



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 7, 2018

7:00 P.M.

CITY CENTER MEETING ROOM A

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Cynthia Corbett; Leslie DiCarlo; Rob Duboff; Leslie Mechem; Chris Bennett

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the DRC Meeting Minutes of October 3, 2018 as submitted. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, abstained; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0-1

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the DRC Meeting Minutes of October 17, 2018 as submitted. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **2018.095 BEALKO GUTTER**, 191 Circular Street, Historic Review of partial gutter installation within the Urban Residential-3 District.
2. **2018.099 iRUN LOCAL SIGNAGE**, 425 Broadway, Historic Review of a replacement wall sign within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
3. **2018.100 SPA CAFÉ COLLAMER BUILDING VENT**, 480 Broadway, Historic Review of a new intake air vents within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1, #2 or #3 on the consent Agenda. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on the consent agenda items. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Bealko Gutter, 191 Circular Street, iRun Local Signage, 425 Broadway, and Spa Café Collamer Building Vent, 480 Broadway, that these three applications be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

1. **2018.088 METABOLIC SIGNAGE**, 30 Gick Road, Architectural Review of a wall sign within the Transect -4 Urban Neighborhood District.

Agent: Rick Bult, FastSigns

Mr. Bult stated the applicant is proposing to install a sign, 24" high x 142" wide with channel lettering on the raceway. It will be a polycarbonate face with black day/night vinyl. The letters will be constructed with black aluminum with 4" returns, and aluminum back. The lettering will appear black during the day, white at night. It will be internally lit with LED illumination installed 13 feet above grade.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated during the caravan the Commission had some concerns regarding the size of the signage backing.

Mr. Bult explained the backing was placed just for the Commission to see the proposed signage. No backing is proposed for this sign.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie DiCarlo made a motion in the matter of the Metabolic Signage, 30 Gick Road, that the application be approved as submitted or shown on the attached plans. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

2. **2018.089 PLAZA 15 SIGNAGE**, 30 Gick Road, Architectural Review of a freestanding sign within the within the Transect -4 Urban Neighborhood District.

Agent: Rick Bult, FastSigns

Mr. Bult stated the applicant is proposing to replace the existing sign face with a new structure to advertise all tenants. The sign is to use the existing steel structure. The sign face is to consist of a double sided LED cabinet with polycarbonate faces, internally lit with LED illumination. Each tenant listing panel to be 2' in height by 5' in width with each tenant space at 10 square feet. The overall size of sign is based on the design. Two options are presented for the Commission's review. Option A is 10 feet wide by 17 feet in height. Option B is 10 feet wide by 15 feet 6 inches in height.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the sign is 19'8" in height. In the Comprehensive Plan and where we wish to be as a City, our job is to attempt to lower the height of the signs, as low as possible. Option B presents itself better.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the height of the proposed signage. The Commission felt that a total Height of 13'6" without the base is an appropriate height for the signage at this location.

Chris Bennett questioned the topography of the site, noting this location is one of the gateways to the City and should read more like a welcome to the City. This is somewhat stark and perhaps you can soften it somewhat.

Mr. Bult stated the landlord would not be averse to landscaping the area at the base of the sign.

Cynthia Corbett stated she is somewhat bothered by the various colors of the signs. Is it possible to have uniform colors? across all of the tenants.

Mr. Bult stated we can suggest three color categories to the tenants, either, red, black or blue.

Mr. Bult stated we have wrapped sign cabinets with wood type material, perhaps a barn wood or such to provide a more architectural look.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman thanked the applicant for his willingness to work with the Commission noting this will make a nicer presentation.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem, made a motion in the matter of the Plaza 15 Signage, 30 Gick Road that the application be approved with the following conditions – The Commission has chosen Option B. There will be no architectural diamond at the top of the sign. The total height of the sign is to be no higher than 13'6" without the base. Landscaping to be planted at the base of the sign. The logos be restricted to 3 color combinations, red, black and blue. The signage box is to be wrapped in a wood like cladding. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

3. **2018.098 JAMESON ROOF**, 146 Church Street, Architectural Review of roof replacement (asphalt to standing seam) within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Carter Jameson

Mr. Jameson stated they are proposing a partial roof replacement on the front section of the main building.

The current roof material is asphalt shingles and they will be replacing that with a standing seam roof. A sample of the proposed product was provided to the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of the Jameson Roof, 146 Church Street that the application be approved as submitted or shown on the attached plans. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

NOTE:

The agenda was heard out of order due to the lack of representation for Agenda Item #4.

5. **2018.093 STARK'S MARKET**, 62-64 Excelsior Avenue, Architectural Review of a façade modification of an existing building within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Applicant: RR Depot, LLC; Sonny Bonacio

Agent: Kaitlyn Koury, LA Group; Scott Townsend, 3TArchitects;

Ms. Koury provided a visual of the proposed site. The applicant was granted a Special Use Permit by the Planning Board. We are now before the Commission for Architectural Review. A visual of the site was provided along with building improvements to be made at the site. Ms. Koury stated that the auto parts store will remain. The historic overhead doors will be replaced with storefront windows and doors and the entire building will be repainted. The footprint of the building will remain the same.

