



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 17, 2018

7:00 P.M.

CITY CENTER ROOM 2A

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Cynthia Corbett; Leslie DiCarlo; Rob Duboff; Leslie Mechem; Chris Bennett

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the DRC Meeting Minutes of September 19, 2018 with minor corrections. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **2018.085 SENSORY SIX SIGNAGE**, 8 Butler Drive, Architectural Review of a new wall sign within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
2. **2018.091 FLATBREAD SOCIAL SIGNAGE**, 86 Henry Street, Architectural Review of a new wall sign Within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.
3. **2018.094 DREAMSLEEP MATTRESS SIGNAGE**, 250 Washington Street, Architectural Review of a new wall sign within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1, #2 and #3 on the consent Agenda. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on the consent agenda items. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Sensory Six Signage, 8 Butler Drive, Flatbread Social Signage, 86 Henry Street, and Dreamsleeper Mattress Signage, 250 Washington Street, that these three applications be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

Commission member Cynthia Corbett recused from the following application.

1. **2018.082 TROUTMAN FRONT PORCH**, 29 Beekman Street, Architectural Review of exterior modifications within the Neighborhood Complementary Use-1 District.

Applicant: Amanda Troutman & Michael D'Agnese

Agent: Michael Perry, Architect

Mr. Troutman stated she has been in contact with her contractor. He priced out the project with both options wood versus vinyl. The fiber cement siding would be \$8,000 extra. \$4,000 for materials and \$4,000 for labor plus additional costs for custom corner trim and added insulation. The labor cost includes the removal and replacement and/or repair of the current wood siding. The project would cost \$2,500 in materials using wood for the front porches plus additional cost for custom corner pieces. The applicant is proposing using wood for the porches on the front façade. Douglas fir tongue and groove for the decking all columns will be wood keeping authentic materials on the porches. Ms. Troutman stated she spoke with Samantha Bosshart of the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation and there are no records citing this property is on the National Historic Register.

Mr. Perry stated the applicants are also proposing wood wainscoting on the ceilings.

Chris Bennett questioned if the applicants would be using wooden railings.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman thanked the applicant for the on site visit to the home. She stated the porch is one of the designing features of the home. Using wood on the porch and columns and flooring is totally appropriate and in keeping with the design guidelines. Also I feel that the balusters and railings should be wood as well.

Rob DuBoff agreed with the Chairman, the use of wood on the front façade would be appropriate.

Chris Bennett stated wood railings and baluster would make it look much nicer.

Discussion ensued using composite materials on the stair risers and railings.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated since the Commission is making concessions regarding the vinyl on the front of the home that all the elements of the porch should be wood.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the vertical lattice is appropriate and should be wood as well.

Chris Bennett stated he lives in a historic district and yes wood does need to be replaced and maintained but it does present nicer and is original to the home and is part of home ownership.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman stated she would like to re-emphasized everything should be wood on the porch.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Troutman Front Porch, 29 Beekman Street that the application be approved with the following conditions: Vinyl siding and house trims to match existing side elevations with full runs, limiting seams and no J channels. All porch elements including columns, balusters, decking stairs both treads and risers, lattice below the porch, ceiling and all structural members to be of wood. The applicant should submit updated drawings to reflect those material changes. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

Cynthia Corbett resumed her position on the Commission.

2. 2018.086 ZIMMERMAN SUBDIVISION, 139 Grand Avenue, consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency Status (Historic Review) for a proposed subdivision and residence within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the applicant is not present this evening. The application is before the Commission this evening for Lead Agency Status for SEQRA which has been requested by the Zoning Board of Appeals. Any questions or comments or remarks about this application from the Commission.

Rob DuBoff submitted Sanborn Fire Insurance maps to be submitted into the record. These maps are dated 1876, 1895 and 1900 that detail the subject property which show the lack of additional buildings in the back yard where the applicants are proposing to build a new structure. That is to say there never was a structure back there.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs stated often times the DRC has deferred Lead Agency Status and other times have provided their opinions to the ZBA to help guide them in their decision making. Any particular concerns you may have as they proceed through SEQRA on this, or whether this subdivision of the property is appropriate or not. The applicants are seeking variances which would create substandard lots.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the size of the proposed lots.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the Commission reviewed the paper work submitted by Rob and did revisit the site on caravan. She feels it is not appropriate to subdivide this property.

Chris Bennett stated if the structure has a relationship with the main structure like a carriage house there would not be an objection if it was a small house with the same architectural features of the home, architecturally it would be appropriate, not overwhelming and it would not be an issue.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the inappropriateness for the area or for what they are going to build.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated in general we feel that the subdivision would not be appropriate as submitted. Further, the Commission is opposed to the subdivision of the property.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Zimmerman Subdivision, 139 Grand Avenue that the Design

Review Commission defers Lead Agency Status to the Zoning Board of Appeals as they have requested. Also, remark upon the application the application as evaluated by the Commission notes we are opposed to the subdivision as it currently is proposed.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs stated the action does have precedential value specifically to forthcoming applications. You are broadcasting what your philosophies are. You are being presented with a lot that is listed on the National Historic Register.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated we are actually giving an opinion to setting a precedent that we can approve substandard lots. They do not meet the zoning requirements. As a Commission we are not in favor of the subdivision of historic lots that would then make those lots substandard or that would negatively impact the historic register.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Zimmerman Subdivision, 139 Grand Avenue, that the Design Review Commission defers Lead Agency Status to the ZBA as requested. As a Commission we are not in favor of the subdivision of historic lots that would then make those historic lots substandard. Nor are we in favor of approving any subdivision which would negatively impact the historic register.

Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

3. 2018.087 PET LODGE, 3320 Route 9, Architectural Review of a new commercial structure within the Rural Residential District.

Applicant: Matt Sames, owner

Agent: Tom Wheeler, AJ Signs; Dave Grenko, General Contractor; Eric Vickerson, Architect

Mr. Vickerson stated this is a 6,000 square foot building. The front of the building about 1500 square feet, has a porch and public area and reception area, 4,500 square feet of kennels in the rear of the building. It is a single story wood frame structure.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission.

Rob DuBoff questioned is the only thing visible from the road the signage?

Mr. Vickerson stated yes.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, questioned the signage and the luminosity considering the sign is white.

Mr. Wheeler, AJ Signs stated the signage is internally illuminated sign with a polycarbonate face. It is lit with LED lighting which can be adjusted brighter or dimmer. The hours of operation are 6:30 am to 6:30 pm. Low landscaping is proposed at the base of the signage which will have a retaining wall to hold the sign. Overall height of the sign is 159 inches.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated it is the City's Master Plan to reduce signage and I would prefer to see this no larger than 10 feet in height.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the size of the proposed signage.

Mr. Wheeler stated the sign incorporates the branded logo. The applicant can remove the base of the sign to decrease the height. The speed limit is 55 MPH on the roadway out front. Eliminating the base still allows the applicant to deal with the snow, and it would decrease the signage to 11 feet overall.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comment from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of the Pet Lodge, 3320 Route 9, that the application be approved with the following conditions: The base of the signage will be removed. Use of shrubbery around the posts of the sign. Signage will be no higher than 11 feet in height total. Dimmable LED power supply to be adjusted as appropriate. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, October 30, 2018 at 5:00 P.M.

Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, November 7, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:08 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

Approved 11-7-18 TEhinger, in favor; KCavotta, in favor; CCorbett, in favor; LDiCarlo, in favor; R DuBoff, in favor; LMechem, in favor; CBennett, in favor 7-0