



# DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

## MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, MAY 15, 2019

7:00 P.M.

RECREATION CENTER

**PRESENT:** Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Cynthia Corbett; Chris Bennett; Leslie DiCarlo; Leslie Mechem; Steven Rowland, Alternate

**ABSENT:** Rob DuBoff

**STAFF:** Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

**CALL TO ORDER:** Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

### **A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:**

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the minutes of the April 17, 2019 DRC Meeting with minor corrections. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

#### **VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor

#### **MOTION PASSES: 6-0**

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the minutes of the May 1, 2019 DRC Meeting with minor corrections. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

#### **VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, abstained; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, abstained; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor

#### **MOTION PASSES: 4-0-2**

### **B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **20190422 IMPRESSIONS AWNINGS**, 365 Broadway, Historic Review of new awnings, within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
2. **20190418 OLD SARATOGA SQUARE PARTNERSHIP AWNINGS**, 437-443 Broadway, Historic Review of replacement awnings within the Transect 6 Urban Core District.

3. **20190362 MARKET 32 EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 115 Ballston Avenue, Architectural Review of façade Modifications and signage within the Highway General Business District.
4. **20190429 PLAZA 15 SIGNAGE**, 30 Gick Road, Architectural Review of a wall sign within the Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood District.
5. **20190415 CARROLL RESIDENCE SCREENED PORCH**, 38 High Rock-Unit 4J, Architectural Review of Porch screening within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1 through #5. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Impressions Awnings, 365 Broadway, Old Saratoga Square Partnership Awnings, 437-443 Broadway, Market 32 Exterior Modifications, 115 Ballston Avenue; Plaza 15 Signage, 30 Gick Road, Carroll Residence Screened Porch, 38 High Rock, Unit-4 that these applications be approved as submitted. Karen Cavotta seconded the motion.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

**C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION**

1. **20190359 STRAUSS WALKWAY AND STAIRS**, 26 Fifth Avenue, Historic Review of exterior modifications (walkway and front stair materials) within the Urban Residential-1 District.

Applicant: David Strauss

Agent: Kevin Bredlinski, Contractor

Mr. Strauss stated the applicants are proposing to remove the existing concrete walkway and replace with blue stone. They are also proposing to replace the wood porch stairs with bluestone treads and granite risers. At the last appearance before this Commission there was an issue with retaining the curbing. We are here this evening to revise our application. We will keep the curbing as is and replace the walkway with bluestone. The stairs were not an issue. The proposed redefined application notes the bluestone will be a larger format so not to look like a patio.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated her understanding from the correspondence received from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation that the walkway is a historic walkway and a character defining feature of this home. Our guidelines state: preserve rather than remove; repair rather than replace; and promote historical accuracy. Replacement in kind.

Discussion ensued regarding historic materials.

Chris Bennett agrees with the Preservation Foundation and the guidelines should be followed. This is a historic defining feature of the home and should be preserved.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman read an excerpt from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation correspondence which states "The house was built at the turn of the century. The use of concrete for walkways and streets became common not long thereafter. Most likely the existing concrete walkway with curbing is historic. The walkway should be repaired in-kind. The use of thermal finish full-range bluestone is not historically appropriate.

Mr. Bredlinski stated slate and bluestone have been used throughout Saratoga.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman that is correct it has been used in Saratoga but this particular home is historic and bluestone is not appropriate for this historic home.

Leslie DiCarlo stated our mandate and historic guidelines are clear.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated she is struggling with this application. She is aware of other walkways on the street and many have been changed out to bluestone. Some look like patio material. It can be done tactfully and with large pieces. Curbing is nice defining feature and would hate to see that removed. A new concrete sidewalk would not have the same appearance as the current existing concrete and is not sure how that would look.

