



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 3, 2018

7:00 P.M.

CITY CENTER ROOM 2A

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Cynthia Corbett; Leslie DiCarlo;
Rob Duboff; Leslie Mechem

ABSENT: Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Chris Bennett

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the DRC Meeting Minutes of September 5, 2018 with minor corrections. Rob DuBoff seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor;
Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 5-0

B. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

1. **2018.084 318 WEST AVENUE MIXED USE BUILDING**, Consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency for a new multi use building within the Transect 4 and 5 District.

Bradley Birge stated this is a procedural action for a new project at the southern end of West Avenue. A.O. Smith Corporation is looking to locate their headquarters here in Saratoga Springs. There will be offices on the first floor and second floor residential. This is the beginning of the process Lead Agency Status for SEQRA review.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion to in the matter of the 318 West Avenue Mixed Use Building, 318 West Avenue, the DRC defers Lead Agency Status to the Planning Board should they seek it.

Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor;
Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 5-0

Leslie DiCarlo recused from the following application.

2. **2018.063 JPSMSC LLC SINGLE FAMILY & GARAGE**, 155 Union Avenue, Historic Review of a new single family house and detached garage within an Urban Residential-4 District.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development informed the applicant with a Commission member recusing from the application that leaves 4 Commission Members which is a quorum. We are at the minimum required to pass an application. This is for the applicant's information and it is his choice whether to move forward with the application or defer to the next meeting.

Mr. Calendar stated they will move forward.

Applicant: Steve Calendar, Scott MacIntyre

Mr. Calendar stated at our last appearance before the Commission some concerns were expressed. The front porch was to be placed on piers with lattice beneath vertically not horizontally. A majority of the neighbors have lattice in this design.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated diagonal is not appropriate. The lattice is on the front porch and wraps around the side.

Mr. Calendar stated this should be reflected in the drawings. The other request was to change the decking material on the front porch from Trex to mahogany wood. Windows from 6 over 1 to 2 over 2 configuration which is on the specification sheet. The windows were proposed using an Anderson 400 series which the Commission determined is vinyl and not appropriate. The applicant is requesting to use a Pella window which was permitted on the street for another project.

Rob DuBoff questioned if there was any updates to the floor plans which were originally submitted.

Mr. Calendar stated updated floor plans have not been submitted.

Rob DuBoff stated it is not necessarily needed but we would like to see the placement of the rooms updated to reflect the elevation changes. The dimensions should reflect the elevation shows. It is really just the front of the home and the porch that I would like to see the plans on.

Mr. Calendar stated the floor plans have not yet been completed.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the interior of the home is not under the Commission's purview. However, when there are changes to the elevations, it is beneficial to look at the floor plans of the interior of the home.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated going back to the windows, this property is located on Union Avenue in a very prominent spot, what is important is the quality of the window product. In terms of windows being used it is important that those windows be wooden windows.

Mr. Calendar stated Mr. DuBoff suggested we use the Marvin Integrity windows and we have included that in our specification sheet, in case the Pella windows were not acceptable.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated if the motion were to move forward this evening this would be a condition on that approval.

Mr. Calendar provided information on moving the window closer to the end of the building shifting it forward. Drawings to illustrate this change were provided to the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated at the last several meetings she has brought up specifically that a full front porch would be most appropriate. I seem to be in the minority. I would like to hear the Commission and see if they are also comfortable with this elevation as it is.

Rob DuBoff stated he visited the property again and is disappointed that the applicant is not considering a full front porch, considering that the applicants neighbors on either side have full front porches. Almost the entire block has full front porches. It is disconcerting that your neighbors have it and you don't and that you don't wish to put a full front porch on this home.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further thoughts from the Commission.

Leslie Mechem stated there is enough variety on Union and everything does not need to look the same.

