



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 16, 2020

6:30 P.M.

ZOOM WEBINAR

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Leslie Mechem; Leslie DiCarlo; Rob DuBoff; Ellen Sheehan

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

LATE ARRIVAL: Chris Bennett arrived at 6:35 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 6:32 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Approval of meeting minutes was deferred to the October 7, 2020 Design Review Commission meeting.

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

The intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be “approvable” without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the “consent agenda” and dealt with individually.

1. **20200504 BREAD BASKET SIGNAGE**, 65 Spring Street, Historic Review of replacement signage within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
2. **20200596 GOLDEN TIGER TATTOO SIGNAGE**, 72 Henry Street, Architectural Review of a new wall sign within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.
3. **20200594 WHITMAN BREWING COMPANY ENTRANCE DOOR**, 20 Lake Avenue Architectural Review of an exterior modification within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Bread Basket Signage, 65 Spring Street, Golden Tiger Tattoo Signage, 72 Henry Street, and the Whitman Brewing Company Entrance Door, 20 Lake Avenue that the applications be approved as submitted. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 5-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

NOTE:

Chris Bennett assumed his position on the Commission at 6:35 P.M.

1. **20200504 250 EXCELSIOR AVENUE SIGNAGE**, 250 Excelsior Avenue, Architectural Review of wall and freestanding signage within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

No representation for this agenda item. This item was tabled to end of the agenda applications.

2. **20200533 276 WASHINGTON STREET EXTERIOR**, 276 Washington Street, Architectural Review of exterior modifications within the Urban Residential-1 District.

Applicant Dean Doin

Mr. Doin stated they are proposing to replace the roof and siding on the home, as well as new railings on the front porch. A visual of the site was provided for the Commission's review.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated in reviewing this application it seems very straightforward. The property is in an Architectural Review District and is located quite far out on Washington Street.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments for the applicant from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the application of 276 Washington Street Exterior, 276 Washington Street that the application be approved as submitted. Ellen Sheehan seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

3. **20200567 STEVENS ROOF REPLACEMENT**, 172 Circular Street, Historic Review of exterior modifications within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Kim Stevens

Ms. Stevens stated she originally applied to have a new slate roof placed on this historic home. However, that is out of her budget and she is now proposing a new roof with a metal slate product. Samples of the product were provided to the Commission. Currently this home has asphalt shingles which are leaking, and the roof needs to be replaced. The standing seam roofing from the bottom edge to the overhangs will be standing seam in matte red to match the north side of the house. The valleys and the crests will be standing seam in the matte red.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated Mr. Birge has some samples of the new product.

Ms. Stevens provided photographs of various homes in the area which currently have this product as well as current and historic photographs of her home.

Ellen Sheehan stated she drove to the home site in Ballston Spa which is currently using this product. It looks quite different in person than in the photographs. It has a very faux look to it. It will cheapen the look of the applicant's very beautiful home.

Rob DuBoff stated Ms. Stevens home is one of the finest examples of craftsman architecture in the town. It is a great house. He also visited the Ballston Spa Home site and feels it reads almost plastic. It is very faux. A suggestion was given to the applicant to research a product called TruSlate. It is a slate product but is far less expensive.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated there are architectural shingles that do resemble slate.

Leslie DiCarlo agrees with Ellen and Rob's comments.

Chris Bennett stated he has seen this product in application. It is an interesting product and he agrees with Ellen and Rob.

Ms. Stevens stated she will review the other product suggested.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman suggested the applicant make a visit to Allerdice Hardware.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated we will table this application this evening. We will await the applicant's further investigation and choice of product.

20200504 250 EXCELSIOR AVENUE SIGNAGE, 250 Excelsior Avenue, Architectural Review of wall and freestanding signage within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

No representation for this agenda item. The Chair tabled this application this evening. This agenda item will be placed on the agenda for the next DRC Meeting scheduled for October 7, 2020.

- 4. 20200583 BYRNE EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 203 Church Street, Architectural Review of exterior modifications within the Office Medical Business-2 District.

Agent: Tonya Yasenchak, Engineering America

Ms. Yasenchak stated the applicant is proposing to renovate the building for their law office. We have approvals to renovate the interior. A variance has been obtained from the ZBA due to the proximity to the property line. We do need to make this handicapped accessible. A visual of the site was provided noting the location of the ADA ramp along the west side of the structure leading to the attached front porch. This will be constructed of wood with a black aluminum railing system. It is quite simple and will blend in with the surroundings. We are proposing to remove the current aluminum siding, fixing and repairing the wood siding beneath. We are also proposing removal of the door on the west side as well and replace that with a wood window. We are proposing copper roofing on the porch roof as well as copper snow slides. We are also proposing to replace the slate roof with a new roof. The overgrown shrubs will be removed. Ms. Yasenchak provided proposed elevation drawings of the ADA ramp. Regarding the roof, there has been leakage for some time. Attempts to repair the slate roof have proven unsuccessful since there is substantial breakage and the slate shingles are too brittle. A video of the attempted roof repair and shingle condition was provided to the Commission. It is not salvageable. We are not in a Historic District but an entry into the City and we would like to replace the roof with a new material. Either an architectural shingle or some type of slate looking shingle is proposed. Examples were provided to the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is in an Architectural Review District. The property itself is listed in the National Historic Register, so Secretary of the Interior Standards would apply.

Leslie DiCarlo questioned if any Commission member has experience with the Borel product. She voiced concern over the use of the term slate when referring to new products when in fact they are not slate.

Chris Bennett stated he is not familiar with the Borel synthetic roofing. He is familiar with other Borel synthetic products and feels these are great products. He does feel the slate roof does need to come off this building.

Rob DuBoff stated he did visit the house site and it does appear the slate roofing is in bad shape. He is opposed to the Borel synthetic product. He suggested the applicant consider the TruSlate product which is a slate product and is less expensive than regular slate. He does feel the chimney should stay since it is an important architectural element.

Leslie Mechem stated kudos to the preserving the wood and removing the aluminum. Regarding the roofing the applicant should choose something that looks as close as possible to slate.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated as per their correspondence the Foundation does advocate in kind replacement. She echoes the fact that the chimney should be preserved. They are excited about the siding.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated following the discussion it is the consensus of the Commission that the restoration work being completed on this home is appropriate. The only item in question is the material to be used for the replacement of the slate roof.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding moving this application forward for the applicant.

Ellen Sheehan made a motion in the matter of the Byrne Exterior Modifications, 203 Church Street, application be approved with the following conditions: - the chimney will be retained. The applicant will use a real slate product such as TruSlate. If unable to use a real slate product, the applicant will return before the Commission to present the replacement product. Rob DuBoff seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

UPCOMING MEETINGS:

Land Use Board Meeting, Thursday, September 24, 2020 at 6:00 P.M. – Presentation by Camiros 2nd UDO Draft changes.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, October 7, 2020 at 6:30 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 7:40 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 10-7-20