Mr. Townsend stated this is a straightforward project. The building is in need of some TLC which is exactly what is being provided. Nine Miles East is a very viable tenant and will be occupying the site. The building will be utilized as it stands to the extent possible. We will be using dark bronze windows to match the auto part store. The patio will be constructed with a green screen out front. The applicant will return for signage, and color.

Ms. Koury stated the applicant will return before the Commission for site plan and provide a developed lighting plan during site plan approval.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated during site plan stormwater management is reviewed, as well as parking, lighting and access and egress.

Leslie Mechem questioned if there was any history or record of spills since this previously was a gas station.

Mr. Bonacio stated we are in receipt of a letter from the DEC noting what remediation if any needs to be done at the site.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a great re-use of the building. The applicant will return with the color palette and proposed signage.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman questioned the awning placement and materials for railings as well.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie DiCarlo made a motion in the matter of Stark's Market, 62-64 Excelsior Avenue that the application be approved with the following conditions – samples for awning, railings and paint colors to be submitted for Administrative approval. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

4. **2018.057 MONTANO GARAGE**, 34 Circular Street, Historic Review of proposed new garage within the Urban Residential-4 District.

Applicant: Charles Montano

Mr. Montano stated based on the feedback we received from our last appearance before the Commission, keeping in mind we are not going to build the structure but wish to sell the home. We are providing our buyers the opportunity to build something which has already been approved by this Commission. A rendition of what the home looks like and the specs were submitted to the Commission, similar to a carriage house with living space above the garage.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman spoke regarding the proposed plans and noted that additional living space above the garage does complicate the application somewhat.

Rob DuBoff stated from his perspective it is taking too much attention for an accessory building.

Cynthia Corbett stated she agrees with Rob.

Leslie DiCarlo stated the garage doors do not fit with the scheme of the home.

Chris Bennett questioned if the cupola on the building is too large. We do not usually approve conceptual details. We normally have specifics on the products that we approve.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated in terms of giving the applicant some direction, this two story structure is not inappropriate especially if the cupola is reduced.

Rob DuBoff stated by removing the cupola and keeping the corbels or brackets it ties in to the home.

The applicant will take the Commission's recommendations and will return before the Board.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation thanked the applicants for their investment into this home. The Foundation did comment on the proposed garage via written correspondence.

RECUSAL:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman recused from the following application.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman assumed the duties of the Chair.

5. **2018.096 BRANT CARRIAGE HOUSE**, 695 North Broadway, Historic Review of exterior modifications to an existing accessory structure within the Urban Residential-1 District.

Agent: Tom Frost, Frost Hurff Architects

Mr. Frost stated the applicants are proposing to renovate the carriage house in the rear of the property. They are proposing to convert this existing carriage house to permit a guest house with sleeping accommodations. Two bedrooms and two bathrooms upstairs. Downstairs there is a living room space, with no kitchen area. Board and Batten siding is proposed with new windows and doors. A new dormer on the rear west elevation is proposed and windows and doors are replacing the hayloft door on the second floor and first floor overhead garage doors. Also two new doors are proposed on the south elevation. No changes are proposed to the northern elevation. A visual of the proposed project was provided to the Commission with review of all elevations.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated this is a great project with beautiful details. The Commission received a letter from Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director of the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation in support of this application.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development spoke regarding the need for variances. The applicant will appear before the Zoning Board for those approvals. Technically final approval cannot be granted prior to the granting of the variances. The Commission can provide guidance to the ZBA.

Rob DuBoff questioned if the windows are being retained.

Mr. Frost stated they are proposing to re-glaze some of the windows. Frames and any changes to the windows will be done on the inside. There are some discussions concerning the possibility of replacing the slate roof.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated if the roof is slate to slate there is no need for the applicant to reappear before the Commission.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman spoke regarding the remaining windows and doors.

Mr. Frost stated they will be wood.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the audience.

Sonny Bonacio stated he lives a block away from the project and he thinks it is wonderful.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated a letter of support was forwarded to the Commission. We appreciate the attention to the details and slate roof replacement. Ms. Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated she echoes the sentiment regarding the adaptive reuse and we appreciate the applicants efforts and cannot wait to see it.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development questioned if the Commission would like to pass along any information to the ZBA.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Brant Carriage House, 695 North Broadway, the Design Review Commission offers a positive recommendation to the applicant as it has been presented since it follows the historic guidelines and promotes reinvestment in a historic district. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

The applicant will return before the Design Review Commission for final approval.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman resumed her position on the Commission.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman resumed her position on the Commission.

6. **2018.097 HOLLIS WINDOWS**, 157 Lake Avenue, Architectural Review of 2 side window replacements within the Urban Residential-3 District.

DISCLOSURE:

Leslie Mechem disclosed that she knows Mr. Hollis as he is her dentist.

Applicant: Al Hollis

Mr. Hollis stated he purchased this property approximately 1½ years ago. He wishes to restore his home back to its charm. The two windows on the east side were removed and destroyed. I am proposing to replace those windows with Anderson E series aluminum clad windows in the exact location custom made to fit. Everything will be the same. Information was provided to the Commission concerning the windows. A visual of the proposed home and the location of the windows were provided to the Commission.

