



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 21, 2020

6:30 P.M.

ZOOM WEBINAR

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chair; Leslie Mechem; Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett; Rob DuBoff; Ellen Sheehan

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chair, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Rob DuBoff made a motion to approve the minutes of the October 7, 2020 DRC meeting with minor corrections. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chair, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

The intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **20200689 55 RAILROAD PLACE T-MOBILE ANTENNAS**, 55 Railroad Place, Architectural Review of replacement telecommunication apparatus within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
2. **20200734 DEMARCO RESIDENCE**, 135 Spring Street, Historic Review of exterior modifications (chimney) within the Urban Residential-3 District.
3. **20200712 COHEN PARTIAL REROOF**, 160 Spring Street, Historic Review of exterior modifications

within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair made a motion in the matter of the 55 Railroad Place T-Mobile Antennas, 55 Railroad Place, DeMarco Residence, 135 Spring Street, and Cohen Partial Reroof, 160 Spring Street that the applications be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chair, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

4. **20200665 BURNS PARTIAL REROOF**, 129 Circular Street, Historic Review of exterior modifications, within the Urban Residential-3 District.

No representative present. Agenda item deferred to the November 4, 2020 meeting.

5. **20200659 DIMAGGIO EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 451 Lake Avenue, Architectural Review for exterior modifications, (roof, windows, siding, etc.) within the Rural Residential District.

Applicant: Joseph DiMaggio

Mr. DiMaggio stated he is proposing exterior modifications to this site. A visual of the site was provided. The plan is to re-roof. One half of the roof in the rear is a rubber roof and is still in good condition and does not need to be replaced. The shingle roof needs replacement. Currently the roof is black and gray asphalt shingles, and the new roof will be a deeper brown shingle. A portion of the roof over the front windows is currently shingled but a deep forest green standing seam metal roof is proposed as an accent. Samples colors were supplied to staff. Other proposed modifications are removal of the porch which is in poor shape with exposed plywood on the roof and poor foundation. By removing the porch and exposing the 6 large windows behind it will be more attractive and allow for more light into the building. Also moving the stairs off the porch and moving them to the access door with a gabled roof shingled match the new roof. The landscaping will be relocated closer to the building. The shake pine shingles which exist will be replaced with vinyl siding in the board and batten vertical style. Photographs and color samples as well as material choices were also provided. The rear of the building will have a new window as well as replacement of the deck and stairs with a Trex decking and handicap access in the same footprint. The doors will be replaced wood doors. The chimney on the side of the building is concrete block and I am proposing a stone façade to match the building.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair stated this is quite a project. This property is in an Architectural Review District as you enter the City from the east. In terms of the project the Chair has no objections to any proposed changes or renovations. The use of vinyl is typically a product the Commission discourages in the Architectural Review District. We have allowed it on occasion when a property is in a less visible location from the main street. This is a very visible property.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission.

Rob DuBoff questioned if the applicant would consider wood or a Hardie cement board siding.

Mr. DiMaggio stated he considered cedar which is cost prohibitive and requires staining and maintenance versus the vinyl.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development questioned the applicant if this was to be a residence or an office.

Mr. DiMaggio stated this will be the future home of his financial planning office which is being relocated from Selkirk.

Discussion ensued among the Board regarding vinyl versus cement board siding or shingles. Wood products for the rear versus composite decking were suggested.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair asked if there was any further discussion or questions from the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair stated there is some consensus among the Commission due to the visibility of the property as well as its use that a fiber cement product or a natural wood product would be an appropriate material.

Mr. DiMaggio stated he will be fine stipulating the use of a wood or fiber cement product.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the DiMaggio Exterior Modifications, 451 Lake Avenue be approved with the following condition, the applicant use a fiber cement or cedar siding to replace the siding on the building. Ellen Sheehan seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chair, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

6. 20200567 STEVENS ROOF REPLACEMENT, 172 Circular Street, Historic Review of exterior modifications within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Kim Stevens

Ms. Stevens provided a visual of the property requiring a new roof as well as the curved dormers. The lower roofs will not be changed at this time. The applicant stated she currently has water damage and is anxious to have a new roof installed. Ms. Stevens stated at her previous appearance before the Commission a metal shingle product presented and was a product the Commission preferred not to be used. She began by contacting roofers, who installed a product called Tru-slate, roofers who installed slate roofs and other roofers who referred her to a product she is proposing tonight. Ms. Stevens provided historic photos of the home and old slate found in her basement which is gray slate. Ms. Stevens found a product called DaVinci Roofscapes. Ashley Cisertt, Project Specialist for DaVinci Roofscapes who is present and available for questions. Mr. Stevens provided photographs of homes that currently have this product in use. Ms. Stevens stated she is proposing copper valley and trims on her home, with flat copper on the curved dormer. Also, copper guttering on the front dormer to prevent ice build on the stairs.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair stated the applicant has certainly done her due diligence. This property is one of the most outstanding historic homes in Saratoga and the fact that you want to replicate the roof to the best of your ability. This product is great, and it does mimic slate better than other product we have seen. Removal of the chimney proposed is not an issue.

Ms. Steven provided a visual of where the copper guttering is proposed.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair, asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission.

Rob DuBoff asked if the product representative could provide information on the DaVinci roofing product.

Ms. Cisetti, Product Representative at DaVinci Roofscapes provided information on the product which is manufactured in Kansas. They expect 50+ years or more wear on their products. It is an environmentally safe product made from virgin polymer (plastic). They have been in business since 1997.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated the Foundation always advocates for slate. The applicant kept the Foundation informed throughout this process. This is an interesting product and at this point we do not object to the use of this product. This is an extenuating circumstance. Ms. Bosshart questioned the placement of the copper guttering along the front of the home.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the placement of the guttering and alternatives.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair stated we can move forward with the application and remove the guttering portion from this application.

Ms. Stevens stated the guttering is not a part of this application.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair stated the applicant can provide information regarding the guttering at a later date.

Ellen Sheehan made a motion in the matter of the Stevens Roof Replacement, 172 Circular Street the application be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chair asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chair, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, opposed; Chris Bennett, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 5-1

UPCOMING MEETINGS:

Design Review Caravan, Wednesday, October 28, 2020 at 5:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, November 4, 2020 at 6:30 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, November 18, 2020 at 6:30 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:10 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

Approved 11-4-20