Steven Rowland, Alternate stated if they were replacing the concrete they would not need to appear before the Commission since they would be replacing in kind. I would be upset to see modern concrete in which does not match. I do not think the use of bluestone in a historic setting is inappropriate. The historic portion of this walk is the curbing on either side which gives it definition. If we are concerned about aesthetics the bluestone is more appropriate in the walkway than new concrete.

Leslie Mechem stated she agrees with Steve. If the sidewalk needs to be replaced new concrete would not look appropriate. The use of large bluestone would be a reasonable option.

Cynthia Corbett stated she feels we should adhere to our guidelines repair rather than replace or replace in kind. She also feels the steps to the street should be retained as is.

Leslie Mechem questioned if the Commission would be amenable to a site visit.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated there are two schools of thought concerning this application on the Commission. The Chair reviewed what the Commission has stated this evening. Also, the Chair questioned if the applicant will be agreeable to a site visit. Staff will schedule a site visit and we will table this application for two weeks following the site visit.

**2. 20190427 STEWART'S SHOP EXTERIOR, 8 Circular Street, Architectural Review of exterior modifications to an existing structure within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.**

Applicant: Stewart Shop's

Agent: Chuck Marshall, Stewart Shops

Mr. Marshall stated the applicant is proposing to recover 3 sides of this building that was previously painted. This application was approved 3 years ago by this Board and the renovations were never completed. This would be the same finish as on the West Avenue and Washington Street Stewart's building. On the west, north and east elevation we will replace the brick with Hardie board. A stone veneer will be placed on the lower portion, with Azak trim around the windows. Three windows will be filled in with the Hardie board siding. The rear of the building will remain painted a beige color the same as the building on West Avenue.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this will be a nice upgrade.

Cynthia Corbett questioned the trim detail around the windows.

Mr. Marshall stated the trim will be 5" in width.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding windows, placement of the veneer. Additional details and photographs were requested. It was the consensus of the Commission to table the application for two weeks and the Commission will make a site visit.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned if there was any example in the area where this has been done.

Mr. Marshall stated any conveniently located Stewart shops in the area. Details will be provided.

**3. 20190433 CITY HALL RENOVATIONS, 474 Broadway, Historic Review of renovations to an existing structure Within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.**

Applicant: City Hall, City of Saratoga Springs

Agent: Skip Scirocco, DPW

Mr. Scirocco thanked the DRC and the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. We expect to receive more input from the Commission and the Preservation Foundation. Mr. Scirocco provided a visual presentation on the history of City Hall. In August of 2018 a lightning strike resulted in a small fire on the south side of the building, displacing all the offices and personnel. This project is an effort to undertake 50 years of renovation to City Hall as well as take it into the future. We are currently abating as much asbestos as possible throughout the building so the contractors can begin their work. Mr. Scirocco introduced the team working on the reconstruction, the Mayor, Deputies, Staff, Michael Veitch, Business Manager the DPW and Deborah LaBreche, Assist City Engineer along with the two architectural firms working on the project, Clark, Patterson and Lee and Mesick, Cohen, Wilson and Baker.

Mr. John Hall, of Clark, Patterson and Lee introduced the design team, Susan Clark, Interior Design Team; Justin Hoin, Architectural team, Ashley Hallenbeck, Interior Design Team. Our goal is to take the big public spaces and make them consistent throughout. The building needs to transform from an 1870 building to a 2020 building, including heating, air conditioning, and accessibility to the building, rest rooms and offices. Alarm systems, sprinkler systems and all safety concerns are being addressed at this time as well. We are proposing the use of durable materials. Mr. Hall stated the exterior of the building is not being addressed at this time with the exception of condensing units on the roof. These units are 6 feet in height. This will be hidden by a green metal screening.