Chris Bennett spoke regarding the type of windows to be used for this restoration. A Marvin window or equivalent replacement sashes would be appropriate.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation questioned if this would be a replacement in kind.

Chris Bennett stated this would be appropriate for a replacement in kind.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of the Hollis Windows, 157 Lake Avenue, that the application be approved with the following condition – A Marvin or equivalent wood replacement sash be used for this project. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

7. **2018.051 385 BROADWAY MIXED-USE BUILDING**, 385 Broadway, Historic Review of existing building demolition and construction of a new 5-story, mixed-use building within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

BACKGROUND:

The property is located on the heart of Broadway, project proposes to demolish existing single story building and construct mixed use 5 story building consisting of 10,000 square feet of commercial space and 72 multi-family residential units. DRC Historic Review is required.

Applicant: Burns Management, Peter Rosecranz; Tom Newkirk, and Beth Jameson

Agent: Mike Ingersoll, LA Group; Doug Heller, LA Group, Project Engineer; Mike Phinney, Architect

Mr. Phinney provided a visual presentation of the proposed project. He spoke regarding what influenced the architecture of the building and the materials which are brick, stone, steel and cast stone with a simulated slate roof. Mr. Phinney provided views of all elevations, and discussed the colors which are being considered for the building, as well as the proximity to Druthers. Mr. Phinney provided a review of the first floor plans indicating the change in grade and elevation requiring a ramp into the lower level to access parking. We will maintain the two tenants which currently exist in the building National and Frivolous and there is a potential for a third tenant. A visual of the site was provided for the Board including the floor layouts and apartment sizes and locations. The applicant will be introducing some micro-units; these are studio type apartments from 500 to 650 square feet. The building will be 5 stories in height. Plans for the roof have been modified due to neighbors concerns. We are incorporating a green roof screening as well for further buffering and screening, which is part of the stormwater management plan. We anticipate large condenser units and the location of the mechanical equipment which will be screened with both a vegetative wall and the mansard roof will help for screening and an additional barrier. Mr. Phinney provided a review of all elevations and the modifications made to the building by pulling the building back and creating a loading area for move ins and outs as well as deliveries. All the first level balconies have been removed. Juliet balconies will be used in this area. Balconies are proposed on the 3rd floor apartments and above. The windows will be composite wood and fibrex black in color and simulated divided light. Lighting examples were provided for the Commission which include a Sternberg light with a gas light for the front façade. Small recessed lighting and sconces which will be dark sky compliant. We have spoken with the neighbors and the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation as well. The cornice was increased in thickness and depth per the recommendations of the Preservation Foundation. In the front we are proposing granite steps, street trees and flowers.

Mr. Carr, LA Group spoke regarding the front façade and perhaps integrating some historic information regarding the American Hotel. The Planning Board suggested for the civic space perhaps the integration of a fountain. Further discussion is proposed with a committee of several Planning Board members and DPW in this regard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is an impressive project which you are undertaking.

Chris Bennett questioned what materials the balconies will be comprised of as well as building penetrations.

Mr. Phinney stated penetrations will be painted to match the materials it surrounds.

Rob DuBoff questioned the front façade windows on the mansard. He requested more details on the simulated divided light windows, and balconies, how the materials will be put together.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman spoke regarding the north and west elevations and questioned if some texture can be added to the walls facing the parking lot, perhaps something of interest.

Mr. Phinney stated the gas meters are in the rear of the building screened from view. A visual was provided to the Commission.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated this is a beautiful building. The details are amazing. The old and new materials together are great. Have we seen any images of the project from different perspectives on the street as well as the height of the building in comparison to other buildings on the street.

Mr. Phinney stated they did present this earlier in the process, and do not have that slide with us tonight, but did provide an aerial view of the project.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a great project. Are there any additional comments from the Commission? It appears the Commission is looking for additional details in terms of your addressing the undulations or more details on the walls. Also, the windows and the historic front details. The front façade details would be helpful as well.

It was the consensus of the Commission that the outstanding concerns which were noted could be presented to the Chairman for Administrative Approval.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was anyone in the audience who would like to speak regarding this project.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated they have submitted a letter of support for this project in terms of the time and details which went into the research. Our feedback which was provided was incorporated into the design and we are pleased and excited about the project.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development reviewed the items to be submitted for Administrative Approval, which include the windows and store front details, vertical detailing on the stone for the north and west walls, Profile sections to show projection of the cornice, mansard roof details and the façade details.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the 385 Broadway Mixed-Use Building that the application be approved with the following conditions – details to be submitted for administrative approval. The north and west wall stone texture and detail to be added, windows and storefront details, and the projection of cornice at mansard to be submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

ANNOUNCEMENT BY SARATOGA SPRING PRESERVATION FOUNDATION

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director of the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated the City received a certified Grant which will increase the property values in the City. This will be formally presented on December 3, 2018, and will be presented to the City Council on December 4, 2018. This is very impressive and speaks to the work this Commission does. Everyone is welcomed to attend.

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, November 27, 2018 at 4:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, December 5, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:35 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 12-5-18