Rob DuBoff stated there is such a wealth of architectural detail on Union Avenue. Every house has well thought out architectural detail. He is disappointed that there is a lack of architectural detail on this home. There is a certain level of disappointment with the loss of this architectural detail.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs spoke regarding the fact that a final decision has not yet been made. Obviously, you don't wish to bring surprises upon the applicant. This has been a lengthy discussion about the project. You do not want to feel regret prior to making a decision, and make good decisions based on your criteria within the Zoning Ordinance. If the full front porch has an impact on the historical quality of that block than it should be evaluated properly.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned if the applicants position on the front porch was a firm position.

Mr. Calendar stated yes it is a firm position.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated for the record putting myself in your position as the applicant it can be difficult appearing before the Board so many times. Although we have brought up the porch, the signal from the Commission is that they are comfortable with this as is. I do feel that this is borderline wrong to alter the application now based on that. However, in the future the Commission needs to consider these things and spend more time on the details before we send the applicant away with an understanding that might not be entirely accurate or entirely appropriate. I do think as Rob stated it is a disappointment and a loss. It would be more appropriate for the property including adjacent properties a full front porch would be most appropriate. I am not sure at this time I am not ready to say I will not approve the application. We do only have four people tonight. I would be up to the applicant to decide to wait for two weeks to have a full complement on the Commission or to proceed with a vote this evening.

Mr. Calendar stated he would like to proceed with a vote this evening.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated if the application does not move forward this evening the applicant will have to reapply.

Brad Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated in the past the Chairman has asked for a straw poll.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked the Commission members if anyone feels uncomfortable moving this application forward this evening and would therefore deter a vote.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further questions or comments from the Commission.

Rob DuBoff spoke regarding personal preference and discussed the porch and the architectural details that would be lost.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Cynthia Corbett made a motion in the matter of the JPSMSC LLC Single Family & Garage, 155 Union Avenue that we approve the application with the following conditions: that the changes which were indicated on the September 26, 2018 revision product specifications be included specifically that a horizontal lattice skirting be used under the front porch. That the decking on the porch be 5/4 mahogany. That the window panes be 2 over 2 and the applicant use the alternative Marvin

Integrity window line. The shift of the window on the first floor east elevation is approved. Condition of approval that the final drawings be submitted prior to building permit submittal.

Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there is any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 4-0

Leslie DiCarlo resumed her position on the Commission.

3. **2018.082 TROUTMAN FRONT PORCH**, 29 Beekman Street, Architectural Review of exterior modifications within the Neighborhood Complementary Use-1 District.

Agent: Michael Perry, Architect

Applicant: Amanda Troutman & Michael D'Agnese

Mr. Perry stated the applicants are proposing changing out the old green aluminum siding to blue vinyl siding which is on the rest of the home. A visual of the proposed project was provided to the Commission. We will demolish everything below the porch roof, retaining the roof. The applicants are looking to replace the materials on the front façade with low or no maintenance materials, such as vinyl or composite. All the fenestrations will remain the same. All the windows and doors will remain except for the trim which is aluminum as will be replaced with Azak materials. The decking will be a composite material as well. The columns are a plain fiberglass material. No railings are required on the porch due to height of the deck level, as we will be removing one of the risers on the steps. The lattice under the porch will be removed and replaced with Azak. We are changing out the metal on the roof structure to a black standing seam.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated it is nice to see improvements being made with this home.

Mr. Perry stated the porches are in poor condition and there is some rotting. The applicants are trying to complete this project this fall.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated these changes are needed and greatly improve the appearance and functionality of the home. I would like to bring to the attention of the Commission members and would like to discuss, is that this property is in an Architectural Review District, but the home is a historic home. Although the sides and the back of the home are covered in new vinyl what I would like you to consider is not putting vinyl on the front, preserving the façade. I am suggesting the applicant not use vinyl siding or fiber cement siding or clapboard. The more we can do to maintain the front façade, overall appearance and value of the home.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any comments from the Commission.

Rob DuBoff stated he is in agreement with the Chair. Everything which is being proposed is synthetic.

Mr. Perry spoke regarding the remainder of the home being vinyl.

