut sheets for railings, doors and awning material for the record.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Karen Cavotta made a motion in the matter of 40-42 Phila Street Patio, 40-42 Phila Street, that the application be approved with the following condition – the applicant will submit cut sheets for doors, railings and awning material. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

12. **2018.051 385 BROADWAY DEMOLITION & NEW CONSTRUCTION**, 385 Broadway, consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency (Historic Review) for the demolition and subsequent construction of a mixed use building within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman reiterated to the Commission that the application tonight is for consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency. The applicant will also provide a review of the project.

Agent: Mike Phinney, Principal Phinney Design Group; Dave Carr, Associate Principal, LA Group; Peter Rosencranz, Burns Management, Developer; Tom Newkirk

Mr. Carr stated their goal tonight is to present the project, and to start the SEQRA process. Through discussions with

staff there is some interest for the DRC to assume Lead Agency Status. We are requesting the Commission either request Lead Agency Status or defer. We are scheduled to appear before the Planning Board tomorrow evening. The Planning Board is the other involved agency. SHPO has signed off and documentation will be provided to the Lead Agent.

Mr. Phinney provided a visual of the proposed site and surrounding areas for context. The applicant is proposing the demolition of the current building and rebuilding a 5 story building in its place. Brick veneer with metal panels, strong store front demarcations. Several samples of where the inspiration for this building came from were provided. We are pulling back from the alleyway a fair distance. There will be one story covered parking. A retail area is proposed on the ground level. Streetscape improvements are proposed as well as some civic areas. A review of all elevations was provided to the Commission.

Mr. Phinney provided floor plans of the building noting some micro units, which will be unique to this area, which are fully furnished and approximately 350 square feet.. Other units will be one or two bedroom units. The mechanicals will be screened on the roof and not visible from other buildings. The roof will be a terraced roof, with greenery and plantings. This will be a nice amenity for the tenants as well as the neighbors. The green roof on the upper roof as well as the terraced roof will be a part of the stormwater management control. A schematic of the massing was provided to the Commission. Mr. Phinney described the types of materials they are considering for the project.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a big and exciting project. Additionally when we reviewed these plans on our caravan, mass and scale was something we noted we would focus on. I appreciate all that you are doing in terms of trying to reduce and offset the mass.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any comments from the Commission.

Steven Rowland, Alternate stated the direction this project is headed in is very appropriate. Buildings which exist there now are substandard and are not appropriate to the downtown area. What you have done in setting back those floors and creating those terraces helps to minimize the negative effect it could have on the buildings around it. It is a nice approach and seems appropriate.

Cynthia Corbett stated she is concerned about the building being boxed in, in the future e future being boxed in if ownership which surrounds it changes.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated if the applicant can create the illusion of this being two buildings connected by glass it would help diminish the mass.

Chris Bennett stated the concept is great however he will wait and see the product and how you put this all together.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

David Matheson, 18 Division Street, Lofts Apartments. He is concerned regarding access to the alley, and increased traffic congestion, trash removal and hopes this is taken into consideration.

John McDermott, resides in the Lofts. Tight access in the alleyway. Congestion is a worry as well as parking concerns. Staging areas during construction is a concern as well. Noise is also a concern.

Mark Favor, Lofts. Difficulty with access during construction. Noise is a concern.

Ted Winowski, resides in the Lofts. Access and traffic patterns. Alley access and congestion. Think about the things that affect your neighbors. This project will affect the views from our patios.

Randi McDermott, Resident of the Lofts. Micro units will attract a lot of young people. Perhaps several college students in these units. Partying on the rooftop terraces. This seems too congested and too unsafe.

Jim Brockman, Resident of the Lofts for about 2 years. I like my view from my terrace and all the architecture. How this will fit in with the architecture in the neighborhood.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated we are looking to establish SEQRA Lead Agent. As much as we typically do defer to the Planning Board for SEQRA we did discuss the possibility of the DRC becoming the Lead Agent. However, I would like to clarify, with all the issues that the public stated regarding noise, traffic and parking, fire lane access which are all aspects the Planning Board has purview over. After hearing this discussion I believe perhaps we should defer to the Planning Board.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the DRC has deferred to the Planning Board many times in the past. Guidelines do state that the Lead Agent should be the agency which has the broadest purview and the greatest breadth of knowledge. This site is constrained in a sense. There are no parking requirements in the T-6 zone. There are important issues to discuss in this application concerning SEQRA.

Cynthia Corbett stated she agrees with the Chairman concerning the important issues in the SEQRA analysis to be determined.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning Lead Agent for SEQRA.

Chris Bennett stated efficiency wise it seems the Planning Board would be the proper Lead Agency.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the 385 Broadway Demolition & New Construction 385 Broadway, that the Design Review Commission defer Lead Agency Status to the Planning Board. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, July 24, 2018 at 5:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, August 1, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Steven Rowland, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:55 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 9-5-18 5-0 TEhinger; KCavotta; CBennett; RDuboff; LMechem