Ms. Susan Clark, Interior Design Team stated their goal is to maintain as much of the existing character and details of the building, replacing in kind where possible or mimic what was there originally. This includes light fixtures, tin ceilings, stairs, columns, and wall panels. The mural in the City Council chamber will remain. Trim and windows throughout will remain in place. Ms. Clarke provided a visual of the project beginning with the first floor. All trim moldings, panel moldings and wood details have been documented and categorized for replacement in kind. We are proposing a similar checkered flooring on the diagonal as was existing, except this will be vinyl flooring. Samples of all proposed materials were provided for the Commission's review. A new vestibule is proposed for the entranceway with a better wind break and circulation. There will be two doors on each side rather than centrally located. Full height glass with the City seal above. A visual of the proposed first floor hallway was provided noting the original lighting fixtures which will be re-lamped with LED lighting as well as a lower ceiling height for HVAC heating and cooling equipment venting. All of the doors that are existing and original with a transom above will remain. They will be cleaned and freshened and replaced. The wooden panels will be replaced following asbestos removal. A new elevator will be installed off the main corridor so the entire building will be accessible. A full set of building details is available for review by the Commission. The original architect of the building wrote a book which we have used as a reference tool. The mezzanine over the Engineers space will remain. It is all intact and it will remain, we will just install new lighting. All lighting was reviewed for the Commission. All the bathrooms will be accessible with new fixtures and will be modernized, classic and period like.

Mr. Mark Dahl, Mesick, Cohen, Wilson, Baker Architects and we were hired back in 2016 to perform a feasibility study on the Finance Department. We worked with staff and collected information on the function of that department. We also evaluated the historic fabric of the building and presented several design options to them. An overall theme was selected and this was interrupted by the lightening strike in the building which activitated the sprinklers and did much more damage to the building than the fire itself. We were asked to take our project and plug that into CPL's overall building renovation. Mr. Dahl provided a visual presentation of their project. We found an original window which was buried under layers of construction. Our plan is to remove the brick repair the arched opening and replace the window in situ. On the outside of the building on

the northwest corner there are three windows which are proposed to be replaced. These will be replaced with 3 modern Marvin Windows of the same configuration which currently exists. These windows are approximately 25 years old and are in disrepair. Original trim will be repaired and/or replaced. The pressed metal ceilings were found throughout the spaces and we recommend they be saved and repaired. We are also dealing with the asbestos abatement. Unfortunately when the finance department was tested it was found in the plaster and flooring and subflooring as well as sealants around the windows. All woodworks will be recreated where necessary as well as several doors in the finance department. An old elevator cab was located in this area and it will be relocated in the building and preserved. Room dividers will be restored and reinstalled. Carpeting and lighting fixture samples were provided for the Commission. Color schemes have not yet been decided. Brass fixtures will be used in this area as well as some gas wall sconces since the piping for this type of lighting was located in the ceiling.

Ms. Clark stated the public spaces on the second floor will have the same feel as the first floor. More pipes and conduit are present and need to be concealed. Tin ceilings will be maintained. All woodwork will remain intact. The scope of work in the courtroom is to repair and replace the ceiling from the water damage. The flooring and paneling will be replaced with the same type of flooring as the first floor and woodwork will be repaired and replaced with what existed in this area. A visual presentation of the second floor was provided to the Commission. An image of the new hearing room was provided for the Commission's review.

Ms. Clark reviewed the third floor. The law library mezzanine area will remain all on the same level and be more a more functional work area. The music hall was destroyed. There was not much to maintain except for the windows and the trim. All base moldings and panelized moldings were documented and some details were found in the attic in the music hall. A visual presentation was provided to the Commission keeping the area simple but adding some additional details or formality of the space. Acoustics will be improved in this area. Stage lighting will be improved and replaced. Windows treatments will be replaced. Modern amenities with acoustical improvements. Coving around the music hall will be replaced in kind. The lobby for the music hall will be improved and upgraded. New flooring for the music hall was proposed. The old medallions were found and usage is proposed in the flooring.