Discussion ensued regarding the materials proposed for the front façade.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated vinyl on this his property, considering the historic nature of the home is not appropriate.

Leslie Mechem questioned the applicant's agent as to what is under the siding on the front of the home.

Mr. Perry stated he does not know since they haven't torn it off, he just looked at the corners. This will be adding an additional cost to the project.

Cynthia Corbett stated if you look down the street on Franklin there is a home where they removed the vinyl siding and had to make some repairs to the wood but it looks remarkable well.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated removing the aluminum siding and looking at the wooden clapboard underneath and looking to see if it's salvageable. Fiber cement would be the most appropriate siding for that. The existing decorative brackets that on the columns; they are nice and speak to the historic nature of the home. Is there any way to reuse or replicate them.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission.

Leslie Mechem stated she agrees with keeping or replicating the decorative brackets they do make the front façade look more distinctive. The front façade materials depend on what the condition of the wood is under the vinyl siding, and then you would want to replace the porch with wood as well.

Mr. Perry stated this is adding dollars to the project.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated while we sympathize with the applicant in terms of the context in what we have been asked to do by the City, in terms of following the historic guidelines we cannot take that into consideration. We need to look at the materials which would be most appropriate.

Ms. Troutman spoke regarding the Commission classifying this home as historic. Numerous conversations were held in discussion with the historical society both on the national and local level and they both informed her that it is not a historic home and not on any registry.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned the year the home was built.

Ms. Troutman stated 1880 is the year on the deed.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the fact that it was built in the late 1880's roughly which makes it a historical property whether it is on the national or local historical registries or not. We are looking at this application under Architectural Review guise. The fact that it is a historic home we are taking that into consideration as well. In terms of what we are looking at and the value of what the home brings to the neighborhood and the city are certain qualities we would like to see preserved if possible.

Ms. Troutman stated this is their first home and they have a certain amount budgeted for this project. Changing the materials will significantly delay the project.

Mr. Perry spoke regarding the columns, the brackets will not work with the round columns proposed.

Rob DuBoff stated we would not want to combine wood with fiberglass. Is it worth investigating into the use of natural materials, and evaluating what the cost would be. There is a major difference the way natural materials versus composite materials look like from the street. There is great opportunity to lead by example in this area.

Cynthia Corbett stated you need to look at what is under the siding.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated for the record it does not seem inappropriate to use fiber cement products for the details. The columns, the decking and the details like that. My big concern is the façade and vinyl. There are several ways to look at that. If after removing the vinyl siding and the wood is salvageable that is cost savings as well. It has to

be fiber cement, but I am only one person on the Commission.

Ms. Troutman stated all the materials have been purchased for the front of the home in vinyl since they are not in a historical District. This will be a loss of several thousand dollars.

Brad Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs questioned when the vinyl was put on the home.

Ms. Troutman stated the vinyl was put on the home in 2015 as part of the project with the house addition which received DRC approval at that time and was done with Tonya Yasenchak at Engineering America.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding maintaining the façade.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated she feels strongly about the fiber cement and natural material for the front façade.

Mr. Perry stated could we pull off some of the vinyl and see how the wood is underneath.

Leslie DiCarlo spoke regarding a home on Lake Avenue and the Commission and the applicant decided to do nothing but paint what was currently there, saving for future restoration. There are photos and documentation if someone in the future would like to return the home back to its original wood front façade. I am not sure this is worth saving. Part of it is saving what exists for the future. If there is wood siding under that could be saved that's great. If not perhaps it will have to be vinyl. I am not comfortable making a decision until I see what is under the siding.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned if the applicant was agreeable to that.

Mr. Perry stated he would do that if the Commission would review at caravan and the applicant can return before the Commission at the next meeting.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this will give the Commission a good idea on how to move forward.

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, October 9, 2018 at 5:00 P.M.

Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, October 17, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:10 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 11-7-18 TEhinger, in favor; CCorbett, in favor; LDiCarlo, in favor; LMechem, in favor; RDuBoff, in favor; 5-0