



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 5, 2018

7:00 P.M.

CITY COUNCIL ROOM

RECEIVED
OCT 11 2018
ACCOUNTS DEPARTMENT

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Leslie DiCarlo;
Chris Bennett; Rob Duboff; Leslie Mechem

LATE ARRIVAL: Cynthia Corbett arrived at 7:16 P.M.

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the minutes of the June 20, 2018 Design Review Commission with minor edits. Rob Duboff seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 4-0

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the minutes of the July 18, 2018 Design Review Commission with minor edits. Rob Duboff seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor, Rob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 5-0

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the minutes of the August 1, 2018 Design Review Commission with minor edits. Rob Duboff seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 4-0

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **2012.011.4 CALIBER COLLISION SIGNAGE**, 2202 NYS Route 50, Architectural Review of signage within the Highway General Business District.
2. **2018.075 SOLEVO SIGNAGE**, 55 Phila Street, Architectural Review of a wall sign within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
3. **2018. 078 SOLEVO AWNINGS**, 55 Phila Street, Architectural Review of 2 awnings within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
4. **2018.040.1 DOMINOS SIGNAGE**, 86 Washington Street, Architectural Review of signage within The Urban Residential-3 District.
5. **2018.076 FAMILY DOLLAR SIGNAGE**, 246 West Avenue, Architectural Review of a wall sign within the Transect -5 Neighborhood Center District.
6. **2018.077 SUTTON & TARANTINO FAÇADE MODIFICATIONS**, 17-21 Division Street, Historic Review of façade modification (awnings, windows enlargement, and lighting) within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
7. **2018.070 SPRINT TELECOMMUNICATIONS ANTENNAS**, 174 West Avenue, Architectural Review of additional telecommunications antenna and associated equipment within the Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1 through #7 on the Consent Agenda. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on the consent agenda items. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Caliber Collision Signage, 2202 NYS Rte 50; Solevo Signage, 55 Phila Street; Solevo Awnings, 55 Phila Street; Dominos Signage, 86 Washington Street, Family Dollar Signage, 246 West Avenue; Sutton Commercial Façade Modifications, 17-21 Division Street; Sprint Telecommunications Antennas, 174 West Avenue, that the applications be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION:

1. **2018.079 INGRAM PORCH**, 10 Madison Avenue, Historic Review of replacement materials for an existing porch within the Urban Residential-1 District.

Applicants: Margie Ingram & Joel Goodman

The applicants are proposing the existing porch be removed and replaced. The current porch is wood and is rotting. The applicants are requesting Trex flooring in the same color as the current porch flooring. The railings will remain wood and the posts will be capped. This application is for replacement of the front and rear porches.

Leslie DiCarlo questioned if this was a historic home.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is not a historic home but is in a historic district.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of the Ingram Porch, 10 Madison Avenue, that the application be approved as submitted and shown on the attached plans. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

2. **2018.006 15 BALLSTON AVENUE EXPANSION**, 15 Ballston Avenue, Architectural Review of an expansion of an existing structure within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Applicant: Jim Dorsey

Agent: Bob Flansburg, Dreamscapes Unlimited

Mr. Flansburg stated he has some new renderings for the Commission to review. The applicant has made some changes. There is less mass. The peak has been lowered by 4 feet. A composite view of the project was provided to the Commission noting the view of the retaining wall and the height being reduced; it will be poured concrete and will be several inches in height. A visual presentation of the site was provided showing all elevations.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman spoke regarding the entryway and the fact that it does not look like a main entrance, but more like an exit stairway.

Mr. Flansburg spoke regarding the entry stairs and the black railings and provided a sample of the entry doors.

Leslie DiCarlo stated she agrees that it does not look like a main entrance.

Chris Bennett suggested the black banding on the building continue around the building by the main entryway.

Discussion ensued regarding the main entry doors.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the application has come a long way. The Commission thanks the applicant for working with them on this project.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned the color palette, if it is remaining stark white and black. Also, what is being considered for the lighting materials as well as the fencing.

Mr. Flansburg provided a visual of the proposed fencing and stated the windows are Pella black aluminum clad simulated divided light.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Board. None heard.

Mr. Flansburg questioned if the Commission had any objections to vote on final approval of this project.