Ms. Clark stated the existing lobby off Lake Avenue will remain intact. New flooring to match the first floor lobby. The stairs and doors will remain as presented. Tin ceiling throughout this space will remain.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman thanked the architects and stated it is clear the amount of time and thought that has gone into the renovations of City Hall while maintaining the historical accuracy. Kudos to the team and your commitment to that is clear. This is an exciting project and we appreciate the open dialog and working with the team to make sure this is everything we hope it will be. Several comments before the remainder of the Commission's thoughts. The HVAC equipment on the roof screening may present better as painted black. Another comment concerning the vestibule entrance to City Hall. If there is any chance the vestibule may be interfering with the site line upon entering the grand hallway. The City symbol above the transom is great. I am not sure how the new entry configuration will work.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated she believes it is beautiful. One thing which stands out to her and what she would like to see preserved is the tin ceilings wherever possible. Also, the vestibule in the lobby and an air block is a great idea. Perhaps we can look at that in a different way, not comfortable with the new rotation.

Chris Bennett stated the group has done a great job. Materials are solid and great and very well thought out. He agrees with Karen concerning the tin ceilings. There will be a new way of thinking in our society. People may wish to ride their bikes to work and perhaps we need to think forward with showers, etc.

Leslie DiCarlo stated she believes the HVAC equipment is important. As much as the ceilings can be high wherever is important. She feels the vestibule opening should remain as original.

Cynthia Corbett stated kudos for doing such a great job with the documentation of all the historic materials. Regarding the music hall she feels some of the design elements should be pulled from the materials which were there to bring the decoration desired with a spirit of the old music hall.

Leslie Mechem spoke regarding the music hall and the use of the old medallions. Also she agrees with the Commission concerning the vestibule opening.

Steven Rowland, Alternate stated the work and documentation performed is admirable. He agrees the use of the music hall medallions would be ideal. He is not sure where. One question is has there been any thought as to what will be on the walls. There should be some thought concerning the flyers and banners and notices which are tacked up on the walls. It looks like a mess. Perhaps some type of cases on the wall with glass fronts which prevents access by anyone.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned if the gold leaf will be maintained on the frosted glass doors.

Mr. Scirocco stated this will be maintained.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the consensus of the Commission is that we are all incredibly impressed. Our concern is the vestibule and how it presents. Also the music hall and some additional thoughts in this area.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated a letter was submitted by the Foundation noting all the positive renovations. We are appreciative with the dialog we have had along with the information provided. We also have concerns about the vestibule and the new circulation. Concerns were voiced regarding materials and color choices. Also, concerning the music hall should remain simple. The floor did not have a huge pattern but a simple border or parquet. No applied moldings were applied to the walls. Simple and consistent with what the music hall was.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated she would like to move the application forward with the exception of the vestibule and some of the details in the music hall. Hopefully the applicant could return before us with those additional details.

Mr. Scirocco stated we plan on doing this in a two phase project. We will be glad to return with some details on the vestibule. The music hall will be put on hold. The major concern is the basement and first floor renovation so the offices can return to City Hall. In the spring the second floor will be renovated and then the music hall. We would like to keep this process moving forward.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion to in the matter of City Hall Renovations, 474 Broadway, that the application be approved as submitted this evening with the following conditions – the applicant will return with additional design details for the vestibule and music hall. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

- 4. FLAT ROCK CENTRE PARKING STRUCTURE**, Maple, Lake & High Rock Avenues, Discussion on input to the City Council for proposed parking structure within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is simply input from the Commission on the Flat Rock Centre Parking Structure. This is a procedural process and this will be forwarded to City Council. A draft was previously circulated. Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion to approve the recently circulated recommendations and forward them to the City Council. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion with a suggestion on the first bulleted point noting a change to – The DRC recommend consideration for a more contributing prominent downtown location, as opposed to a stand-alone parking structure. This could be accomplished by providing an active commercial use on the first floor level.

The Commission members were in agreement with the change.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

**UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:**

Design Review Commission Caravan, Tuesday, May 28, 2019 at 5:00 P.M.

Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, June 5, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

**MOTION TO ADJOURN:**

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:15 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski  
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 6-5-19