Chris Bennett stated this elevation was a sticking point.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated she still does not feel comfortable with the proximity to the street. If it was pushed back further it would be better. This is setting a precedent in that area.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated 0-12 is the range in that area.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the 15 Ballston Avenue Expansion – Final Approval 15 Ballston Avenue, that the application be approved with the following conditions: Per the revised renderings dated 09/05/18 to be submitted for the record. Those revised renderings note the height of the Ballston Avenue façade has been lowered by 4 feet from the face of the building and the clerestory to be shown on the existing gable roof. Window wells will be reduced to 4 feet from the face of the building. Floor banding at the entry to be black to match the entry stairs. Applicant will submit an application for signage at a later date. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

4. **2018.071 MOTOHOLDINGS SINGLE FAMILY**, 77 South Franklin/Cobb Alley-Lot A, Historic Review of a new single family house within an Urban Residential-3 District.
5. **2018.071 MOTOHOLDINGS SINGLE FAMILY**, 77 South Franklin/Cobb Alley-Lot B, Historic Review of a new single family house within an Urban Residential-3 District.
6. **2018.071 MOTOHOLDINGS SINGLE FAMILY**, 77 South Franklin/Cobb Alley-Lot C, Historic Review of a new single family house within an Urban Residential-3 District.
7. **2018.071 MOTOHOLDINGS SINGLE FAMILY**, 77 South Franklin/Cobb Alley-Lot D, Historic Review of a new single family house within an Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Tony Dawson

Agent: Art Pakatar, Stonehenge Associates

This project is the current site of the recycling center. There are 4 lots. The Zoning Board of Approval issued variances to build 4 single family homes on these lots. Floor plans were submitted. Buildings on lots A, B and C are very similar. Lot D which is on the corner of South Franklin and Cobb Alley has a detached garage and is different.

Mr. Pakatar stated these are smaller homes using most of the site. They are 3 bedroom homes with the bedrooms upstairs. These homes fit with the flavor of the general neighborhood. We are proposing quality Board and Batten and vinyl siding for these homes. Board and Batten will be used on the first and second floor. On the first floor it will be horizontally installed

and the second floor will be installed vertically. Cedar shakes will be installed in the gable. A Dutch hip roof is proposed and Anderson Craftsman style windows. The back will be the same as the sides of the home.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned if vinyl is appropriate for this neighborhood. The historic district does run on one side of the road in this area.

Cynthia Corbett stated these are on the alley, they are supposed to be carriage houses. They are too ornate, the simpler the better.

Discussion ensued regarding the guidelines among the Commission members and the applicant.

Leslie DiCarlo stated these look like suburban homes, not homes that are in a City or on an alley or urban. An opportunity is being lost to do something with the design, something more fitting for a cluster of modest houses in an unusual setting.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated that what we are asking is for the applicant to go back to review the details. The floor plans presented have maximized the space and they work. What we are saying is that we would like the materials to match up with those around it.

Mr. Dawson spoke regarding the proposed homes and what is being proposed and possibly reworking trims, etc. However, he did state there is a small window of time to begin with foundations before frost.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated we will continue with our review of Lot A. There were some comments regarding the columns.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated she can appreciate the scale of the buildings especially the height. She spoke about the porch roof elevation as well as the layers of materials, clapboard, board and batten and shakes. The top of this home appears to be squishing the windows. Perhaps traditional or simpler columns. Second floor windows should be centered.

Mr. Pakatar stated Lot B is very similar to Lot A. It does show some stone on the lower level. It has the same floor plan as Lot A.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the Dutch Hip roof is removed on the front elevation on Lot B.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the changes to Lot B are the Dutch Hip Roof is removed from this plan.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated she likes the appeal of using two materials on the Lot B home.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated Lot C is the same as the Lot A home. Lot D is different it has a detached garage and faces Henry Street.

It was the consensus of the Commission that larger columns could be used on this home due to the fact that it faces a street.

Cynthia Corbett stated she would like to see the windows all be the same, two over two.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman spoke regarding the window in the gable end. It is either too small or shouldn't be a divided light window.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated she likes the windows in the gable. The garage and alleys windows are okay as well.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the applicant is looking for Mass and Scale approval this evening to pursue a building permit. The approval will be for Mass and Scale only in order for the applicant to apply for a building and demolition permit.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Motoholdings Single Family, 77 South Franklin/Cobb Alley-Lot A, that the application to be approved for Mass and Scale only to allow applicant to obtain a demolition and building permit giving the ability to pour foundations. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, opposed; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-1

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Motoholdings Single Family, 77 South Franklin/Cobb Alley-Lot B, that the application to be approved for Mass and Scale only to allow applicant to obtain a demolition and building permit giving the ability to pour foundations. Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, opposed; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-1

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Motoholdings Single Family, 77 South Franklin/Cobb Alley-Lot C, that the application be approved for Mass and Scale only to allow applicant to obtain a demolition and building permit giving the ability to pour foundations. Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, opposed; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-1

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Motoholdings Single Family, 77 South Franklin/Cobb Alley-Lot D, that the application to be approved for Mass and Scale only to allow applicant to obtain a demolition and building permit giving the ability to pour foundations. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, September 11, 2018 at 5:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, September 19, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:35 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 10-3-18

TEhinger, in favor; LDicarlo, in favor; RDuboff, in favor; LMechem, in favor; CCorbett, in favor